

the hard mountains, and the immense sky" of the Prairie west, he incongruously includes views of rain forests and sea coasts.

These general faults are paralleled by factual inaccuracies and an amazing lack of discrimination. J. W. G. Macdonald is made a member of the Group of Seven (a confusion, presumably, with J. E. H. Macdonald). Emily Carr did not study in England from 1889 to 1904 (an uncritical transcription of a typographical error from the Carr centenary catalogue). Paintings, most notably those of Carr, are misdated.

Finally, Render shows little discrimination in discussing or selecting the paintings reproduced. The varying *quality* of the pictures is left undiscerned. A Belmore Browne is discussed in virtually the same tone as a Marmaduke Matthews. And Render insists on illustrating pictures that simply do not deserve to be reproduced. Is the Glenbow proud that it has some of Walter J. Phillips' worst?

It is a pity that such an expensive book with such reproduction possibilities suffers from so many faults. Aside from looking at its uneven illustrations, it is a work to be avoided by those eager to learn about western Canadian art.

MARIA TIPPETT

"Gambling Music of the Coast Salish Indians," by Wendy Bross Stuart. *Ethnology Division, Mercury Series*, Paper No. 9. Ottawa: National Museum of Man, 1972. 114 pp.

This volume originated as a Master's thesis in the Department of Music at the University of British Columbia. Stuart undertook the field work with the aid of the National Museum, which now has published her report as a paper in its Mercury Series designed specifically to make such research reports available speedily to the interested public. The study is primarily a descriptive treatment of 194 bone-gambling songs recorded at five gatherings of native people in the Coast Salish area in the summers of 1970 and 1971. The title of this paper notwithstanding, six of the songs recorded and presented were sung, presumably, by Yakima Indians and were found to be distinctly non-Salish in style.

The major portion of the paper, some 88 pages, is given over to the transcriptions and analyses of 65 songs in the following order: transcription, note by note with the accompanying meaningless syllables and/or percussion plus information on the pitch; contour, melodic range, scale,

form, polyphony, and other occasions on which the same song was sung. The reader should note that while no song with meaningful lyrics was recorded by Stuart for this study, such songs do indeed exist, both within and outside of the Coast Salish area. It would have proved interesting, and quite possibly significant, had Stuart been able to provide information on the membership of the group singing, and on most especially the lead singer. Such identification would indicate whether there was any correlation between his/her presence and the occasions on which the particular song was sung.

The next section, Part III, is a summary of the characteristics of the songs, with a detailed charting of the use of scales in 77 songs, followed by a table listing the frequency of repetition of the songs discussed in the paper.

Stuart presents these portions devoted to the analysis of the music itself clearly and authoritatively. They form, of course, her main concern. Unfortunately, the presentation is marred by the brief and sometimes inaccurate Part I, meant to lay before the reader the cultural setting of the gambling games of which the *slahal* (or *lehal*) songs form an integral part. Stuart first describes the mechanics of the seating arrangement of the players and the hand motions which communicate the guesser's judgement as to the disposition of the bones, hidden within the hands of two players on the opposing side.

It is when the author leaves the realm of the purely descriptive and makes some conclusions about the non-material culture that she errs. Several of her comments merit critical attention. Stuart writes:

... Ownership of songs, while not uncommon on the North Pacific Coast, implies that the songs involved are of a private or spiritual nature. It seems fairly obvious that if these songs were truly private, they would *not* be sung at public festivals where people like myself could record, transcribe and analyse them. After such treatment, *any* song would certainly be divested of power. (pp. 12-13)

First, the word "private" is not well suited to the discussion; "personal" is perhaps what the author meant. Ownership of hereditary songs, such as, for example, among Wakashan-speaking people, necessitated periodic public display of such verbal material in order to validate the owner's claim to it. The owner alone, or occasionally a relative having the owner's permission, could rightfully sing the song. In the Coast Salish area Spirit songs were sung at certain gatherings during the Winter Dance season. The Dancer would initiate the song, to be taken up by others in a prescribed order. That the Dancer manifested his power through his song

and dancing made clear to the audience his right to that particular configuration and expression.

Secondly, that songs are sung at gatherings of primarily Indian people does not imply that the audience should be taping these songs, nor that they are encouraged to, nor that such behaviour is even welcomed by the Indian participants. Some field researchers have noted that behaviour such as taping, tolerated in a native observer, is frowned upon in a non-native, and sometimes subtly or openly commented on or even actively discouraged. That no one stopped Stuart from taping could also mean that native people did not overtly dissuade her or that she did not pick up the cues which might have been presented to her.

Thirdly, Stuart treats superficially the most complex issue of "power," leading to the conclusion that it would dissipate should the song be sung in public. There is no evidence that this is the case. To the contrary: as mentioned above, public validation is often a necessary concomitant of the individual's possession of power.

For the proper cultural background for the gambling games, the reader would do better to look to other sources of information. Lynn Maranda's M.A. Thesis, "Coast Salish Gambling Games" (University of British Columbia, 1972) concentrates on a full description of the slehel game plus a discussion of the "power" concept, while Wayne Suttles' dissertation "Economic Life of the Coast Salish of Haro and Rosario Straits" (University of Washington, 1951) and J. E. M. Kew's "Coast Salish Ceremonial Life: Status and Identity in a Modern Village" (University of Washington, 1970) provide a detailed picture of the cultural setting, both historical and contemporary, in which the slehel game functions.

*British Columbia Provincial Museum*

BARBARA S. EFRAT

*Themes on Pacific Lands*, M.C.R. Edgell and B. H. Farrell, eds. Western Geographical Series, Volume 10. Harold D. Foster, series editor. Victoria, B.C.: University of Victoria, 1974. xvii and 311 pp.

*Themes on Pacific Lands* is the tenth in an attractively produced paperback series from the Department of Geography, University of Victoria. It contains eight articles, all written by present or former members of the department. Three deal with British Columbia: Michael Edgell compares social demands on the forest environments of coastal B.C. and Victoria, Australia; Malcolm Micklewright looks at government involve-