

unnecessarily thin in explanatory surround, particularly in the area of photographic history, including aesthetics. Aesthetics should not be neglected for, finally, these photographs may be read as a silent restatement of the age-old idea that humans are essentially art-making creatures, whether white photographers or Indian weavers and carvers.

*University of Toronto*

ALAN THOMAS

*History of Music in British Columbia 1850-1950*, by Dale McIntosh. Victoria: Sono Nis Press, 1989. Pp. 296; bibliography, index, photographs.

Dale McIntosh's *History of Music in British Columbia 1850-1950* is the first scholarly, monograph-length, regional music history to be published in Canada. Its appearance could herald a new stage in our awareness of our cultural selves — one that owes less to a narrative of national identity and more to local experience as the theatre of meaning.

The author chooses to focus on the traditional institutions of European classical music: the wind band (which receives the most expansive chapter), choral organizations, orchestras, theatrical companies, education, and musical festivals. His final chapter, "A Musical Potpourri," provides briefer descriptions of a fascinating range of other subjects, including instrument building, musical clubs, music publication, jazz, chamber music, dance bands, theatre music, and composition. Five of the chapters end with a useful checklist of organizations (Chapters 1-3) or works (Chapters 4 and 7). Within each chapter, a wealth of detail about who did what, where, and when is unfolded, not only for major cities such as Vancouver or Victoria but also for many smaller cities and regions. With a primarily geographic sub-organizational scheme, the sub-regional histories embedded within this provincial one go far to challenge the prevailing stereotype that the energy centres of Canada's music culture are exclusively the large cities. Twenty-eight plates of photographs complement and enliven the text of each chapter; perhaps a second edition of the book could provide an index of these.

McIntosh has an eye/ear for good anecdotes and, it seems, British Columbia has had a share of interesting and occasionally even unsavoury characters, ranging from the elusive Henry Green, the conductor who wouldn't be photographed, to the swindlers, choir director Charles Schaffer or orchestral conductor Ed Leewards (and "Mama"). We learn of idiosyncratic performance practices (the euphonium player who conducted with his foot, or the conductor who threatened to fine his players

a case of beer if they failed to observe a rest) and practical jokes (the bandsmen who put limburg cheese on the brass mouthpieces or the pit piano player whose large nose got caught by an on-stage whip in a musical theatre production). The anecdotes convey a more rough and tumble nineteenth- and early twentieth-century musical society than that represented in other Canadian music histories. We seem to learn less, on the other hand, about the lives of the important musicians whose careers were perhaps less coloured by humorous or unsavoury events. Perhaps subsequent publications by McIntosh might provide more biographical and sociological contextualization for such major figures as William Haynes, Archibald McMurdo, Stanley Bulley, Reginald Hincks, or Basil Horsfall.

As McIntosh is clearly aware (see his Preface), the choice of emphasis and the organizational scheme selected for any written document creates its own biases. This book, like any other, should be read with these in mind. The focus on the traditional European performance institutions, for example, has precluded extensive discussion of informal, amateur music making. Similarly, large institutions (orchestras, choirs, bands) are privileged over small ones (chamber groups). Through its dedication to Anglo-based music, the book provides little about other ethnic traditions (except for Indian communities that developed bands or other “mainstream” ensembles, and for tantalizing hints about a Chinese funeral, the German Sing Verein [*sic*] or Les enfan[ts] de Paris). A more accurate title such as “A History of Anglo-related music . . .” could perhaps have acknowledged the bounds of the subject matter.

Another bias manifests itself in the generic focus, especially as regards chronology. Composition is given extremely short shrift (five pages of prose plus a checklist of compositions “indigenous to British Columbia”). Furthermore, while the title’s chronological limit of 1950 is overly modest for most of the book — all other realms of activity are, in fact, surveyed up to the mid-1980s — composition is strictly limited to pre-1950 work. In view of the flourishing of compositional activity in the province in the past forty years, this leaves an impression of less creative vitality than is the case. While the enormity of discussing post-1950 composition may, indeed, have expanded the monograph to an unrealistic dimension, the imbalance of up-to-date information about performance, music drama, and education with delimited “period” information about composition is hard to fathom.

McIntosh describes his interest “in music as a social phenomenon and its contribution to the cultural framework of this province” (11). While “society” is sometimes hidden behind the name lists, there is considerable information here about the values and social structures integral to British

Columbia's music history. In relation to the music cultures of other regions of Canada, this reviewer is struck by the following: the extent of large ensemble activity (especially bands) in native Indian communities, the instances of special forms of patronage (e.g., company ensembles or even resistance to advertising in concert programmes), the structuring and valuing of competition within and outside of music festivals, innovative social structures such as that of the Arion club with "active" and "associate" members, mechanisms for cultural co-operation among communities (especially in the Okanagan Valley), the emotional support for such organizations as TUTS, the vitality of youth groups (a subject to which McIntosh, as a "music education" professor, is no doubt attuned). I would welcome critical analyses of these topics. The author might have devoted more space to "why" and "how" in addition to "who, what, where, when."

Perhaps because it breaks from the subject constraints imposed, in part, by the focus on institutional structures, the last chapter, "A Musical Potpourri," raises some of the most significant topics for a socio-musicological survey. The extent of instrument-making (though perhaps, at this point, we need to examine Sabathil's definition of "authenticity" with more care) and the important role of musical clubs suggest that separate chapters might be warranted for these topics.

Scholars will want more extensive documentation than McIntosh provides. His decision to footnote only quotations leaves us wondering about the source and hence accuracy of many anecdotes and facts. His bibliography does not include a list of interviewees (were the interviews taped?); nor is the location of all manuscript material indicated. Were all the newspapers listed on page 269 indexed for music entries? If such an index has been computerized by McIntosh, this would be a rich source of information for subsequent scholarly work.

In a future edition one could hope for the correct spelling of Bruno Walter's name (consistently "Walther" in this printing) and for the elimination of duplicated lines on page 226. These details, however, do not detract from the overriding importance of the book.

No doubt, all future research on British Columbia's music culture will start from McIntosh, and music scholars in other provinces will find much valuable comparative material as well as useful structural models for parallel studies. Finally, we should reiterate that this book displays fundamentally that Canada's music culture is richly textured on provincial and regional levels and is not the monopoly of a few urban centres.