

a major region, the city inhabitants of which profoundly affect surrounding non-urban land uses via food demands, recreation, weekend cottages, hobby farms and the scatteration of subdivisions. Political fragmentation is stultifying, and a multitude of single-purpose authorities, and even the GVRD (Greater Vancouver Regional District), as presently constituted, are not enough. As with the fragmentation of port control, planning control of the post-industrial city requires a responsible, responsive, accountable planning authority for the entire urban-rural region.

One of the first acts of such a regional authority should be, Hardwick states, the designation of one or two new office-based "downtowns," for example at New Westminster. This might go far towards the retention of local identity in the multinucleate urban region of the future. The public's appraisal of such a plan is not yet apparent, and cannot be discounted. The planner of the future, while having one ear attuned to "planners' solutions" such as cluster development, is likely to be in the rather schizoid position of having the other ear pinned down at grassroots level. As James Lorimer's *Citizen's Guide to City Politics* suggests, Hardwick has proved reasonably successful at this difficult balancing feat.

Vancouver, whether used primarily by urban geographer or politicized citizen, remains also a personal testament in the modern humanist planning tradition. The book ends with some indication of areas of conflict in the future and pleads that we bestir ourselves to ensure the development of a high quality urban-rural environment for the Vancouver metropolitan region. This surely is better than continuing to get the environment we deserve.

University of Victoria

J. DOUGLAS PORTEOUS

The Mountains and the Sky, by Lorne E. Render. Calgary: Glenbow-Alberta Institute with McClelland and Stewart West, 1974. 223 pp., illus., \$27.50.

The Mountains and the Sky, written by Lorne E. Render, Director of Exhibitions at the Glenbow-Alberta Institute, and published by Glenbow and McClelland and Stewart West, is a handsome book of quality reproduction and printing. "Every painting," the introduction tells us, "is from Glenbow's collection." Though in some areas the Institute's collection is extensive, it is not vast enough to offer "a composite picture of how a number of exceptional artists have looked at and recorded an expressive

and multiform environment." A glance at the four chapters reveals the gaps in the collection, made the more apparent by the author's lack of conceptualization, discrimination, theme and scholarship.

"It was not until the middle of the nineteenth century," Render begins the first chapter, "that travellers began compiling a visual record of the environment of western Canada." This incredible statement entirely overlooks the extensive recording of the Pacific coast and its aboriginal inhabitants by British, Spanish and American maritime explorers of the eighteenth century. The fact that Glenbow's collection does not include examples of the brilliant watercolours of Cook's John Webber, Malaspina's José Cardero or Vancouver's quarter-deck artists does not excuse such an opening. Further along the same page is the claim that H. J. Warre was "the first person ever to portray" the Rocky Mountains, simply ignoring David Thompson's sketches which precede Warre's by almost four decades. That R. B. Nevitt and George S. Brodie, together with Paul Kane, George A. Frost and James M. Alden, could be considered by the author to represent "the cross section of landscape art that developed prior to the 1880's in western Canada" is both incorrect and dangerously misleading to those unaware of the early expeditionary artists or of such an individual artist as W. G. R. Hind. Though the author told us in the introduction that *The Mountains and the Sky* was "not a history of western Canadian art or of landscape art," he has, by the sweepingly incorrect generalizations in the first chapter, begun to write a bad one.

The second chapter follows this regrettable pattern. Errors continue from minutia such as the number of trips Marmaduke Matthews made to the Rockies (at least ten, not two), to a dangerously misleading confusion of CPR "commissions" with what were usually just free passes. But the generalization continues its frustrating pattern of being either hopelessly vague or simply wrong. These artists who visited the west after the 1880s, Render would have us believe, were somehow "more interested in the landscape for its own sake," presumably because they were less realistic, less topographical, more emotionally responsive than were their predecessors. But his pictures are hardly convincing and one wonders why "the true *artistic* expression of the West" begins with these later visitors rather than with Kane, Hind or F. A. Verner. Quite wrong is the statement that these painters were professional by training.

In the first two chapters Render has set the stage for "The First Residents," whom he sees offering by 1920 "a completely new body of art, a new expression of the continually changing spectrum of colour, space

and forms." What we see in Chapter III, however, is not a new body of art but a continuation of the old adjacent to the new — that is, artists representing nineteenth century traditions (as do Sara Mary Blake, John Innes, A. F. L. Kenderline and Thomas W. Fripp) are integrated with Walter J. Phillips, Ina D. D. Uthoff and Charles H. Scott, artists aware of early twentieth century developments in England and France. These artists have been lumped together not because they offer "a completely new body of art" but for the artificial reason that, unlike their contemporaries in the next chapter, they lived but were not born in the West.

Graver than such false grouping is the limitation imposed by the collection. Render has written a chapter on art of the 1920s without mentioning L. L. FitzGerald, W. P. Weston, and the artists of the Group of Seven, all of whom had a most profound influence on western Canadian painting.

The concluding chapter, "Contemporary Views," combines such divergent artists as Emily Carr, Maxwell Bates, W. L. Stevenson, Illingworth Kerr, D. Otto Rogers and Wynona Mulcaster — merely because they are native born. Their "desire to interpret the land with a deeper, more profound insight than had ever been done before," Render feels, "might well be considered the definitive quality of the contemporary artist."

Render ends this final chapter with a three-paragraph summation of the book. Once more the generalizations grate. He states that "it was not until the early nineteenth century that the landscape assumed an important role, and artists began studying and interpreting it as a subject in its own right." Grandiosely attempting to make western Canadian painting a microcosm of the development of western landscape painting, he concludes that "landscape painting as a pure form is scarcely older than some of the earliest representations of western Canada included in this book." Since the earliest reproductions are Kane oils done sometime after 1845 we are witness to a marvel of historical foreshortening. It is here, in general context and significance, that Render is weakest. He could have considered what it was like for European-trained Paul Kane to paint a Canadian landscape when his only convention for it was drawn from the Italianate and Hudson River schools. This exciting concept — the transference of perceptual conventions from one region to another — is given little serious consideration by the author.

The structural faults of this book are legion — absurd generalizations, lack of concept or theme, omissions and the failure to acknowledge them. There is not even a consistent and clear idea of what is the Canadian west itself. Into a book basically about "infinite prairies, the rolling hills,

the hard mountains, and the immense sky" of the Prairie west, he incongruously includes views of rain forests and sea coasts.

These general faults are paralleled by factual inaccuracies and an amazing lack of discrimination. J. W. G. Macdonald is made a member of the Group of Seven (a confusion, presumably, with J. E. H. MacDonald). Emily Carr did not study in England from 1889 to 1904 (an uncritical transcription of a typographical error from the Carr centenary catalogue). Paintings, most notably those of Carr, are misdated.

Finally, Render shows little discrimination in discussing or selecting the paintings reproduced. The varying *quality* of the pictures is left undiscerned. A Belmore Browne is discussed in virtually the same tone as a Marmaduke Matthews. And Render insists on illustrating pictures that simply do not deserve to be reproduced. Is the Glenbow proud that it has some of Walter J. Phillips' worst?

It is a pity that such an expensive book with such reproduction possibilities suffers from so many faults. Aside from looking at its uneven illustrations, it is a work to be avoided by those eager to learn about western Canadian art.

MARIA TIPPETT

"Gambling Music of the Coast Salish Indians," by Wendy Bross Stuart. *Ethnology Division, Mercury Series, Paper No. 9*. Ottawa: National Museum of Man, 1972. 114 pp.

This volume originated as a Master's thesis in the Department of Music at the University of British Columbia. Stuart undertook the field work with the aid of the National Museum, which now has published her report as a paper in its Mercury Series designed specifically to make such research reports available speedily to the interested public. The study is primarily a descriptive treatment of 194 bone-gambling songs recorded at five gatherings of native people in the Coast Salish area in the summers of 1970 and 1971. The title of this paper notwithstanding, six of the songs recorded and presented were sung, presumably, by Yakima Indians and were found to be distinctly non-Salish in style.

The major portion of the paper, some 88 pages, is given over to the transcriptions and analyses of 65 songs in the following order: transcription, note by note with the accompanying meaningless syllables and/or percussion plus information on the pitch; contour, melodic range, scale,