

(Re)Imagining the Responsible, National Citizen: Analysis of Moroccan Citizenship Education Textbooks

Hajar Idrissi¹

Sidi Mohamed Ben Abdellah University, Morocco, The George Washington University, United States

Youssef Benabderrazik²

Sidi Mohamed Ben Abdellah University, Morocco

Introduction

General Context

Recently, the concept of citizenship has become central in contemporary policy and social practice. Traditionally, citizenship was only linked to the political debate of a country (Isin & Turner, 2002); but over past decades, the concept has been broadened to be linked not only to the nation state but also extended to the regional and global world (Veugelers, 2011). This deepening of the concept of citizenship has also penetrated to the social and cultural domain of living together. Human beings are social beings that need each other, and have some responsibility not only for themselves but also for other people and for society. It is not only about a recognition of humanity (Nussbaum, 1997), but also about building communities and social cohesion in society (Putnam, 2000), about living together in a culturally diverse world (Banks, 2007; 2017), and about taking responsibility for a global world (Appiah, 2010). Accordingly, this requires attention for equality, empathy, tolerance, solidarity, care, respect, democracy, and so on. This means that citizenship education is becoming very relevant not in the form of abstract moral values but as values embedded in social, cultural and political practices. Then, the features of the good citizen take a new shape, driven by the need to equip both the individual and the society with the adequate values, skills and competencies deemed necessary for more active citizenship.

Different academic perspectives have entered the field of citizenship education. Presenting a short 'genealogy' of this academic sub-discipline will help us understand what concepts researchers are introducing into the field. As a curricular subject, citizenship education has taken several different forms depending on how the states envisaged their citizens to be. Historically speaking, citizenship education in the West is often framed as originating from ancient Greece and Rome, where they prioritized values of loyalty and patriotism (Heater, 2004). Later with the decline of these societies, citizenship as social initiation (Case & Clark, 1999) was predominant in the early days of public education, which focused on the socializing role of schooling instead of political education. With the French Revolution, Rousseau and other philosophers emphasized the role of schools in teaching



TO CITE THIS ARTICLE PLEASE INCLUDE ALL OF THE FOLLOWING DETAILS:

Idrissi, Hajar; Benabderrazik, Youssef. (2020). (Re)imagining the responsible, national citizen: Analysis of Moroccan citizenship education textbooks, *Transnational Curriculum Inquiry* 17 (1) p. 31-48

<http://nitinat.library.ubc.ca/ojs/index.php/tci> <access date>

values that would be beneficial to society. Since the 19th century, new concepts of citizenship education emerged with the development of new doctrines of liberal democracy, nationalism and socialism. It has been described (Heater, 1990) that these ideologies were restrained by the interest of the nation states to maintain control over school systems and establish order. Within this framework, teachers were prevented from transmitting political knowledge and values that would threaten the current status quo and urged schools to instill a sense of belonging and national collective identity, especially through the social studies course, with its component (history, geography, citizenship) (Heater, 1990; Phillips, 1998). These subjects were and still considered important tools for strengthening the sense of a common national identity, patriotism, and loyalty among citizens (Green, 1990).

In the post war period, Marshall (1964) shaped the modern academic thinking about political systems, rights and duties. Also, influenced by World War I and II and fueled by minorities demanding equal rights and inclusion, citizenship education has been shaped by human rights discourse, based on the Universal Declaration of Human Rights (Tibbitts & Fernekes, 2011). Human rights education (HRE) teaches students about many of the concepts needed to be an empathetic and socially just member of a pluralistic society; these key civically minded concepts include social justice, tolerance, solidarity, participation, equality, and human dignity (Osanloo, 2009). This critical aspect of HRE could empower learners to recognize social justice and develop a more reflective relationship towards their nation-states, to become advocates of injustices and engage actively in demands for social justice (Osler & Starkey, 2005). Whereas traditional national citizenship education focuses on the promotion of a common national identity, HRE is universal in nature and includes the diversity of national, religious and cultural identifications of individuals.

Philosophers, for example McLaughlin (1992), Nussbaum (1997) and Crick (1999) questioned the meaning of citizenship in relation to democracy and participation and how education can or cannot contribute to citizenship development. In the modern time, no one can deny that globalisation points overwhelmingly to the problems of increasing instability, continuing warfare, and growing inequality. All these factors have political implications and can be seen to pose a challenge for social democracy. Growing economic interconnectedness is undeniable and challenges for education in terms of understanding who we are, developing global perspectives and insights into how we can manage becomes a reality to face. During the latter part of the twentieth century, and at the beginning of the twenty-first, citizens are urged to 'think globally and to act locally'. At both national and international levels, international organizations, educational researchers, and policymakers regularly expound the need to integrate global competencies into curriculum as crucial to providing students with the tools needed to live and work in an increasingly complex world. These skills are recognised in the new United Nations 2030 agenda for Sustainable Development, in which the international community is advancing education and global citizenship as essential to the success of all 17 of its global goals. In addition, the concern for sustainability and environmental ecology has also become part of citizenship: the citizen and his surrounding should become not only democratic but also sustainable (Gaudelli, 2016).

All these articulations of specific concepts and research methods clearly show that citizenship education can be conceived in different ways. These differences become even more pronounced when we focus on educational policy and practice. An interesting question: considering school textbooks as important means or instruments for transmitting knowledge and values to the young generation and, thus, for reproduction or transformation of the social order, in what ways does citizenship education textbook frame the nation's deeper and hidden trajectory for citizen formation? We may think of a school textbook as discourse, that is, "a thematically and ideologically structured, self-referring progression of communications

(messages, texts) circulating within a definable community of communicators and receivers over a specified period of time” (Biocca, 1991, p.45). A textbook’s discourse is the outcome of an interplay between several factors, of which the curriculum, the economy, the collective mentality of a society, and the authors’ own intentions and viewpoints are probably most important (Anyon, 1979; Grueneberg, 1991). Therefore, every textbook, as a discourse, is a part of the order of discourse (the totality of discursive practices within the educational institution or the society and the relationships between them) (Fairclough, 1992, p.43)

School textbooks are taken to be important socialisers within the system of education. The assumption about the influence of textbooks’ content on their readers’ cognitive and behavioral skills underlies a big part of a basic thrust in textbook studies- textual research. The role of citizenship education curricula and textbooks is to prepare pupils for participation in a civic society, to teach them the principles of critical citizenship and to set models for active civic and political participation. This means that instead of a detailed coverage of particular topics such as ‘the state, the government, the law’, etc., the emphasis of citizenship education should be on teaching skills needed for intelligent choice making, problem solving, and critical thinking; to stand up for their rights and engage in various forms of civic and political action (Nelson, 2001; Stanley, 2001). Accordingly, the theoretical assumptions about the influence of citizenship education textbooks might be conceptualised along a continuum, which ranges from minimal (thin, narrow, content led, knowledge based) to maximal (thick, process led, inclusive, participative) interpretations (McLaughlin, 1992). In this respect, the results of previous research on citizenship education textbooks are not very favorable (Anyon, 1979; Wade & Everett, 1994).

The aim of this paper is to investigate citizenship education of primary school social studies curriculum in Morocco. The analysis of textbook discourse comprises two methods. First, we used content analysis to explore the extent to which particular civic issues and values are prioritised or excluded, the extent to which scales of active participation (social and political) are presented or hidden, and the extent to which national, global/cosmopolitan social identities are promoted. In addition, we used qualitative text analysis to explore the general ideology of the textbooks. We present our analysis focused on three interrelated themes: Human rights; democracy and civic participation; and national and global citizenship.

Education in the 21st Century

The rapid changes we are experiencing at the global, regional, national, and local levels are associated with increasing mechanization, information generation and exchange (Anderson & Markers, 2012; Schmidt & Cohen, 2013; Schleiche, 2012). Although many of these identify positive advancement, many also identify concerns about human development and citizen formation. Education has become the main tool providing individuals with the knowledge, skills, and competencies needed by the society but educational provisions are not yet translated into full-scale implementation at the school and classroom levels and thus, lag behind the emergence of need. What knowledge, skills, and competencies are society demanding of citizens today? Although there are differences across national values, cultures, and socio-economic character, there is a common drive towards a global approach for education with competencies beyond the knowledge accumulation that was highly valued in 20th century education. There has been a major shift in educational learning goals, as seen most recently by goal 4.7 in the 2030 Agenda for sustainable development, that concern the recognition of the need for education systems to equip learners with competencies: “by 2030 ensure all learners acquire knowledge and skills needed to promote sustainable development, including among others through education for sustainable development and sustainable lifestyles, human rights, gender equality, promotion of a culture of peace and non-violence,



global citizenship, and appreciation of cultural diversity and of culture's contribution to sustainable development" (UNESCO, 2015). These competencies, combined with the attitudes, values, and ethics of their societies have now become explicit aspirations of the formal education sector.

Focus on skills-based approaches was initiated in the mid-90s by the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) under the leadership of Jacques Delors (Delors, 1996). Then, the Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD) developed a project on Definition and Selection of Key Competencies (DeSeCo) (OECD, 2005), which defined the key competencies that are required by all citizens for a successful life and for a well-functioning society (Rychen & Salganik, 2003). The definitions related to twenty-first century skills are changing and interpreted in many ways, depending on the organisation that is pushing for the specific reform. Partnership for 21st Century Learning (2015, p.21) refers to '21st century skills' which most often include communication, critical thinking, teamwork and creativity. The Official Journal of the European Union (OJEU) (2018, p.7-8) focuses on eight key competencies including: "(1) Literacy competence; (2) Multilingual competence; (3) Mathematical competence and competence in science, technology and engineering; (4) Digital competence; (5) Personal, social and learning to learn competence; (6) Citizenship competence; (7) Entrepreneurship competence and (8) Cultural awareness and expression competence". Generic skills have also been emphasised in education systems with a view to improving the quality of teaching and learning (Fadel et al., 2015). Recently, UNESCO has referred to these skills as 'transversal competencies', which in turn include skills such as global citizenship, innovative and critical thinking, interpersonal skills, intrapersonal skills and media and information literacy (Care & Luo, 2016). Overall, critical thinking appears across a number of perspectives. On the one hand, 'policy critical thinking' (a specific type in transnational policy contexts) is associated with generic abilities which can be applied to a wide range work and life contexts such as creativity, entrepreneurship, resourcefulness, application skills, reflective skills and reasoned decision making (Deng & Luke, 2008; Lim, 2015; OECD, 2005). On the other hand, 'civic critical thinking' is related to a broader quest for the virtuous citizen and the good society, focusing on consideration of equity, equality, social justice, empathy and care. This type analyzes patterns of power relations and unfairness hiding in everyday social practices and looking for alternative ways for tackling social problems such as diversity, discrimination, race and ethnicity (Parker, 2003).

Despite this recognition, a global mobilisation of efforts to respond to the 21st century skills shift is non-existent, and many countries struggle alone to plan the shift. While this shift in policies is important, many countries have yet to implement these policies, and are still using 20th century teaching methods and assessments (Care et al., 2018). This is holding back progress on learning for millions of children around the world. In countries experiencing transitions in government regimes, as recently in the Middle East and North Africa with the Arab Spring, education is deemed important to first and foremost reinforce democratic values and participation embodied in a progressive citizenship education. This policy shift suggests a (re)imagination of the traditional, national and patriotic student who is blindly prescribed to unquestion versions of truth and show pride and sense of belonging (Westheimer, 2009). Despite many educational reforms that have been undertaken recently, the general objectives for citizenship education in Egypt and Jordan, for instance, still prioritises Islamic and Arab values (Faour, 2013a), while Bahrain focuses on patriotic duties towards the regime and stresses the national dimension of their citizens' national identity (Faour, 2013a). On the other hand, Tunisia's curriculum promotes a discourse of rights and responsibilities as well as tolerance and respect for differences among people (Faour, 2013b). Morocco makes it an



interesting case for investigation as it allocates up to 25% of its annual budget to education compared to the 13% average among developed nations. Regardless of this massive funding, the education system lags behind in global education rankings (UNDP, 2007; World Bank, 2008) and struggles to adequately prepare its students for the professional and civic world. Is there a lack of a political will? We assume that identifying a curricular approach provides a useful scale for determining where each country broadly stands in its definition and approach to citizenship education and what are their hidden agendas for citizen formation.

Citizenship Education in Morocco

It is commonly asserted that citizenship education in Morocco is narrowly knowledge-based (Faour, 2013a; El Ouazzani et al., 2010). That knowledge-based approach derives from longstanding traditions in Moroccan education but also is in part a result of more recent changes. The National Charter for Education and Training Reform or the decade of education 2000-2009, has been considered the most important education reform launched since Moroccan independence, placing “learners in general and children in particular, at the core of the reflective and pedagogical action. From this perspective, the charter has to offer to the children of Morocco the conditions that are necessary for their development and accomplishment” (The National Education and Training Charter, 2000). It was clear from the instructions given and the composition of the charter that the new roadmap would be based on the country’s official religion, Islam, which was to be reinforced and reflected in the new educational system. According to this reform, the education sector is considered to be a central mechanism for installing love of country, civic engagement and Islamic values and also promoting global citizenship through the study of foreign languages, science and technology, human rights and sustainable development.

One of the fundamental objectives of this reform is to provide a generalised, quality education to all children and young people of Morocco, in preschool, from age 4 to 6, and in primary and secondary school, from 6 to 15. It also aimed mainly at enhancing the country’s economic and social development, a challenge which previous reforms have not been able to meet. To achieve these objectives, the charter established six priority work areas, which would constitute the operational bases for any decision or action taken towards educational reform: Expanding access to education through establishing partnerships, building schools and addressing girls’ education in order to ensure that rural areas would not be excluded from this program specially that it is there where illiteracy is most acute; linking education to its economic specificity and environment; revisiting the pedagogical organisation to a more student-oriented educational system; raising, in format and content, the quality of education and training; reinforcing the existing human resources; restructuring educational management, and mobilising partners and funding.

Perhaps, of the most apparent changes brought about by the reform is the reconfiguration of the citizenship education course with the results partially in place until today. As a matter of fact, the compulsory system of primary education in Morocco includes a discipline course called ‘Ijtimaiaat’ or social studies. There is no specific citizenship education subject. Instead, Morocco adopts an integrated approach in which Education for Citizenship (subject title) is integrated within the social studies course and taught from grade four in primary school to grade ten of high school. In terms of the time allocated for instruction, Morocco allocates up to one-hour per/week, taught in alternation between the other two subject components namely history and geography. Though the school curriculum in Morocco does not include citizenship education as a formal subject, there are opportunities for citizenship education to be included in all phases (elementary school, junior high school, and high school). In some subjects such as Arabic, Islamic studies, life and earth science studies

as well as in extracurricular activities and classes without examinations, there is an explicit treatment of citizenship and teachers have the possibility to promote relevant work.

There is a need to research the nature of textbooks that relate to citizenship education for primary school students as relatively little work has been done on this topic. Some of that limited work (Sanae, 2016) explores how a school subject such as ‘?asha?n ?almahali’ (the Local Affaire) could be effective in developing the students’ civic knowledge. The findings reveal that most of the surveyed teachers qualify the content of this subject as appropriate to the students’ cognitive development and provides students with adequate opportunities to enrich their civic knowledge. Unfortunately, this school subject was dropped out from the school curriculum in 2006.

For this study, we will investigate citizenship education of primary school social studies curriculum in Morocco. In fact, the Ministry of Education promotes several versions of a textbook that are distributed across the regions. However, the books do not vary significantly; they all use the same approach and content, with only some differences in quality of stories and images to make it context and local specific. In addition, schools do not have autonomy to choose textbooks because there is a requirement that all publishers receive an equal market share. Currently, the Ministry of Education permitted only two textbooks on social studies and Education for Citizenship for 4th and 5th grade and three textbooks for 6th grade. We have chosen three social studies textbooks of 4th, 5th, and 6th grades. Certainly, the textbooks analysed cannot be regarded as the representative ones. However, some experts in the field (teachers and inspectors), the reputation of the publishing house and the amount of the print run, places the textbooks analysed in a good position on the textbook market.

Research Method

This article focuses on citizenship education of primary school social studies curriculum in Morocco and examines citizenship conceptions from the 4th, 5th, and 6th grade textbooks (ages 9-12). The selection of materials is based on the fact that students are exposed for the first time to explicit citizenship issues beyond their home province and that certain habits, practices, a set of skills and a way of life are nurtured from an early childhood age.

Findings in the study are based on qualitative content analysis (Hsieh HF, Shannon, 2005) of the official textbooks used in Morocco’s education for citizenship curriculum. The classification of social studies by Barr et al (1977), and extended by Martorella (1996) as well as the typologies of citizen formation by Westheimer and Kahne (2004) will be used as conceptual frames to guide our analysis. Barr et al (1977) have grouped the various epistemological positions within social studies curriculum and teaching into three themes namely citizenship or cultural transmission; social sciences and reflective inquiry or critical thinking. First of all, social studies as citizenship transmission consists of transmitting factual and procedural knowledge, nationalistic values and beliefs with a restricted range of cognitive skills, developing a personally responsible citizen (Westheimer & Kahne, 2004). The second tradition characterizes social studies as social sciences, which aims to develop future citizens who learn the inquiry techniques of the social sciences, have the ability to see and solve social problems and build personality using the visions and methods of the social scientist.

Third, the purpose of social studies as reflective inquiry is to nurture students to make reasoned decisions and follow a scientific inquiry to identify the problem, collect, evaluate and analyse data and then make decisions. This tradition involves helping students develop a participatory citizenship and assume leadership and active roles within the community (Westheimer & Kahne, 2004). A fourth tradition has been extended by Martorella (1996) in which social studies is framed as informed social criticism. It is a form of citizenship that teaches students how to have agency, to act for social change through critical thinking, service



learning (Billig, 2010) and project-based learning with a civic engagement component (Whitlock & Fox, 2014). This tradition emphasises preparing a justice oriented citizen that “calls explicit attention to matters of injustice and to the importance of pursuing social justice goals” (Westheimer & Kahne, 2004).

Descriptive and critical data analysis techniques are used to analyse the selected textbooks page by page, with a focus on the main body of written text, images, and activities. We draw on the analytical techniques established by Faas (2011) and Engel (2014) to first describe the introductions of the textbook of each grade, examine the ways in which the main points of the introductions were reflected in the individual units, sorting them into categories. Then, the relationship among categories was identified to establish emerging themes. We pay considerable attention to the construction and framing of discourses concerning the representation of the Moroccan citizen, as well as what civic issues and values are prioritised and excluded (Crismore, 1989).

Following this framework, the intent of this article is to explore the key themes of Morocco’s primary school citizenship education textbooks, including human rights; democracy and civic participation; and national and global citizenship. Within these themes, this article asks broader questions about how is citizen formation shaped at the primary level and how is the Moroccan citizen represented in the textbooks? Specifically, we ask: What is the approach being adopted by the state to inculcate citizenship in its students? Is it in favor of a nationalist approach or more globalised one? Do the textbooks cultivate the skills of the 21st century?

Findings

In what follows, we provide a brief description of the textbooks content and focus on the ways in which each of the three textbooks take up themes related to human rights, democracy and civic participation, and national and global citizenship.

Textbook Content

Explicitly through text, images and activities, the textbooks emphasise knowledge and understanding of issues pertaining to patriotism and regulation of relations in different contexts, namely in the family through highlighting certain gender issues, at school through explaining the student/teacher/team work relations that must be based on mutual respect, and in the community environment through exemplifying neighborhood relations and social roles. All these aim to build students’ awareness of differences and to promote the right to equality among both people and groups. The textbooks also stress a discourse of rights, duties and responsibilities, specifying tasks, rules, obligations, attitudes, behaviours and basic child rights characterised by respect and care. A participatory approach is also prominent in the textbooks with information about existing participatory bodies as the parliament, municipality, civil society, international organisations and encouragement to part-take in community-based projects and decision-making both within and outside the school environment such as painting and planting the school and voting in elections. All these expected cognitive learning experiences imply the development of certain skills related to scientific research as to raise a scientific citizen, who can use scientific methods and technology, for instance making comparison, preparing a report about hobbies, national and international celebrations, the role of arbitrator in sport matches, traffic signs related to child protection using proofs to justify. The selected social studies textbooks introduce the Education for Citizenship subject component with a preamble that includes the aims and objectives to be achieved, the competencies to be acquired and individual units of the curriculum.

Table 1. Textbooks Contents

Textbooks	Aims/Objectives	Competencies
4 th grade	Learning about individual rights, obligations, and common good.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Enhancing personality; - Acquiring the values of good citizenship; - Active participation.
5 th grade	Sensitising students about rights and obligations.	<p>Knowledge Consolidating the understanding of some concepts as Rights/ Duties/ Responsibilities/Diversity; knowing some International conventions related to child's rights; knowing local, national and international institutions and civil society organisations as the school council/ municipality/ Child Parliament/ the United Nations/UNICEF.</p> <p>Skills Observing documents; extracting data and drawing conclusion; explaining and interpreting; data classification; analysing, justifying, reasoning and arguing; comparing and understanding relationships; making choices and decisions; research capability; debating and organising a debate; active listening; communication; doing an interview; doing field work; working with others; case studies; preparing a project and presenting a report; following through.</p>
6 th grade	Understanding the major component of the UNCRC.	<p>Attitudes Building a sense of identity; self-confidence; valuing others and respecting their opinions; cultural appreciation; valuing the role of local, national and international institutions and organisations; openness to involvement and participation to influence and develop the community; responsibility to protect the self and others; awareness of the importance of international conventions in protecting the child's rights.</p>

Drawing in tandem the different approaches to social studies and citizenship education described in the framework, we considered the above aims and outcomes to answer the extent to which do human rights feature in the textbooks and what are the important omissions and missing opportunities for civic skills and values.

Human Rights Education

Rights and Responsibilities

Human rights education entails education about children rights rather than a broader conception of human rights. In the 4th grade textbook, human rights are understood as needs that must be addressed and which are guaranteed by international charters as the Universal Declaration of the Rights of the Child in 1959 and the Convention on the Rights of the Child that Morocco ratified in 1993. There is a direct mention of Morocco's ratification of the convention in 1993 twice in the textbooks of 4th and 6th grade, in reference to the country's commitment to the values and humanitarian concepts that respect children. In the 5th grade textbook, human rights are addressed in terms of rights associated with fulfilled duties in the context of the family, school, and road safety. There were only two occurrences of the word 'human rights' in the 6th grade textbook with reference to the Universal Declaration of Human Rights but no paragraph or extended text is dedicated to explaining human rights as a basic component of citizenship and which is bounded by a constitutional framework. In the 6th grade textbook, the framework used to structure human rights discussion remains that of the Convention on the Rights of the Child (1989), interpreting ten basic children rights that guarantee students' lives and existence.

The aspects of universal child rights that are mentioned in the textbooks of 4th, 5th and 6th grades are as follows: The child's right to have access to the highest attainable standard of health care to protect his/her physical and mental abilities, in particular by ensuring access to good nutrition; the child's right to an atmosphere of happiness, love and understanding within the family environment and society; rights of children with disabilities, child's right to free education, be equally treated, express freely his/her opinion and not be



maltreated inside the classroom; child's right to be registered after birth and have a name and citizenship or nationality; the right to life and child's right to be protected from exploitation of all forms and from performing any work which is likely to be harmful. Moreover, child rights are further supported with the use of an Islamic Religious Hadith in the 4th grade textbook stating that "the parents should give their children good upbringing and teach them writing, swimming and archery". In addition, other social dimensions of child rights are mentioned in the 5th grade textbook, namely the right to use public space; the road has to be equipped with traffic signals; the footpath crossing designed for pedestrians has to be clearly drawn.

Similarly, human rights education teaches students not only about their rights, but also their responsibilities. For example, in the 5th grade textbook, the right of road safety carries with it the child's responsibilities to respect and obey the traffic code system, police officer's regulations and walk on the sidewalk. The right to schooling and free expression in the classroom carries with it responsibilities to work hard, actively participate in extracurricular activities, not damage school furniture and equipment and respect the teacher and pay attention to him/her while teaching. The human rights model presented centers on a rule-based approach that covers the importance of knowing how to interpret and obey instructions indicating what is right and what is wrong along a distribution of tasks where everybody should cooperate. Consequently, it develops a responsible citizen kind.

Patriotism

The textbooks associated some examples of human rights teaching with values of patriotism, loyalty and sense of belonging. For example, emphasising the right to an identity, name, and citizenship are intrinsically linked to instill nationalism and patriotism from a legal perspective. Some foci of attention in the 6th grade textbook include images of national identification card, passport and a national festive celebration where the street is decorated with Moroccan flags; texts that ask the student to learn the national anthem, the history of the Moroccan flag, and information about who is eligible for being granted a Moroccan citizenship or nationality. This version of hegemonic national practices maintains the state's ideology for indoctrination and blindness towards the nation's most pressing challenges and how to overcome them.

Gender Equality/ Social Justice

Some emphasis on issues related to discrimination and gender equality are examples of awareness raising in dealing with universal human rights and social justice. To start with, discrimination is dealt with from a gender inequality perspective in the household and education in rural areas. The 6th grade textbook promotes awareness of gender discrimination as a type of discrimination that stems from the social differences that exist between boys and girls, leading to unjust treatment by considering one superior to another. Texts and pictures portrayed instances of girls' victimisation and showed them as rural girls wishing to go to school or as a sister in the kitchen washing dishes, needle felting the brother's clothes or beaten by the brother, while the brother is sitting in front of the TV and ordering her to get him the remote control and clean his bicycle. However, some limitations in addressing this issue are manifested. Gender equality as an independent issue or unit is almost invisible in the textbooks and only mentioned implicitly in the few quotes from the Convention on the Right of the Child and The Universal Declaration on Human Rights around equality of individuals regardless of their religion, race, gender and skin. Also, the textbook ignores discrimination in the workplace, media, politics and other settings, and does not provide any definition of gender issues or discussions of their manifestations and causes.

The textbooks addressed some of the social, family and cultural stereotyping associated with women's role in these domains. As a way of illustration, gender equality in the family setting is higher than those that showed inequalities. The text and pictures portrayed women sharing the same responsibilities as men and performing equal roles within the family, namely both mother and father carrying groceries together or cooking in the kitchen together and taking care and talking to their children together. Regarding social roles, gender was almost equally treated. Pictures showed women and girls participating in various activities such as environmental events and doing voluntary work; performing different jobs namely, female police officer, doctor, teacher and lawyer. Nevertheless, women were not represented in the political domain except some illustrations in the 5th grade textbook that depict a woman at the voting booth and a student girl running for a campaign as her student boy counterpart to be elected for the school council. Moreover, there was no discussion of any challenges that encounter women in achieving equality in the career domain. Besides, the over representation of women in particular jobs maintains a huge social gender gap. In other words, while in principle women are free to choose their profession, social pressure and preferences tend to direct female students towards certain subjects such as teaching and nursing, which may not reflect the needs of the labor market. This enacts the stereotype that women lack leadership skills to advance for top management and administrative positions.

The textbooks also highlighted issues of social justice. Social justice is defined in terms of child labor and street children in the 6th grade textbook, who instead of attending school are forced to work, denying them their fundamental rights and stunting their mental and physical development. The content in this regard was descriptive and important opportunities to show objectives to eradicate this phenomenon and raise awareness about dropping out of school were missing. Social justice, in terms of having access to material-economic resources as well as the distribution of power at least in rural areas, is ignored.

Teaching Approach

The analysis of the textbooks' core activities, namely, reading, comprehension and assessment related to human rights reveals a predominant didactic approach to teaching these rights based on memorising vocabulary (e.g. what is right, law, Universal Declaration of Human Rights), key dates (e.g. the state opening of parliament by the king, the ratification of the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child) and human rights actors and agencies (e.g. what is an NGO, parliament, United Nation, municipality, UNICEF, UNESCO) rather than an opportunity to critically reflect on the different concepts. The course and units' objectives emphasise knowledge and attitudes, while the skills outlined in the preamble are almost missing. Rights are often mentioned without problematisation and students are not asked to explore what could undermine or prohibit the enactment of certain rights and how are these rights manifested in their lives. The textbooks also included assessment activities related to human rights that encouraged students to conduct some investigations and identify some rights in their local environment. However, the assessments did not ask students to explore obstacles to their implementation through different practices.

Democracy and Civic Participation

Civic participation is a human right and an important tool for children to learn democracy and become democratic citizens. Civic participation in the textbooks is dealt with from two perspectives: in the school context and the local environment. Team building, volunteering, establishment of rules, electing the student council, decision making, freedom of speech and organisation of activities in the school and the local environment (municipality) are common in the 4th and 5th grade textbooks, while knowledge of participatory bodies to



protect children's rights like the parliament, civil society organisations, the United Nations are predominant in the 6th grade textbook.

Teamwork

First of all, the three textbooks have mentioned the idea of participation within a communitarian perspective, where students should actively and effectively engage in the society and environment in which they live. The most commonly highlighted skills regarding participation are teamwork or team building and decision-making. In the 4th grade textbook, teamwork is defined as ‘what a group is planning and organising to accomplish work for the benefit of the individual and the community’. Image and text illustrations for teamwork are given from the school where, a teacher asked students to divide themselves into groups in order to clean, paint and plant the school, and from a countryside where the inhabitants decided to take matters into their own hands and volunteer to repair their local road. However, there were no activities in the textbooks that offered guidelines for teamwork, such as the organisation of round table debate, respecting people’s turns, listening to others carefully, deciding on who is going to speak and avoiding making noises.

Decision-making

This participatory aspect is further enriched by the inclusion of the decision-making dimension, both at school and the local community. Participation in decision-making is considered, in the 6th grade textbook as a “form of freedom of speech that the Convention on the Rights of the Child guarantees under article 12”. The textbook illustrates some forms of free and self-expression, namely election of the school council, discussions within a school cooperative context or child parliament; participation in a play or drawing a caricature; writing poetry or a novel; writing a newspaper article in a school magazine. The 5th grade textbook defined the municipality council as “a public, citizen oriented body, elected to enact local democracy and designed to improve the quality of life and well-being, solve problems and make decisions about issues that affect everyone”. Within this context, a reference to the word democracy is made, providing a definition as “rule by the people”. Nevertheless, the textbooks are silent on ways of accessing the council and becoming a candidate, the position of the various councilors as well as the distribution of functions and the processes of national government through legislative and judiciary and executive powers. Moreover, participation in the textbooks is seen as a combination of rights and obligations to perform a national duty through mainly voting during an electoral process; and therefore more of a passive and a thin concept of citizenship is promoted. Furthermore, there seems to be a rather weak approach to political and civic literacy limited to information about political institutions and participation in local communities (through images and samples) but not on political issues and activities, such as writing petitions and letters to representatives, going on strike, following the national and international media, talking to politicians face-to face or the role of political parties in Morocco.

Institutional Participation (NGOs)

The 5th and 6th grade textbooks deal with institutional participation that is based on democracy like Non-Governmental Organisations. The 6th grade textbook defined civil society as “the various non-governmental organisations and associations that educate citizens about their rights and contribute to their defense. They also raise their awareness of their duties towards their homeland and contribute to solving their problems”. The textbook mentioned some national and international NGOs that mainly deal with the child’s rights protection (UN, UNICEF, WHO, ILO, Bayti Association, Karam Association) the



environment and natural disasters rather than performing active political involvement. Within this framework, NGOs are described as a place to which only good and volunteering people belong, but their potential influence on political decisions is ignored. Some limitations include the textbooks' ignorance of inserting activities to enable students' part-taking in the NGOs activities. We argue that while the acquisition of knowledge can enhance awareness, awareness itself does not necessarily lead to effectiveness for a more participative role in shaping Morocco's future. In this way, the textbooks, though aimed at citizenship education, do not seem to be contributing to political literacy as a dimension of active citizenship education.

National/Global Citizenship

The textbooks focused on national issues more than global issues for students to gain a national identity and perspective. As a matter of fact, a citizen is presented as a person concerned with his/her community and the local level is the primary level at which citizenship develops its affective dimension. However, national identity presented in the textbooks does a little to develop a pluralistic imaginary and understanding of the democratic citizenship. First, textbooks gave little attention to the pluralistic side of the Moroccan societal fabric that consists of different cultural identities, namely Amazigh, Sahraoui, Hassani, and Moroccan Jewish. This contradicts with the Moroccan educational approach developed in the National charter (2000-2009) and White Book (2000), which intended to consolidate Morocco's cultural heritage, identity and diversity.

Second, terms like global citizenship, globalisation or even cosmopolitan are not mentioned and little voice is given to cultural diversity within Morocco. In the 4th and 5th grade textbooks, cultural diversity is framed as a right and conveyed in terms of respecting others. Illustrations portrayed children from diverse nationalities, backgrounds, race and religious identities; from religious institutions (Mosque, Church and Synagogue); and a poster that showed an international children's forum. Also, an assignment asked students to draw a poster under the title "We are the World Children: Different and Equal". In general, the textbooks display the value of co-existence and living together at the national level to maintain harmony among the different components of society, but failed to include a connection to a global community of human beings and to develop a feeling of global citizenship and commitment.

Indeed, global citizenship education and global competence is a recent addition in social studies and there are many different understandings and conceptualisations, which frame its teaching and ideology. In Morocco, learning languages and becoming competent in using ICT are the only requirements for students to be global citizens in the textbooks; representations of the global community include international organisations and conventions on issues of human rights and children rights. Inclusion of important global matters (e.g. global warming) that need to be explored in the textbooks is lacking. Ignoring and marginalising important global skills that promote and facilitate interconnectedness is problematic in a context of growing cultural diversification and labor market globalisation. As such, the global is positioned as foreign and separate from the life of the student, the school, and Morocco.

Discussion and Conclusion

This research focused on an investigation of the extent to which conceptions of human rights, democracy and civic participation and national/global citizenship featured in the school subject 'Education for Citizenship' of social studies in Morocco. We based this research on a sample of 4th, 5th and 6th grade textbooks that social studies teachers and students use in



primary school. For external validity, it is important to note that a school textbook is not the only factor determining what happens in classrooms. This research paper involved only three textbooks and is limited as it excludes teacher's guide, course plan and an analysis of the classroom practice. Thus the results are not generalised for all social studies textbooks. However, this paper provides insights regarding the treatment of important citizenship concepts that are likely to be relevant for other stakeholders interested in integrating them into learning materials and practices. Table 2 summarises the extent to which certain topics are prioritised, excluded and marginalised:

Table 2. Textbooks: 4th, 5th, 6th grades

Prioritised Topics	Excluded Topics	Marginalised Featured Topics
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - A discourse of rights (child's rights); - Responsibilities; - Gender Equality; - Institutions (UN, UNESCO, School); - Teamwork/Volunteering in community Service; - Participation in civil society activities. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Discussion of challenges encountering women achieving equality; - Activities offering guidelines for teamwork; - Ways on accessing politics; - Distribution of function in the government; - Global citizenship; - Global issues (as global warming/ ESD). 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Discrimination (workplace, media, politics); - Social Justice; - Political participation; - Cultural diversity; - Pluralistic Moroccan society.

The analysed textbooks showed a great discrepancy between the objectives and expected outcomes. The textbooks' content focuses primarily on transmitting procedural knowledge and values about human or child rights, rather than socialising students to a set of skills and competencies that reinforce their critical understandings of citizenship issues and active participation in the future. That predominant emphasis on human rights in the textbooks offers little opportunity for students to make connections with current social issues that face today's world especially with the waves of cross-border mobility and the differences of cultures might cause as racism, discrimination, and to understand their place as citizens within a global context. The concept of diversity, a key goal encompassed by global citizenship education is treated from the perspective of respecting races, religious and opinion differences. We were surprised by the limited attention paid to the concept of cultural diversity and pluralism within the Moroccan context or the role of multiculturalism in maintaining cohesion, commitments and identification with the nation state and the global world. There are also research studies arguing that social studies textbooks do not sufficiently deal with multiculturalism, pluralism or minority rights (Jackson, 2014; Montgomery, 2005; Nasser & Nasser, 2008).

Furthermore, from the point of view of democratic citizenship education, responsibility should not be limited to complying with established rules, but also implies concern for others and understanding the consequences and effects of one's and other's actions. Unfortunately, such themes are not included in the textbooks.

The globally open space in which we now live requires a kind of global citizenship learning (Nussbaum, 1997; Rizvi, 2009). Although the important points related to global citizenship education have been mentioned among the curriculum subject priority objectives, addressing aspects of global competency in the 21st century and the role of global citizen as a citizen who is seeking contribution and international mindedness appear ignored and neglected. In addition, the textbooks presented apolitical citizenship education content, free of political events except voting and which does not develop any democratic or political literacy. Moreover, the texts rarely go beyond a mere description of institutions and make no attempt to present these institutions as a context for citizen participation. Research in some countries on social studies textbooks report the same results, where controversial political issues and participation are avoided (Perveen & Awan, 2017; Zafer & Tarhan, 2016). Therefore, the citizenship education in Moroccan schools is taught as citizenship transmission, providing

students with theoretical knowledge about democratic institutions but rarely giving them the chance to connect this knowledge with their everyday lives.

The pedagogy followed in the textbooks in teaching citizenship education also requires attention. Despite the fact that a competency-based approach has been adopted as part of the curriculum objectives, implementing this approach is almost absent from the textbooks, and the writing style is simple and descriptive. Put differently, although the textbooks encourage students to express opinion in the assessments and comment on the pictures and texts, the implementation of behavioural and applied aspects of citizenship is absent, resulting in a reductionist didactic teaching; and unquestioned facts continue to dominate in the textbooks. The result is a representation of a personally responsible Moroccan citizen, who is not given the opportunity to think critically or acquire the necessary skills to face not only global problems, but also complex social, political, economic, and environmental issues facing their local communities.

What Morocco shows us about the passive citizen is not surprising given the lack of transformative pedagogical approaches (Abdi, 2014; UNESCO, 2014), teacher trainings, extracurricular activities and civil society involvement. Some developed countries, like Canada, the UK, the Republic of Korea, Japan, and United States have integrated global citizenship education as an approach across all areas of learning and developed related curricula (Milton, 2015). However, pedagogical and structural challenges persist with implementation. As OECD points out, there is a large gap-perhaps even a chasm- between the evidence on effective learning environments for the 21st century and established practice in today's schools and classrooms (Milton, 2015).

Perhaps, then, this analysis asks us to reconsider the primary spaces used to foster these kinds of 21st century skills. Student's participation in extracurricular activities as a means of developing civic dispositions and achieving academic and professional success has long been noted (McFarland & Thomas, 2006; Zaff et al., 2003). Moreover, fostering teachers' professional development for citizenship education and including topics, materials, and tasks that promote students' involvement in and response to global issues related to intercultural, environmental, identity, and social problems will help cultivating a classroom of respect, inclusion and active participation (Willemse, 2015). Furthermore, civil society and Non-Governmental Organisations are important stakeholders in building individual's civic skills through providing lots of opportunities for enhancing active citizenship, empowerment and sustainable development among community members.

In conclusion, it is clear that Morocco has to revise social studies textbooks in order for students to develop critical citizenship skills and become active and democratic citizens of the future. Textbook activities should encourage students to think critically and question political and social events. Issues related to global economic, social and political structures should be emphasised and tasks should be designed to solve problems and trigger the critical thinking capacity of students. Nationalism and sense of belonging also should be provided but with a focus on partnership for global citizenship. In the new global 2030 agenda, global citizenship education (GCED) has been identified as a key component and has been placed at the core of SDG 4.7. For this reason, the Ministry of Education declared a curriculum change in the light of the New Strategic Vision for Reform: 2015-2030. The majority of curriculum subject content of primary education will be revised except for social studies. Further research might be conducted to investigate the overlap between educational and political agenda in developing critical thinking Moroccan citizens.

Notes

¹ idrissi.hajar17@gmail.com

² benabderrazikyoussef@gmail.com

References

- Abdi, A. (2014). Critical global citizenship in K–12 classrooms. In: Montemurro D, Gambhir M and Evans M, et al. (eds) *Inquiry into Practice: Learning and Teaching Global Matters in Local Classrooms*.
- Anderson, C. (2012). Makers: The New Industrial Revolution (p. 257).
- Anyon, J. (1978). Elementary Social Studies Textbooks and Legitimizing Knowledge. *Theory and Research in Social Education*, 6, 40-55.
- Anyon, J. (1979). Ideology and United States history textbooks. *Harvard Educational Review*, 49 (3), 361-386.
- Appiah, K. A. (2010). *The ethics of identity*. Princeton University Press.
- Banks, J. A. (2007). *Diversity and citizenship education: Global perspectives*. Jossey-Bass, An Imprint of Wiley. 10475 Crosspoint Blvd, Indianapolis, IN 46256.
- Banks, J. A. (2017). *Citizenship education and global migration: Implications for theory, research, and teaching*. American Educational Research Association.
- Barr, R. D., Barth, J. L., & Shermis, S. S. (1977). *Defining the social studies* (No. 51). Arlington, VA: National Council for the Social Studies.
- Billig, S. H. (2010). Why service learning is such a good idea. *Colleagues*, 5(1), 6.
- Biocca, F.(1991). The analysis of discourses within the political ad. In F.Biocca (ed.), *Television and political advertising. Signs, codes, and images*, 2,45—59. Hillsdale, N.J.: Erlbaum.
- Care, E., & Luo, R. (2016). *Assessment of transversal competencies: Policy and practice in the Asia-Pacific region*. Paris: UNESCO.
- Care, E., Vista, A., & Kim, H. (2018). Assessment of transversal competencies: potential of resources in the Asian region. *Paris and Bangkok: UNESCO*.
- Case, R., & Clark, P. (Eds.). (1999). *The Canadian anthology of social studies: Issues and strategies for teachers*. Pacific Educational Press.
- Crick, B. (1999). The Presuppositions of Citizenship Education. *Journal of Philosophy of Education*, 33 (3): 337–352. doi:10.1111/1467-9752.00141.
- Crismore, A. (1989). Rhetorical Form, Selection, and Use of Textbooks. Technical Report No. 454.
- Delors, J. (1996). *Learning: The treasure within*. Paris: UNESCO.
- Deng, Z., & Luke, A. (2008). Subject matter: Defining and theorizing school subjects. In F. Michael Connelly, M. Fang He, & J. Phillion (Eds.), *The sage handbook of curriculum and instruction* (pp. 66–87). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- El Ouazzani, A. Mellouk, M. Zouiten, M. Idrissi, H, M. and Aki, C. (2010). Education et changement socio culturels au Maroc : La Cohesion social par l'éducation à la citoyenneté. In Tawil, S., Akkari, A., Azami,B. (Eds.). Education, diversité et cohésion sociale en Méditerranée occidentale (PP : 219-270). Rabat: UNESCO.
- Engel, L.C. (2014). Global citizenship and national (re) formations: Analysis of citizenship education reform in Spain. *Education, Citizenship and Social Justice*; 9(3):239-54.



- Faas, D. (2011). The Nation, Europe, and Migration: A comparison of geography, history, and citizenship education curricula in Greece, Germany, and England. *Journal of Curriculum Studies*, 43(4), 471-492.
- Fadel, C., Bialik, M., & Trilling, B. (2015). *Four-dimensional education*.
- Fairclough, N. (1992). *Discourse and social change*. Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Faour, M. A. (2013a). Review of citizenship education in Arab nations. *Washington, DC: Carnegie Endowment for International Peace*.
- Faour, M. (2013b). The education of future citizens. Key challenges facing Arab countries. *Washington, DC: Carnegie Endowment for International Peace*.
- Gaudelli, W. (2016). *Global Citizenship Education: Everyday Transcendence*. New York: Routledge.
- Green, A. (1990). *Education and State Formation: The Rise of Education Systems in England, France and the USA*. London: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Grueneberg, R. (1991). The Representation of minorities in Israeli civics textbooks. M.A. thesis Discourse Analysis. Faculty of Humanities, University of Amsterdam.
- Heater, D. (1990). *Citizenship*. Harlow: Longman.
- Heater, D. (2004). *Citizenship: The civic ideal in world history, politics and education*. Manchester University Press.
- Hsieh, H. F., & Shannon, S. E. (2005). Three approaches to qualitative content analysis. *Qualitative health research*, 15(9), 1277-1288.
- Inin, E. F., & Turner, B. S. (Eds.). (2002). *Handbook of citizenship studies*. Sage.
- Jackson, L. (2014). Under construction: The development of multicultural curriculum in Hong Kong and Taiwan. *The Asia-Pacific Education Researcher*, 23(4), 885-893.
- Lim, L. (2015). Critical thinking, social education and the curriculum: foregrounding a social and relational epistemology. *Curriculum Journal*, 26(1), 4-23. doi:10.1080/09585176.2014.975733
- Marshall, T. H. (1964). *Class, Citizenship and Social Development*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Martorella, P. H. (1996). *Teaching social studies in middle and secondary schools*. New Jersey: Merrill/Prentice-Hall.
- McFarland, D. A., & Thomas, R. J. (2006). Bowling young: How youth voluntary associations influence adult political participation. *American sociological review*, 71(3), 401-425.
- McLaughlin, TH. (1992). Citizenship, diversity and education: A philosophical perspective. *Journal of moral education* ;21(3) :235-50. doi:10.1080/0305724920210307.
- Milton, P. (2015). Shifting minds 3.0: Redefining the learning landscape in Canada. *C21 Canada*, 20.
- Montgomery, K. (2005). Banal race-thinking: Ties of blood, Canadian history textbooks and ethnic nationalism. *PaedagogicaHistorica*; 41(3):313-36.
- Nasser R, Nasser, I. (2008). Textbooks as a vehicle for segregation and domination: State efforts to shape Palestinian Israelis' identities as citizens. *Journal of Curriculum Studies*;40(5):627-50.
- Nelson, J. L. (2001). Defining social studies. *Critical issues in social studies research for the 21st century*, 1, 15-38.
- Nussbaum, M. (1997). *Cultivating Humanity: A Classical Defense of Reform in Liberal Education*. Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press.
- OECD. (2005). *The definition and selection of key competencies*. Paris: OECD.

- Official Journal of the European Union (OJEU). (2018). Council recommendation of 22 May 2018 on key competences for lifelong learning. Retrieved from [https://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-content/EN/TXT/PDF/?uri=CELEX:32018H0604\(01\)&rid=7](https://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-content/EN/TXT/PDF/?uri=CELEX:32018H0604(01)&rid=7)
- Osanloo, A. F. (2009). Civic responsibility and human rights education: a pan-educational alliance for social justice. *Intercultural Education*; 20(2), 151-159.
- Osler, A., & Vincent, K. (2002). *Citizenship and the Challenge of Global Education*. Stoke on-Trent: Trentham.
- Osler, A., & Starkey, H. (2005). *Changing citizenship*. McGraw-Hill Education (UK).
- Parker, W. (2003). *Teaching democracy. Unity and diversity in public life*. New York, NY: Teachers College Press. doi:10.1086/ahr/77.5.1500
- Partnership for 21st Century Learning (P21). (2015). P21 framework definitions. Retrieved from http://www.p21.org/storage/documents/docs/P21_Framework_Definitions_New_Logo_2015
- Perveen, M., & Awan, A. S. (2017). Analysis of Curriculum about Political Literacy as Dimension of Citizenship Education. *Bulletin of Education and Research*, 39(1), 187-202.
- Phillips, L. (1998). *The third wave of modernization in Latin America: cultural perspectives on neoliberalism* (No. 16). Rowman & Littlefield.
- Putnam, R. D. (2000). *Bowling alone: The collapse and revival of American community*. Simon and schuster.
- Rychen, D. S., & Salganik, L. H. (Eds.). (2003). *Key competencies for a successful life and well-functioning society*. Hogrefe Publishing.
- Rizvi, F. (2009). Towards cosmopolitan learning. *Discourse: Studies in the cultural politics of education*; 30(3):253-68.
- Sanae, F. (2016). Citizenship education in Moroccan schools: The case of the Academy of Rabat, Salé, Zemmour, Zaïr.
- Schmidt, E., & Cohen, J. (2013). *The new digital age: Reshaping the future of people, nations and business*. Hachette UK.
- Stanley, W. B. (Ed.). (2001). *Critical issues in social studies research for the 21st century*. IAP.
- The National Education and Training Charter. (2000). Ministère de l'éducation nationale, de l'enseignement supérieur, de la formation de cadres et de la recherche scientifique.
- Tibbitts, F., & Fernekes, W. R. (2011). Human rights education. *Teaching and studying social issues: Major programs and approaches*, 87-118.
- UNESCO. (2014). *Global Citizenship Education: Preparing Learners for the Challenges of the 21st Century*. Paris: UNESCO. Available <http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0022/002277/227729E.pdf>
- UNESCO. (2015). *Sustainable Development Goals: 17 Goals to Transform our World*. <http://www.un.org/sustainabledevelopment/sustainable-development-goals/>. Paris, France: UNESCO.
- UNDP. (2007). *Human Development Report*. Brasilia.
- Veugelers, W. (2011). Theory and Practice of Citizenship Education. *Revista de Educacion*. 209–224.
- Wade, R. C., & Everett, S. (1994). Civic Participation in Third Grade Social Studies Textbooks. *Social Education*, 58(5), 308—311.
- Westheimer, J. & Kahne, J. (2004). What kind of citizen? The politics of educating for democracy. *American Educational Research Journal*; 41(2): 1-17.

-
- Westheimer, J.(2009). Should social studies be patriotic? *Social Education*. 2009; 73(7):316-20.
- Whitlock, AM & Fox, K. (2014). One Hen: Using Children's Literature in Project-Based Learning. *Social Studies and the Young Learner*; 26(4):26-9.
- Willemsse TM, ten Dam G, Geijsel F, van Wessum L, Volman M. (2015). Fostering teachers' professional development for citizenship education. *Teaching and teacher education*; 49:118-27.
- World Bank. (2008). Un parcours non encore achevé : la réforme de l'éducation au Moyen-Orient et en Afrique du Nord, Rapport sur le développement de la région MENA, Résumé analytique. Washington DC.
- Zafer KU, Tarhan, Ö. (2016). Political education in social studies classrooms: a perspective from Turkey. *Eğitimde Kuram ve Uygulama*; 12(3):464-83.
- Zaff, J. F., Moore, K. A., Papillo, A. R., & Williams, S. (2003). Implications of extracurricular activity participation during adolescence on positive outcomes. *Journal of Adolescent Research*, 18(6), 599-630.

Submitted: April, 18th, 2020.

Approved: July, 06th, 2020.