

## BOOK REVIEWS

---

*A Guide to the Holdings of the Archives of the Ecclesiastical Province of British Columbia and Yukon*, by the Archivists of the Ecclesiastical Province of British Columbia and Yukon. Toronto: General Synod Archives, Anglican Church of Canada, 1993. viii, 340 pp. Maps. \$15.00 paper.

Archival guides are rather like archives themselves, tending to remain hidden from view unless one already knows what to ask for. This guide is well worth asking for.

The guide describes the archival holdings of British Columbia's six Anglican repositories, located at the Vancouver School of Theology at the University of British Columbia (holding the records of the Ecclesiastical Province of British Columbia and Yukon, Diocese of New Westminster and Vancouver School of Theology), and in Victoria (records of Diocese of British Columbia), Prince Rupert (Diocese of Caledonia, Kamloops (diocese of Cariboo), Kelowna (Diocese of Kootenay), and Whitehorse (Diocese of Yukon). Initially, the Diocese of British Columbia covered the entire province, with other dioceses being created as population expanded. In general, each diocese repository contains materials related to that geographic area, although some materials predating the diocese's creation may be held elsewhere.

Reasons for consulting the guide are several. Historically, the Anglicans have been an influential component of British Columbia's settlement population, going back to the Pacific Northwest's origins as a British colonial outpost. The Anglican Church, earlier the Church of England, has commanded the allegiance of a greater proportion of residents than in any other province. Between 1891 and 1951 a quarter or more of British Columbians declared themselves Anglican. In the peak years between the two wars almost one in three

were Anglican, compared with just over one in five in the next highest province of Ontario.

The guide provides a valuable entry point for assessing the role of Anglicans and Anglicanism in British Columbia. Records relate not only to the church's internal administration, but to its many outreach activities, ranging from women's and youth groups to higher education to missionary activities among Native peoples and Asians. Diverse examples of source materials are diaries, correspondence and parish registers relating to the Lytton Indian Mission, including records of St. Bartholomew's Hospital established in 1893; correspondence, membership lists, scrapbooks, and photographs of Anglican Church Women of the Kootenay from 1906 to 1980; the minutes, correspondence and other records of the British Columbia Anglican Youth Movement from 1931, and of St. Chad's Home for Boys founded in Victoria in 1964; and the very extensive archives, including curricula, questionnaires and student reports, of the Carcross Community Education Centre established in the Yukon, 1972-79, as an experiment in alternative education and community living for both Native and non-Native students.

The guide will also prove invaluable to local historians and genealogists through its inclusion of extant parish registers of baptisms, marriages and deaths. Some of these, as with those from Christ Church in Hope and St. Saviour's in Barkerville, predate civil registration of vital statistics beginning in British Columbia in 1872. Of special interest are the parish registers from the Tsimshian community of Metlakatla and the Nisga'a communities of Aiyansh and Kincolith, all formed by early Anglican missionaries as Christian Native villages.

Many of the items in the guide have broad-based utility for understanding British Columbia's past. One that has been most widely used by social historians is the diary kept by the first Anglican Bishop, George Hills, from his arrival on Vancouver Island in 1860 to his retirement near the end of the century, with its perceptive observations of the daily life of Native peoples and miners in the early 1860s. Equally important for documenting British Columbia's social history are the very extensive records — minutes, correspondence, its founder's memoir, hospital records, scrapbooks, slides, interviews, and so on — of the Columbia Coast Mission, which from 1905 to 1985 served Native and logging communities up and down the coasts of Vancouver Island and the mainland. Among smaller gems are an unidentified journal reporting local events in Port Essington at the turn of the century, the diary and memoirs of the first Anglican rector

at Sorrento and the Shuswap Lakes in the early twentieth century; and the photograph album of a nurse working at the Kingcome Inlet Indian mission during the 1930s.

Each of the guide's 764 entries contains a detailed description of the materials with dates, size in centimetres, historical and biographical context, and location of copies in other Anglican repositories. Appendices provide glossaries of ecclesiastical and technical terms and biographies of individuals prominent in the Anglican Church in British Columbia. The guide is indexed by personal and geographic names, but not by subject, making a perusal of its 343 pages a prerequisite of serious research.

The Archivists of the Ecclesiastical Province of British Columbia and Yukon, in particular project coordinator Doreen Stephens, and the Canadian Studies Research Tools Programme of the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council, are to be commended for making possible this major new archival research tool for British Columbia history.

*The University of British Columbia*

JEAN BARMAN

*Patkau Architects: Selected Projects, 1983-1993*, edited by Brian Carter. Halifax: TUNS Press, 1994. 120 pp. Illus. \$27.95 paper.

John and Patricia Patkau have succeeded signally in creating *delight* through the satisfaction of *commodity* and execution of *firmness*. That triad of architectural criteria, immortalized by Sir Henry Wotton, survived into the language of Modernism, being talisman and caption for the 1937 London MARS [Modern Architecture Research Group] exhibition which the Canadian Fred Lasserre helped to organize before returning to Canada to teach Modern design. Patricia Patkau presently teaches at the School of Architecture at the University of British Columbia, of which Lasserre was founding director, having, with her husband, graduated from another significant centre of post-war Modernist training, the School of Architecture at the University of Manitoba. And as Kenneth Frampton, a respected historian of the movement, observes in a postscript the Patkaus are involved in an evolving "critical cultivation" of Modernist concepts. Their work brilliantly exhibits technical experimentation and exploitation, principled pragmatism and invention through analysis of specific need and mate-

rial condition. It also discloses the often ignored Modernist sensitivity to site, regional factors, and the human psyche. Maybe the idiosyncratic formalism of their architecture, epitomized by the Seabird Island Band School of Agassiz, the wood formed profile of which condenses the enfolding mountain ranges and evokes the salmon upon which the band traditionally lived, inclined somewhat more to the "stunt" rather than the "anonymous" Walter Gropius enjoined. But in its concise structure and articulation, elegant efficiency of spatial organization and uncompromising contemporaneity it retrieves Modernism from the nemesis of formulaic repetition, corporate internationalism, and institutional utilitarianism.

Those qualities of architectural conception and realization are ably displayed in this unpretentious soft cover publication. One of the Patkau's pristinely precise renderings, for the Canadian Clay and Glass Gallery at Waterloo, Ontario, is printed on the handsomely plain cover. Part diagram, part abstract image, that sets the tone for the contents, which are more explanatory than declamatory. Indeed, the essay by the compiler of the exhibition at the Royal Institute of British Architects that this catalogue accompanies, the British architect and critic Brian Carter (Visiting Professor at the Technical University of Nova Scotia, which funded the publication), is very short. Yet, under the title "Mapping Territory," Carter establishes a nice conceit for comprehending an essential theme in Patkau's work, namely their abiding concern with siting and by analogy with what Carter aphorizes as "discovery and invention." Therein he enlarges upon an idea raised in the Foreword by Dr. Essy Baniassad, Dean of Architecture at T.U.N.S., who initiated the *Documents in Canadian Architecture* series of which *PATKAU ARCHITECTS* is the fourth volume. "Architecture in Canada," Baniassad avers with indirect reference to the Patkaus, "combines the richness of Western architectural heritage and simplicity of an aboriginal culture still closely tied to a vast fragile land." That sentence is perceptive and astute where much discoursing on Canadian artistic identity is lugubrious and tendentious.

Baniassad indicates the intelligent course set for the series and certainly upheld by Carter. The text studiously avoids both the "publicizing and advertising" and critical posturing which undermines too much literature on contemporary design in favour of a discerning selectivity that endeavours to identify the main characteristics and achievement of the subject free of subjective speculation or methodological dogma. To attempt more would be premature, especially since the Patkau's architecture, though anchored to consistent princi-

ples of program analysis and expression, exhibits considerable potential for development. This potential is markedly evident in a comparison between their 1986 competition scheme and their 1988 erected plans for the Canadian Clay and Glass Gallery. The former, admittedly envisaging a larger budget, is more complex in massing and symbolic composition, while the latter embodies a compact functional solution that actually enhances their intended play upon the fragile and decoratively useful nature of the objects exhibited inside.

The reader, however, will discover a sufficiency of material to arrive at an informed judgement. The bulk of the text comprises two sections. The first reprints the architects' responses to sensible questions posed by the Toronto architect Mario Polo and by Beth Kkapusta and Bronwen Ledger, respectively assistant editor and editor of *The Canadian Architect*. The second contains the extensively illustrated, informative, and readable commentaries by Carter on eleven projects completed between 1983 and 1993, each addressing the issues of site, design, and construction. Again the word yields precedence to the image: crisply reproduced photographs of model, plans, sections and finished building. The remarkable fecundity and discipline of the Patkau's recent architecture — from the tightly arranged intimacy of the Pynch house in Victoria, to the efficiently imaginative structuring of the Newton Library in Surrey, B.C. — awaits inspection there. As a final aid, the text includes an Index of Buildings and Projects 1978-1993, listing assistants as well as technical and contractual association, a tally of awards and exhibitions, and a comprehensive bibliography.

This fine publication represents a valuable contribution to the study of Canadian architecture. The series, should it maintain comparable intellectual and production standards, will do the same.

*The University of British Columbia*      RHODRI WINDSOR LISCOMBE

*Twana Narratives: Native Historical Accounts of a Coast Salish Culture*, by William W. Elmendorf. Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press, 1993. lv, 306 pp. Maps, illus. \$49.95 cloth.

This book is a collection of 80 historical narratives on the subject of Coast Salish culture and society in the middle and late nineteenth century, recorded by anthropologist William Elmendorf in the Hood

Canal region of western Washington State. The narrators, brothers Frank and Henry Allen, were members of the Twana-speaking Skokomish tribe, many of whom were placed on the Skokomish Reservation after the 1850s. The material was gathered by Elmendorf in the 1940s while he was a doctoral candidate in anthropology at the University of California (Berkeley), and later it became the basis of an ethnographic monograph on the Twana entitled *The Structure of Twana Culture* (Elmendorf 1992 [1960]).

In *Twana Narratives*, Elmendorf makes the original material from the interviews available to the general public, while giving prominence to the voice of his Native teachers. The narratives are organized into chapters corresponding thematically with the arrangement of topics in *The Structure of Twana Culture*. The accounts vary in nature. They include stories from the early reservation period, based on the narrators' personal experiences, as well as stories about such practices as potlatching and the acquisition of spirit powers, passed down to the Allen brothers by their maternal and paternal relatives. The book's introduction describes the order in which the accounts were narrated and assesses their content and style, as well as their relation to Western concepts of myth and history. Two indexes, one for place names, and the other for personal names, contribute to making this collection a very thorough source book on Twana culture, which scholars and community workers will find invaluable for research purposes in the years to come.

The author's introduction will be of interest to those involved in the study of oral traditions, because of the background information it provides on the narrators and on the process of recording their knowledge. *Twana Narratives* is introduced as the product of a collaboration. Of his relationship with Henry Allen, Elmendorf writes: "He was an enthusiastic co-investigator with an intense interest in the ways of his people [. . .] In fact, we more or less assumed the native roles of young learner and older teacher" (p. xxx). The process with Frank Allen is described as follows: "After my few attempts at directed interviews, Frank rather emphatically insisted on directing our sessions in his own way and without undue interruptive questioning on my part" (p. xxx). Elmendorf summarizes his relationship with the Allen brothers as that of "listener and learner in the presence of knowledgeable teachers" (p. xxxi). With these words Elmendorf addresses current concerns within anthropology about the representation of others in the ethnographic encounter, offering a contemporary perspective on work conducted some sixty years ago.

A second feature of this work which gives it contemporary relevance is its attention to the form and content of Twana historical consciousness. In the introduction to *Twana Narratives* Elmendorf goes into some detail regarding the order of narration followed by Frank Allen, with whom he recorded sixty-five out of eighty narratives. Frank Allen's choice of topics for discussion reflected a concern to have recorded the history of this people — first, the history of his paternal people, the Skokomish, and then the history of his mother's people, the Klallam (p. xlvi). Thus what the anthropologist recorded as "ethnography" the narrators regarded as their "history." Passages within the narratives themselves evoke a Twana sense of history. There are hints, for example, of what might constitute a Twana spatial history, named places linking narratives to teach other through their association in space. Nearly all the historical accounts in *Twana Narratives* begin with some reference to place, and there is some suggestion that they are linked to one another in space. These and other elements of the narratives provide a unique perspective on a mode of historical thought indigenous to the culture of Elmendorf's Twana teachers.

In organizing the accounts for publication Elmendorf chose not to reproduce the order followed by Frank Allen, but to deal with the subject of history from a Western perspective by providing dates for a majority of the accounts. The dates were determined using different kinds of evidence, both written and oral, and indicated by a date or interval of one or two decades set in brackets following the title of each narrative. By introducing time into the synchronic ethnographic frame, Elmendorf provides an opportunity to view how change is registered in what were previously thought to be societies without history.

While the form in which the accounts are presented in the collection does not maintain the flow of Frank Allen's narrative, *Twana Narratives* does provide a unique perspective on the historical vision of a Coast Salish people. The book is an invaluable source of knowledge about Twana culture and society, and a document testifying to the knowledge and skill of those Skokomish Twana historians who were William Elmendorf's teachers.

*The University of  
British Columbia*

PAULINE JOLY DE LOTBINIÈRE

*Japanese Direct Investment in Canada: Recent Trends and Prospects*, by David W. Edgington. B.C. Geographical Series, Number 49. Vancouver: Department of Geography, The University of British Columbia, 1992. vi, 110 pp. Maps, tables. \$9.35 paper.

In the late 1980s, Japan's economy soared to unprecedented heights in terms of GNP, market share and asset prices. During this period, Japan became rightly viewed as the world's money machine, exporting on average more than \$100 billion of long-term capital per year. Canada, in particular, became increasingly reliant on inflows of Japanese capital. By 1991, Japanese investors held 25 per cent of all foreign-held Canadian bonds, up from less than 2 per cent a decade earlier, and Japan ranked third, after the United States and Britain, as a source of foreign direct investment in Canada. Pierre Elliott Trudeau's call for an Asian "third alternative" for Canada, based largely on Japanese direct investment, seemed, at last, near fulfilment. Yet Japanese foreign direct investment (FDI) in Canada remains frustratingly small, still below 2 per cent of global Japanese FDI, and only about one twentieth of the volume flowing to the United States. Most of the Japanese investment in Canada has also been qualitatively disappointing, involving minimal value added and little transfer of technology.

David Edgington's new study, published in the British Columbia geographical series, provides a comprehensive overview of the phenomenon of Japanese foreign direct investment in Canada. The author has reviewed the literature on the subject thoroughly, and the report is extremely well documented. The author's profile of Japanese FDI in Canada rightly begins with a review of Japanese-Canadian trade patterns, as "Japan's trade links with Canada have continued to drive its investments in this country" (p. 5). In addition to its descriptive profile of the patterns and evolution of Japanese FDI in Canada, the strength of the book lies mainly in its illustrative case examples of Japanese investments in three industries: forest products, automobiles, and banking and services. The author concludes each of these sections with a penetrating, and often critical, evaluation of the FDI activity in that sector. He points out, for example, that the subsidiary status of Japanese investments in pulp and paper "appears to have helped create a truncated local industry where higher level corporate functions, notably research and development and the import of critical technology, are carried out only in Japan" (p. 30). Similarly, in the automotive section, he concludes that "While Canada has gained more than its continental share of assembly jobs . . . , there has been little investment

in higher-order manufacturing, research and design functions, or technology-intensive automotive parts such as engines or electronic components" (p. 50).

The author attempts throughout the monograph to provide an interpretation of recent changes in Japanese FDI in Canada, in terms of corporate motivations, local opportunities and constraints, and the policy actions of federal and provincial governments. What comes out of all of this is a profile of a highly imbalanced relationship. While Japan is important to Canada (Japan is our second largest trading partner), Canada seems almost irrelevant to Japan: Canada ranks only in seventh place as a trading partner for Japan, and in thirteenth place as a destination of Japanese FDI.

If there is any weakness to the book, it may be in the absence of any clear policy recommendations, either for attracting more Japanese FDI or for upgrading its value-added content. The author can hardly be faulted for that as, realistically, there probably is not much that can be done. Japan's current economic slowdown will put a damper on new Japanese FDI flows globally, and almost all indications are that the attention of Japanese investors is being diverted increasingly to the large and rapidly-growing markets of Asia. Even within North America, Canada's prospects for attracting a larger share of Japanese FDI seem dim. Expectations, for example, that implementation of the North American free trade area will stimulate new Japanese FDI in Canada to serve the entire North American market seem wishful thinking. As long as Japanese investors remain sceptical about whether Canadian-made goods will in fact be allowed unimpeded access to the U.S. (and the U.S.-Canada Free Trade Agreement has so far provided a number of discouraging precedents), Japanese investors will seek to locate their new North American plants either in the country with the largest internal market or in the country with the lowest factor costs. Canada is likely to be neither.

Nevertheless, the growing importance of Japanese-Canadian business interactions clearly warrants more prominent attention by both the business community and by governments. Prof. Edgington's book is a significant contribution in this direction.

*The Legacy and the Challenge: A Century of the Forest Industry at Cowichan Lake*, by Richard Rajala. Lake Cowichan: Lake Cowichan Heritage Advisory Committee, 1993. xi, 142 pp. Illus. \$12.95 paper.

Richard Rajala was ideally qualified to write this learned and timely forest history. From a Finnish-Irish logging family, and brought up at the Hillcrest Lumber Company's village at Mesachie Lake, Rajala worked at the sawmill at Honeymoon Bay until the recession of the early 1980s. Out of work, he went to the University of Victoria to study history, gaining an M.A. there in 1987. When asked to write this book he was "plodding through a doctoral study of forest practices on the west coast, and welcomed the opportunity to discover more about the region and relate some themes of my academic work to the local setting." But the book is even more personal than that. Rajala wanted to know what happened to the forests and to the "stable communities" of his youth. "Forests are more than a collection of trees. They are also more than ecosystems. The forests of Vancouver Island have provided a basis for communities, a distinctive way of life, and a culture rooted in the relationship of working people both to corporate capital and the natural environment."

"The central, organizing theme of the book is the rise and recent decline of the Cowichan Lake forest industry," he writes, but his chronology and conclusions apply beyond Lake Cowichan. In 1913 the CPR opened a branchline to the lake; ten years later the last lakeshore timber had been cut; the CNR opened its own railway to the lake in 1925; in 1929 the first of several mills was built there; a year later some 2,000 unionized loggers and millworkers lived at Lake Cowichan, which subsequently became the base for exploitation of timber as far west as the Pacific. By 1946, 400,000 carloads had been carried out of the region on the CPR line alone, representing over 2 billion feet of timber. "By 1950 the presence of large sawmills and industrial villages at Youbou, Honeymoon Bay, and Mesachie Lake made the Lake a robust and thriving region marked by a culture of hard work and energetic community endeavour. Men and women raised families, educated their children in the schools around the lake, and planned for the future. But when the future arrived it brought mill closures, unemployment, and dislocation."

The opening of the lake, Rajala notes, had coincided with the development of efficient new railway and overhead logging technologies which led, in turn, to the clearcutting of much of the E&N grant and surrounding land. "Under the high lead and skyline systems

coastal logging became a matter of clear cutting large areas at a single setting." The result was an exploitative forest frontier that did not provide a sound foundation for community development. Between the wars, chief foresters Caverhill and Manning, and *Cowichan Leader* editor Hugh Savage, advocated regulation through selective logging, but the provincial government ignored their advice first in the depression and then during the war, when political priorities dominated. Reforestation by the provincial forest branch did not begin until 1944, but by then "there was little evidence of the industry providing a basis for community permanence and prosperity."

In 1943 Chief Justice Gordon Sloan was appointed to head a Royal Commission to study the forestry question. He recommended the adoption of a "sustained yield" policy on new Tree Farm Licenses (TFLs) carved out of provincial crown land. This system of tenure was meant to "attract investment capital, encourage the practice of forestry and stabilize communities whose existence was tied to the industry." Sustained yield was put into effect in 1947. Western Forest Industries adopted the shifty slogan "Here Today and Here Tomorrow." Soon, however, the provincial government allowed the AAC (Annual Allowable Cut) to exceed sustainable levels. Between 1950 and 1970 government and industry increased the AAC "with more regard for full production and profit than sustainability"; most of Lake Cowichan's sawmills closed in the 1970s and 1980s due to timber shortage.

Mill closure cannot be blamed, Rajala concludes, on British Columbia Forest Products or current TFL owner Fletcher Challenge. "The demise of the Cowichan Lake forest industry was assured long before Fletcher Challenge arrived on the scene. Rather, the cause lies in a heritage of uncontrolled, and then poorly regulated resource exploitation." British Columbians were "lulled into a false sense of security by the comforting, largely rhetorical, programme of sustained yield legislation." As always, Rajala is interested in the effect of this on community. "The recent deindustrialization of Cowichan Lake, this study suggest, arises from the provincial state's historic failure to adequately regulate industrial forest practices in the interests of community stability." Thus, we should blame the ghost towns of Lake Cowichan on the provincial government; but we should also remember that "the state" is elected by the people. Perhaps the people get the government they deserve.

This book is occasionally a tough read. Chapters are not numbered; there is no bibliography or index. Rajala's "focus on industrialization and physical development" calls for better maps. He avoids ecological

and environmental issues. He sometimes prefers academic and trade jargon over simple English: "context" for setting; "structure" as a verb; "the provincial state" for the province; "tidewater" for ocean; "manufacturing facility" for mill; "harvest" for cut. I've never reviewed a book with so many typos: low-valve timber, barbaining, behing, excaserbating, reprot, Argus for Angus, Pearce for Pearse, Walkhem for Walkem.

Although Rajala has found a local voice that is often absent in academic writing about British Columbia, he also relies too much on American sources and models. U.S. presidents Harrison and Cleveland (first names and all) do not belong in a history of Lake Cowichan nor, arguably, do American descriptions of horse-team, skidder, hook-tender, steam donkey, and overhead logging systems, nor union and conservation history from south of the border. Rajala assures us that "Manning's campaign, then, took place within a larger context of regulatory initiatives in resource conservation," and that "Sloan's tenure proposal was quite in line with contemporary developments in forest planning." To quote the good work of Manning and Sloan and then assert that their ideas were simply branch-plant copies of American originals is to lessen their achievement, to colonise our past, and to diminish the role of personality and local agency. One sympathizes with local IWA trustee Jack Greenall of Cowichan Lake for his refusal to follow, in 1947, his American bosses' order to comply with "Taft-Hartley" (whatever that is). "The principle involved is very simple," Greenall wrote, "and boils down to the fact that a government to which I owe no allegiance, in a country where I haven't a vote, has no right to tell me or any other Canadian what political principles must be endorsed or rejected."

*The Legacy and the Challenge* is an impressive study. As well as providing the forest history promised in the subtitle, this book also makes valuable contributions to community, labour, and corporate history in British Columbia. Rajala shows how a combination of capital, government, and technology turned his home town into a ghost town.

*Errington, B.C.*

RICHARD MACKIE

*Women Volunteer to Go to Prison: A History of the Elizabeth Fry Society of B.C., 1939-1989*, by Lee Stewart. Victoria: Orca, 1993. xiv,207 pp. Illus. \$16.95 paper.

Writing a commissioned history is a daunting task; it involves questions of authorial autonomy, voice and integrity. How does one write the history of an organization with all its members peering over one's shoulder, so to speak, searching for mistakes or differing interpretations? Lee Stewart knows well the pitfalls of such an undertaking as she shows in *Women Volunteer to Go to Prison*. Written to commemorate the 50th anniversary of the Elizabeth Fry Society in British Columbia, the volume chronicles the institutional history of the group founded in 1939. Stewart worked with a group of Fry women who criticized each chapter. The author is to be congratulated for the collaborative achievement which goes far towards recording the little-known history of a women's volunteer group. Writing to the specifications of a group, however, also has its problems and limitations.

Organized into nine chapters, the book begins with an account of the early days of the organization, founded under the aegis of the Provincial Council of Women. The first two chapters also discuss social reform and penal reform, the latter through a brief recapping of the life of Elizabeth Fry, the nineteenth century English Quaker woman, whose work inspired the B.C. effort. The subsequent three chapters discuss voluntary efforts at Oakalla (women's prison), in provincial industrial schools for girls, and at group homes. Chapter 6 explores the collective identity of the volunteers, while chapter 7 looks at attempts to build bridges between the institutions and the community. The efforts to close the Kingston Penitentiary for women are chronicled in chapter 8, while the last chapter summarizes events and brings the narrative up to the present.

Under the Fry Society's direction, Stewart was asked to write a history that tells the story of the organization and downplays the role of individuals whether inmates or volunteers. In following this request, Stewart has produced a sometimes dry, institutional history, lacking the colour of individual personalities and motivations. Because the historian is telling the story of the organization based on the latter's records in large part, the pace of developments seems artificially controlled and regularized. While Stewart mentions reading secondary sources, newspapers, government documents, and other pieces of primary evidence in addition to the Fry records, the reader is struck by the dominance of organizationally-generated material. This

strengthens the tendency of the author to stay within the parameters of the group, and to leave interesting questions unasked or undeveloped. The reader, for instance, does not get a sense of where this group fits into the "social reform" spectrum in the province — why was the Provincial Council of Women so involved in penal reform? Did the emphasis reflect the interests of the leadership? Who exactly were the women involved and what in their class backgrounds and family/political connections led them to this particular area of women's voluntary work?

Stewart also makes some assertions at the conceptual level that demand more evidence. The parallel men's organization, the John Howard Society, for example, is discussed as arising from social gospel roots and from concerns that male offenders commit crimes for economically related reasons. Stewart seems to accept that women choose collective, voluntary, social work for different, gender-related reasons tied to the history of women in social reform. Similarly, she accepts the Fry view that female offenders' problems stemmed from improper socialization and lack of education, areas related to individual or family deficiencies. While the explanation for the men's organization seems to indicate one type of class framework (a critical, left of center perspective), the explanatory framework for women adheres to a much more conservative and upper middle class conceptualization that eschews economic/class explanations in favour of individual or family failings. This underlines a major drawback in the volume: little attention is paid to the class backgrounds and motivations of the Fry volunteers, as noted above. In addition, there is little critical comment on the racial/ethnic tensions Fry women and Native women inmates must have felt at least at some points, given the disproportionate numbers of Native women in conflict with the law (36). Indeed, the impression one gets from Stewart is that the volunteers acted as patrons for the less fortunate, especially young Native women who had fewer years of schooling and less experience with the corrupting urban environment. Given what we know about white attitudes to Natives, now and in the past, the lack of any discussion about racism is extremely regrettable.

There are some other interesting avenues not developed here as well. The tension between voluntarism and professionalism is mentioned, but not addressed very concretely. Here again, class may have played an important role. Who were the professionals, as opposed to the volunteers? Not only were they undoubtedly younger, they may also have been from a less prestigious social stratum; volunteers may

have seen the professionals as less experienced and lower in status than themselves. A related question touched on in the narrative, but not developed, is the interesting mention of several mother-daughter pairs working within the organization. To what extent did daughters follow their mothers in volunteer work? Did they become professional social workers instead of volunteers? As a reader, one is left to ponder the possibilities here.

Finally, the volume raises the old question of whether these women can be considered feminists, thereby opening a whole debate about the nature of feminism. Here Stewart seems to vacillate, sometimes viewing the female voluntary tradition as separate from the concerns of feminism (chapter 9), and at other times, particularly in the first two chapters, as part of a maternal feminist tradition. Perhaps part of the problem is the lack of an adequate concept of feminism in the post-suffrage era. Stewart is left with two different and probably inappropriate models for the period between 1920s and the late 1960s when a recognizable modern feminism emerged. Conceptual problems such as these detract from the potential impact of the book.

*Women Volunteer to Go to Prison* will be read by specialists — BC women's historians, historians of social reform, women's organizations, and those interested in the Elizabeth Fry Society and related organizations — but it will not inspire a wider readership in women's history, gender history or women's studies because it does not offer a sustained analytical framework or new insights into social reform or feminism. What it does provide is the organizational history of a pioneer penal reform group and some very intriguing questions that other historians might find worth pursuing.

*Memorial University of Newfoundland*

LINDA KEALEY