

## BOOK REVIEWS

---

*Landscapes of Injustice:  
A New Perspective on the  
Internment and Dispossession  
of Japanese Canadians.*

Edited by Jordan Stanger-Ross.

Montreal and Kingston: McGill-  
Queen's University Press, 2020.  
496 pp. \$29.95 paper.

JONATHAN VAN HARMELEN  
*University of California,  
Santa Cruz*

IN HISTORICAL memory, the forced confinement and exclusion of 22,000 Japanese Canadians from 1942 to 1949 remains one of the darkest and, unfortunately, least understood chapters in Canadian history. Although the story has been told before, by authors such as Ken Adachi, Ann Gomer Sunahara, Frank Moritsugu, and Greg Robinson, plus creative artists such as novelist Joy Kogawa and poet Takeo Ujo Nakano, studies on the traumatic experiences of removal and confinement are still emerging. These new works uncover unexplored aspects of the experience and deepen our understanding of the larger event.

As such, *Landscapes of Injustice* is a particularly impressive and unprecedented study. The product of seven years of research conducted by a collective organized by historian Jordan Stanger-Ross of the University of Victoria, *Landscapes of Injustice* provides one of the first comprehensive studies on the Japanese Canadian wartime experience and the erasure of Japanese Canadian communities from the West Coast. Comprised of fourteen chapters and organized by themes relating to the law and historical memory, this edited volume does an excellent job of both documenting the numberless tragedies of removal and honouring its victims.

In particular, the volume's focus on the forcible confiscation and sale of Japanese Canadian property by the Canadian government – a stark difference from the Japanese American experience, as noted by the authors – represents an important contribution. This official dispossession underscores one of the more horrific aspects of forced removal in addition to the camp experience. This volume identifies how Glenn McPherson, the executive assistant to the Custodian of Enemy Property, developed the idea of despoiling Japanese Canadians of their property in order to prevent their postwar return to the West Coast. As the authors

note, the underhanded means by which a cabal of individuals, led by British Columbia-based cabinet minister Ian Mackenzie, orchestrated the wholesale liquidation of Japanese Canadian property offers an example of the fragility of civil liberties during wartime. While the scope of this edited volume is limited to the relationship between Japanese Canadians and their government, these chapters provide an excellent starting point for future conversations about property losses, settler colonialism, and human rights.

Another strength of this volume is Stanger-Ross's wise inclusion of Japanese Canadian activists as contributors, which allows the authors to strike a nice balance between the legal history of dispossession and the lived experiences of those suffering its consequences. Furthermore, the volume's discussion of the removal's contemporary legacies – whether through statistical analysis of current-day locations of Japanese Canadian communities or anecdotes from those who remember it – helps remind readers that the wartime policies, and the white supremacist intentions of their planners, continue to shape the present physical and legal landscape of Canada. Jordan Stanger-Ross and his collaborators have brought a fresh take to the wartime history of Japanese Canadians, and their careful research will help convince readers of the lasting implications of the wartime policies for Canadian society. For students interested in Canadian history and the wartime experiences of Japanese Canadians, this study represents an important addition to the field.

*Cataloguing Culture:  
Legacies of Colonialism in  
Museum Documentation*

Hannah Turner

Vancouver: UBC Press.

260 pp. \$32.95 paper.

JOY DAVIS

*University of Victoria*

As HANNAH Turner points out in the introduction to her timely book, *Cataloguing Culture: Legacies of Colonialism in Museum Documentation*, “Museum records are often taken to be neutral or privileged sources of knowledge, but they are both contextual and historical, as are many bureaucratic processes” (4). As such, the deeply embedded subjectivity of collections information deserves attention at a time when museums in British Columbia and well beyond are examining – and seeking to change – the ways in which their systems perpetuate colonial attitudes, structures, and power relations. Turner’s work takes a particular focus on ethnographic collections as managed by the Smithsonian, but it holds lessons for the interrogation of cataloguing much more generally.

Turner has two overarching purposes in this book. One is to plot the historical underpinnings of categorization and cataloguing, linked as they are to Western scientific efforts to bring order and objectivity to burgeoning knowledge. The other is to demonstrate how the assumptions and protocols embedded in these systems work to discriminate. It is her goal “to show that ideas about evidence are historically situated and arose out of the communities and techniques of scientific-ethnological practice in the long nineteenth century” (14). She effectively achieves this goal

through thoughtful and engaging analysis in five chapters and a conclusion that trace collecting and documentation practices and their contemporary implications.

The initial chapter, “Writing Desiderata: Defining Evidence in the Field,” sets the stage. Turner describes ways in which nineteenth-century interest in the scientific study of both natural history and humankind influenced the discipline and practice of North American ethnology. Collecting guides, known as “desiderata,” provided “non-expert” collectors in the field with lists of specimens of particular interest, along with instruction on how to preserve objects and document key information. Significant outcomes of this prescriptive approach were detailed classification and cataloguing systems devised to enable scientists to compare and contrast diverse forms of material culture. As the author notes, this systematic approach “enabled collectors in the field and museum workers to slot objects into existing categories of knowledge that they were then able to measure against existing anthropological inquiry” (63).

The following two chapters explore technologies of documentation: ledgers, card catalogues, and other forms of recording data in authoritative paper records that lend gravity and authenticity to field data. Such records, assembled by museum workers far from the field, are not without flaws. As Turner points out, “the affordances and constraints of the media technologies the museum used to record object collections affected in no small part, how these objects were listed, classified, renamed and reimagined” (19).

In her final chapters and conclusion, Turner analyzes ways in which early practices have evolved in the context of changing values and perspectives, increasing museum bureaucracy, concern about condition, the benefits

and limitations of new information management technologies, more systematic data standards and naming protocols, and the imperatives of access, ownership, repatriation, and respect for source communities. In doing so, she offers repeated evidence of the failings of systems to honour Indigenous worldviews and ways of knowing. As Turner notes in her conclusion, “Practices and technologies, embedded in catalogues, have ethical consequences, yet paying attention to other histories is often difficult in this context as they are so often completely occluded” (193).

*Cataloguing Culture* is successful at many levels. It is an important scholarly and teaching resource that clearly maps out the ways in which early efforts to organize collections information adhere to a colonial worldview that privileges some forms of knowledge and ignores others. It is also a valuable – and engaging – resource for museum professionals who are seeking to understand how they can recognize deeply ingrained bias and implement meaningful change in their systems, practices, and relations with source communities.

*Decolonizing Discipline:  
Children, Corporal Punishment,  
Christian Theologies, and  
Reconciliation.*

Edited by Valerie Michaelson  
and Joan Durrant

Winnipeg: University of Manitoba  
Press, 2020. 280 pp. \$31.95 paper.

ALEX GAGNE  
*York University*

*Decolonizing Discipline* is a direct response to the sixth call to action made by the Truth and Reconciliation

Commission to repeal section 43 of Canada's criminal code, which allows corporal punishment "to correct what is evil in the child" (1). This collection of interdisciplinary narratives integrates "academic, theological, and experiential" (236) perspectives into a dialogue to deconstruct the historical and theological underpinnings of corporal punishment – a response to why laws steeped in colonialism, hatred, and violence continue to exist in Canada today. More than this, *Decolonizing Discipline* is a self-reflective project that calls for "Christian churches to participate in reconciliation by confronting the colonial theologies that continue to enable oppression, and by so doing, contribute to a society in which all children can flourish" (3).

Divided into four distinct parts, *Decolonizing Discipline* begins by outlining the psychological impact of corporal punishment. For example, Joan E. Durrant's chapter provides meta-analyses of hundreds of sociological studies on the effects of corporal punishment to illustrate the long-lasting trauma that Canada allowed to be inflicted upon children. The first part of the collection also features chapters that include oral histories that explore the traumatic impact of residential schooling in Australia. The second part retains the ambitious interdisciplinary scope of the project and reconsiders the Church's stance on corporal punishment. In particular, chapters written by William J. Webb and William S. Morrow offer alternative readings of the Bible and proverbs that reframe the biblical meaning of child rearing. They ask readers to move away from the literal meaning of proverbs and follow the "functional" (84) meaning within biblical texts. In simpler terms, the greater meaning of biblical stories containing corporal punishment was not

the method but the "meaning, namely, some form of discipline that helped the child embrace wisdom instead of folly" (84).

Part 3 of the collection is composed of chapters that focus on Indigenous child-rearing and teaching. In this revealing section, contributors such as Shirley Tagalik illustrate the experiential nature of Indigenous child-rearing practices referred to as *Inunngnuiniq* – a life-long process of relationship building, humility, and working collaboratively within a community. Tagalik states it best by clarifying that *Inunngnuiniq* is understood as "teaching to the heart rather than cramming the head" (139). The final part of the collection reflects on the process of organizing "The Road to Reconciliation" (3) lecture, which ultimately led to this edited volume. For example, the chapter written by Clarence Hale and Valerie E. Michaelson recalls the process of compiling this project, speaks to the painful truths that were exposed, and contemplates the painful journey ahead to confront and change the nation.

While the altruistic nature of this project cannot be denied, some elements are lacking in this collection. Specifically, it would have benefitted from a deeper analysis of the history of Canadian residential schools – possibly drawn from the work of historians such as J.R. Miller, who has written extensively on the formation, administration, and childhood experience in these institutions. While there is a brief discussion of Sylvia Van Kirk's seminal work, *Many Tender Ties*, there could have been a deeper engagement with Canada's dark history of residential schooling to complement the oral histories that focus on the Australian residential schooling experience. Nonetheless, *Decolonizing Discipline* transcends disciplinary boundaries and advocates for

all Canadians – academics, theologians, and readers alike – to push towards improved standards of compassion and care for our children.

*The Object's the Thing:  
The Writings of Yorke  
Edwards, a Pioneer of Heritage  
Interpretation in Canada*

Edited by Richard Kool and  
Robert A. Cannings

Victoria, BC: Royal BC Museum,  
2021. 336 pp. \$24.95 paper.

PATRICIA E. ROY  
*University of Victoria*

WHEN WE visit a nature park or a museum, do we consider how interpretation contributed to our experience? For Yorke Edwards, “the father of nature interpretation in Canada,” interpreting the object is “the thing.” As Richard Kool notes, Edwards “helped to create a movement, and then a profession [of naturalist], meant to help others fall in love with things, be they organisms, landscapes, histories or peoples” (26). Edwards is important for British Columbia because much of his creativity was expressed in provincial parks and, later, at the provincial museum.

Robert Cannings’s lively biography introduces Edwards, his career, and twenty-seven examples of his writings on heritage conservation, the volume’s core. When Edwards published his first ornithological paper at age sixteen, he was already a keen birdwatcher. His enthusiasm for natural history was nurtured by visits to the Royal Ontario Museum in his hometown of Toronto and membership in its Intermediate

Naturalists organization. His path later crossed that of two fellow members, Robert Bateman and Bristol Foster. After receiving a degree in forestry from the University of Toronto, Edwards did graduate studies in zoology at the University of British Columbia under the direction of Ian McTaggart Cowan. A summer job making a biological survey of Manning Park, which straddles the then new Hope-Princeton Highway, gave him ideas about interpretation. After graduation, he joined the Parks Division of the BC Forest Service. In 1957, with a small budget he hired a student as a park naturalist and, in an old tent, erected a nature house in Manning Park. Following this successful experiment, over the next few years the Parks Service funded the construction of a permanent building, more signage, nature trails, and the hiring of naturalists there and at several other sites, including Miracle Beach on Vancouver Island. Cannings rightly regrets the budget cuts and departmental reorganizations of the mid-1970s that ended the “halcyon days” of interpretation in BC parks (12) and the conversion of the “permanent” Nature House at Manning Park to a pub, although Edwards took consolation in the fact that beer is biological.

Before that happened, the Parks Branch briefly loaned Edwards to the provincial museum to assist in planning permanent exhibits for its new building. He already had a national reputation as an interpreter of natural history. A federal agency, the Canadian Wildlife Service, lured him to Ottawa where, for five years, he organized a proposed national program for wildlife centres. Under his direction, one, the Wye Marsh site at Midland, Ontario, came to fruition. It had a BC connection. Edwards employed Jean André, of provincial museum fame, and Ted Underhill, a former naturalist at Manning Park, to produce exhibits,

and he hired Bill Barkley, another former park naturalist, to manage it. In 1972, Edwards returned to Victoria as assistant director of the provincial museum, which was still developing its permanent exhibits. In 1975 he became its director and, in turn, was succeeded by Barkley. Edwards wrote more than four hundred papers and presentations. Many were purely scientific, but he was an eloquent philosopher with a sense of humour and a practical advocate of interpretation.

What is interpretation according to Edwards? In its simplest terms, he suggests that nature interpretation is: "opening the eyes of people," sharpening their noses, tuning their ears, and sensitizing their touch (125). In addition, it entertains them, introduces them "to new understanding," and inspires "them to go beyond the introduction on their own into what might be called education" (147). "Words," he asserts, "can be interpretive," but interpretation involves "things that you can see or smell or feel or operate" and that distinguishes interpretation from information (192). In short, the object is the thing.

Interpretation relies on interpreters – in most cases cited, these are park naturalists. Many papers and scripts were lectures to aspiring and practising park naturalists. In addition to having accurate local knowledge supported by research, Edwards insists that they must present it enthusiastically and in a non-technical manner. One of his best naturalists was Freeman King, "a kindly grandfather," "who never lost the zest and wonder of his own childhood" and had "a constant store of happy nonsense to instinctively relate things to people and to their lives at home" (247).

In many ways, the book is an introduction to museology and draws on actual experience, both successes and some failures. Given Edwards's career,

the collection is stronger on natural than human history, but, as he argues, "man is surely natural" (154) and "the important history is really historical human ecology" (176). Moreover, many principles of interpretation apply to both, although it is easier to interpret in a natural park than in a museum where the object "is, in a sense, incarcerated." He suggests compensating by such means as setting objects in dioramas and saying "something revealing" about them (270–71). Museum docents and tourist guides would benefit from reading his advice to interpreters.

In one section, the editors cleverly juxtapose typewritten extracts from Edwards's annual reports to the Park Branch with related essays. They include an account of what might have been, illustrated with sketches by park naturalist Raymond Barnes. Had Edwards been able to implement his dreams, there would be nature centres throughout the province featuring local resources or needs such as a cowboy museum for the Cariboo and a Fraser Valley farm for urban children.

Adding to the value of the book are the editors' explanatory annotations, well-chosen photographs, and a bibliography of Edwards's writings on interpretation. Although we cannot enjoy all the nature centres that Edwards envisioned, knowing the principles of interpretation allows an appreciation of the thought and research that lie behind successful presentations of natural and human history in the parks and museums we do have.

*Victoria Unbuttoned:  
A Red-Light History of  
BC's Capital City*

Linda J. Eversole

Victoria, BC: TouchWood Editions,  
2021. 224 pp. \$20.00 paper.

JANET NICOL  
*Vancouver*

LINDA J. EVERSOLE's first book, *Stella: Unrepentant Madam*, written in 2005, was praised for its academic value and readability. The author continues her exploration of women in the sex trade with *Victoria Unbuttoned*, profiling ten white women residing in the city from its earliest days to the First World War. A long-time Victoria resident, Eversole's knowledge of local history is enhanced by her work in research, heritage preservation, and museums for more than four decades. She explains the reason for her biographical approach in the book's introduction: "To understand the business of prostitution, it is necessary to explore the lives of those who practised it and to examine their relationship to the wider community around them" (14).

Women of diverse ethnicities are not among the ten profiles, the author pointing to a lack of primary sources and her lack of cultural understanding. She invites others to build on her research, however, and ensures that Victoria's racially diverse population is depicted as part of the historical context to the women's stories. Fort Victoria, founded in 1843, is shown as a place of pervasive racism, with a largely male workforce. Dancehalls and "disorderly houses" offered various forms of entertainment for the men, with newspapers reporting incidents involving "half-breeds" and

"Indians" (as mixed-race and Indigenous men and women were called) as well as Kanakas (a descriptor for labourers originally from Hawai'i). By the time British Columbia joined Confederation, Chinatown was well established, with prostitution operating within its segregated community.

Nettie Sager, the first of the ten women chronicled, arrived in Victoria in 1862 with a theatre troupe. Her biographical sketch, and the others that follow, relies heavily on police and court documents, newspaper accounts, genealogical databases, and coroner's reports. Most of these women travelled to Victoria from the United States, many having worked in the brothels of San Francisco. Other common threads among the women are the continual movement from residence to residence and the use of false names and occupations. They coped with an assortment of challenges, such as mental illness, drug and alcohol addiction, and male violence, their lives cut short as a result.

Illustrations throughout the book include five maps indicating where brothel properties were located. A small number of photographs of the women profiled are also shown and, in a few cases, so are snapshots of their gravestones, taken by the author and located in Victoria's Ross Bay Cemetery. Eversole was fortunate to garner information from descendants of four of the ten women portrayed.

Along with her dogged research, the author was watchful for the unexpected. Consider the fate of Dora Son, also known as Maud Lord. She came to the city from Vancouver by steamer in 1890 and was arrested two years later. Charged as a keeper of a brothel on Broughton Street, she was let off with a fifty-dollar fine and one day in jail. Lord was still living on Broughton Street when she died in 1898. "When a woman who was a resident of a brothel died, suicide was the

initial assumption,” the author states (93). In Lord’s case, however, the coroner gave the official cause of death as meningitis. Christina Haas was among the few to live into her seventies. She ran a brothel on Broughton Street starting in 1912, earning enough to build her own home on Cook Street. During the war years, she was harassed not only because of her work but also for her German surname. Haas persevered, returning to California in 1919, where she died in 1938, aged seventy-six. Eversole notes the similar life paths of Haas and Stella Carroll, the “unrepentant” madam depicted in her previous book and appearing briefly in *Victoria Unbuttoned*.

A spotlight on two male leaders of the Moral Reform movement provides more context for the women’s biographies, but equally instructive would have been the inclusion of middle- and working-class women’s attitudes towards prostitution. Suffragists were especially well organized during the war period and had much to say about women’s rights. Delving into the attitudes of working-class women performing female-designated jobs, such as dressmakers, waitresses, and retail clerks, could provide insights as well.

Society has ignored the past lives of same-sex couples, transgender people, and others who were considered outside the norm, the author observes, suggesting another marginalized group to be explored. Endnotes, an extensive bibliography (which includes several academic and popular histories), and an index follow the narration.

Eversole challenges assumptions and employs a non-judgmental approach to her research, delivering a fresh perspective on biographies of white women prostitutes in early Victoria. Her work inspires further research and serves to broaden the reader’s understanding of a segment of women workers still living on society’s margins.

*Paradise Won: The Struggle to Create Gwaii Haanas National Park Reserve*

Elizabeth May

Calgary: Rocky Mountain Press,  
2020. 328 pp. \$25.00 paper.

MADISON HESLOP  
*University of Washington*

KNOWING that *Paradise Won: The Struggle to Create Gwaii Haanas National Park Reserve* would end in the establishment of a park offers no relief from the sense of urgency that reading the book elicits. Usually, knowledge of the ending to a story dampens its emotional stakes, but Elizabeth May, before her days as Green Party leader, successfully wrote a highly informative chronicle of the campaign to end logging in what is now the Gwaii Haanas National Park Reserve. Based on a combination of interviews and May’s own personal experiences as a key contributor to the park’s foundation, the result is an ideal text for both university classrooms and book club reading lists.

As a regional historian of the Pacific Northwest, I am more often struck by the similarities between British Columbia and its US neighbours than by their differences, but this story presents a case in which difference was crucial. Almost from the start, I began crafting in my mind a syllabus that paired *Paradise Won* with journalist William Deitrich’s chronicle of the so-called Timber Wars in 1980s Washington, *The Final Forest: Big Trees, Forks, and the Pacific Northwest* (1992). Beyond their subject matter, the two books resemble one another in both structure and style; each made up of many short, highly readable, and evocative chapters that focus on a single person, event, question, or – quite significantly –

bird. The differences arise from the Haida First Nation's position within British Columbia and the profound connection, as seen in the words and actions of Haida leaders such as Guujaaw – Gary Edenshaw, between the protection of Gwaii Haanas from logging and Haida sovereignty and cultural resilience. For Haida leaders, creating a park was only ever a means to protect land and water under their stewardship, not an end in itself.

Chapter 10 offers *Paradise Won's* first major turning point and touches the heart of why environmental campaigns are fundamentally Indigenous issues. At the close of the chapter, Dr. David Suzuki, host of CBC's *The Nature of Things*, interviews Guujaaw for the show. When asked why Gwaii Haanas was so important to Haida people, and what might happen if the islands were logged off, Guujaaw answers, "If they're logged off, we'll probably end up the same as everyone else, I guess" (79). This response "*we'll probably end up the same as everyone else*," is precisely the motivation that seems to have prompted the republication of *Paradise Won*, three decades after its original release and with an appropriate new subtitle. Something resembling paradise was won in Gwaii Haanas, but Indigenous-led struggles to protect land and water in British Columbia and elsewhere remain as urgent as ever, and perhaps, as May hopes, this thirty-year-old victory can spur further triumphs in the future.

The halfway point, measured by chapters, bears the ominous title "In Which the Fight Is Nearly Won." It was at this juncture that the creation of a national park became the foremost strategy to end logging in the archipelago, and the main site of confrontation in the story began to shift away from the logging road to the government offices of Victoria and Ottawa. In this latter half of

the book, when the author herself enters the story, the contest between federal and provincial power becomes the greatest source of tension. The bureaucratic channels of government were never meant to produce the sensation of a thriller novel, but the closer *Paradise Won* gets to the story's end, the more credible seems May's assertion that establishing the national park reserve was little less than miraculous. "The wait is excruciating," I repeatedly told a friend as I turned the pages. One can only hope that the book's sense of urgency translates into action on the part of readers.

*Deep and Sheltered Waters:  
The History of Tod Inlet*

David R. Gray with a  
foreword by Nancy J. Turner  
and Robert D. Turner

Victoria, BC: Royal BC Museum,  
2020. 264 pp. \$29.95 paper.

JACQUELYN MILLER  
*University of Victoria*

**I**N *Deep and Sheltered Waters: The History of Tod Inlet*, David R. Gray – with a foreword by his long-time friends and colleagues, Nancy J. Turner and Robert D. Turner – sets out to illuminate "the vast wealth of the human and natural history" of the special place that is Tod Inlet, from the deep and sheltered waters of the inlet itself to the trails of Gowlland Tod Provincial Park and the renowned Butchart Gardens (1). On the one hand, he traces the history of the emergence of the cement industry at Tod Inlet (driven by Robert Butchart), its growing significance across the province, and its impacts on the local ecosystem. On the other hand, he weaves together

the places occupied in this history by its core constitutive communities: the WSÁNEĆ People and, in particular, the Tsartlip First Nation, whose ancestral territory covers Tod Inlet; the settler families who lived in the once-thriving but now-vanished village; and the Chinese and Sikh cement plant workers who “didn’t enjoy the ‘privilege’ of families” while they worked at the cement plant that was the impetus for the creation of the community that existed for more than half a century at Tod Inlet (42).

To tell the story of each of these communities, their relationships with one another, and the working conditions and socio-political status of each group of workers, Gray relies on a variety of methods. These include interviews with Tsartlip Elders, the descendants of former cement plant workers, and villagers as well as reviews of the findings of archeologists, memoirs kept by two women villagers from the time, and statistical and archival records, such as correspondence and photographs. Fittingly for a book published by the Royal British Columbia Museum, Gray intersperses an array of photographs that illustrate all elements of the story, enabling a deeper and wider range of learning about these histories than would otherwise be the case in 250 pages. The cover photo of Chinese and European labourers hand-pulling a rail car loaded with coal down the wharf to the cement plant is emblematic of the rich historical photos populating the volume.

The book is not about just one of Gray’s many research interests. The story is personal for him, as the culmination of much of his life’s work and passion, sparked by finding pig skulls with his brother in what remained of the Chinese village when they were boys. For more than fifty years, Gray dedicated himself to finding out more about the former

Chinese and Sikh residents. In recent decades, Gray joined other local residents in successfully opposing a major resort and residential development proposal and advocating for the history and ecology of Tod Inlet to be protected in what ultimately became the provincial park. Gray’s success in documenting and telling the compelling story of others from long ago is subtly balanced with his own place in the story.

An artist aboard the Canada C3 Expedition (which marked 150 years of Confederation) compared Gray’s storytelling about Tod Inlet to Jennie Butchart, who created beauty out of a scarred landscape: “As Canadians, we all need to understand the stories that give any given piece of geography within our borders its particular tenor and character. We will occupy it very differently when we do” (217). We should read Gray’s book not only to bring depth to a space we visit or think of fondly, but, just as important, to understand the history of who we are and have been, to remember a once thriving community that no longer exists, and to face challenging truths to which we are all connected as British Columbians.

*Big Promises, Small  
Government: Doing Less with  
Less in the BC Liberal New Era*

George M. Abbott

Vancouver: UBC Press, 2020.

278 pp. \$32.95.

STEPHEN PHILLIPS

*Langara College*

GEORGE ABBOTT was a cabinet minister for twelve years in the BC Liberal governments of Gordon Campbell and Christy Clark. In *Big*

*Promises, Small Government*, he reflects on his tenure in the first Campbell government (2001–05), a tumultuous period in which the province implemented budget and staffing cuts not seen since Bill Bennett's post-1983 Social Credit government. The book is based on Abbott's doctoral dissertation in political science, which he completed at the University of Victoria in 2019. As such, it provides a thoughtful and scholarly analysis of the BC Liberals' "New Era" first term, focusing on the deep cuts made to personal and corporate income taxes and the devastating effect they had on public programs and services. Unlike the published reflections of most ex-ministers, Abbott writes critically and sometimes scathingly of the government in which he served.

In the 2001 provincial election, the Liberals promised "dramatic tax cuts" that would pay for themselves by stimulating business investment and attracting capital from outside the province. The gambit failed. Instead, the effect of reducing taxes by \$2 billion – most of it the result of a 25 percent cut in personal income tax – was to nearly double the province's budget deficit to \$4.4 billion in 2002 (195n). In Abbott's view, Campbell's decision to cut taxes so deeply was "ill-timed and ill-conceived" because the province had already entered a period of reduced economic growth and declining government revenues. Given the government's avowed intention to balance the budget by 2004–05, the result was a draconian "self-induced austerity" (178–79). All ministries, with the exception of health, education, and advanced education, were to reduce their budgets by an average of 35 percent. Staff cuts of up to 11,700 – one-third of the civil service – were also announced. Since the exempt ministries accounted for 70 percent of overall spending, the brunt

of the cuts was to be borne by resource and social service ministries, including Abbott's own Ministry of Community, Aboriginal, and Women's Services. There was, he writes, "an inequitable distribution of pain in the BC Liberal New Era" (85).

In addition to meeting onerous budget targets, ministries were also required to undertake "core reviews," ostensibly to determine what functions they should or should not be carrying out. Inspired by the principles of the New Public Management (NPM) embraced by Margaret Thatcher in the UK and David Lange in New Zealand, Campbell required his ministers to pursue deregulation, devolution, outsourcing of services, public-private partnerships, and the like. While the premier exhorted ministry officials to study and emulate NPM policies of other jurisdictions, they had no time for reflection. As one former deputy minister put it, "whole programs were wiped out with very little forethought, other than the urgent need to meet targets, or else" (112).

Abbott adds to previous studies of the Campbell government, such as David Beers's *Liberalized* and J.R. Lacharite and Tracy Summerville's *The Campbell Revolution?*, by exposing the inner workings of the provincial state as ministers and civil servants struggled to meet the sometimes contradictory demands that were made of them. He contrasts the successful reorganization of health authorities, carried out by the new Ministry of Health Planning, for which adequate funding and staff was allocated, with the fraught efforts of the Ministry of Children and Family Development to regionalize family services in the face of a 23 percent budget cut and the loss of ministry staff (57–59).

Separate chapters recount the experience of three social ministries – the Ministry of Human Resources

(MHR), the Ministry of Children and Family Development (MCFD), and the Ministry of Community, Aboriginal, and Women's Services (MCAWS) – and the “cascading effects” wrought by budget cuts across programs and ministries. For example, cuts to child-care funding drove MCAWS to reduce the income threshold for child-care subsidies; as a result, nine thousand families lost their subsidy, forcing some of them to give up child-care spaces. This policy, combined with a new policy at MHR requiring single mothers on welfare to seek work when their youngest child was three years old (instead of seven), undermined MCFD's aim of enhancing the capacity of families to care for their children while “exacerb[at]ing the risk of children being taken into care” (140–41). In one of the most arresting passages, Abbott quotes from the 2006 Hughes Report, which found that, when the Office of Children's Commissioner was abolished and responsibility for reviewing child deaths was transferred to an already overburdened Coroner's Office, the deaths of 955 children were not properly reviewed. To Abbott, this exemplified “an appalling, budget-driven attenuation of services to the province's most vulnerable children” (176).

*Big Promises, Small Government* should be of special interest to students of public policy and public administration. But it also deserves a wider readership. Clearly written and displaying the dry wit for which Abbott was renowned during his years in public life, the book provides an insightful account of the first of Gordon Campbell's three terms of office, the last of which was cut short in 2011 by the HST imbroglio. While Abbott's former cabinet colleagues may be dismayed by his apostasy, BC Liberals would do well to heed his warnings about the consequences of improvident tax policies.

## REFERENCES

- Beers, David, ed. 2005. *Liberalized: The Tyee Report on British Columbia under Gordon Campbell's Liberals*. Vancouver: New Star Books.
- Hughes, E.N. 2006. *BC Children and Youth Review: An Independent Review of BC's Child Protection System*. Victoria, BC: Ministry of Children and Family Development.
- Lacharite, J.R., and Tracy Summerville, eds. 2017. *The Campbell Revolution? Politics, Power, and Policies in British Columbia*. Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press.