

manuscript written [from 1980 to 1991] by MacMillan's grandson, the late Harvey Southam" (p. 14). Two collections of H.R. MacMillan's papers, one personal, the other corporate, constitute the other major source. From these materials Drushka has drawn many insightful quotations that allow us to hear MacMillan's voice on a wide range of issues. However, the author is much less comfortable with "secondary" literature relating to the historical context within which MacMillan operated. A case in point is Drushka's handling of MacMillan's enthusiastic support for the recommendations of the Kidd Commission, which in July 1932 suggested draconian cutbacks to government expenditures and a weakening of democratic institutions as the provincial government's response to the Great Depression. Historical literature on the relationship between business and government across North America in the 1920s and 1930s is extensive, and includes a fine master's thesis by Robert Groves on the "business government" of Simon Fraser Tolmie in British Columbia from 1928 to 1933. Reference to it might have broadened our understanding of whether MacMillan's antipathy to government was unique to the man, or a product of his class.

HR: A Biography of H.R. MacMillan presents a well-written and engaging portrait of a very influential British Columbian. Drushka succeeds admirably in telling the story of a forest industry leader and, through MacMillan's biography, of the industry itself in its formative years. The book is highly accessible to the general reader yet suggests many possibilities for additional research in the fields of British Columbian business and forest history. The latter may be its enduring legacy.

University of British Columbia

ROBERT A.J. MCDONALD

Logging the Globe, by M. Patricia Marchak. Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queens University Press, 1995. 404 pp. \$49.95 cloth, \$19.95 paper.

In *Logging the Globe*, Marchak takes on the global manifestations of themes she first explored in *Green Gold*, her seminal contribution to the study of forest-imbedded communities. The new book sweeps broadly over the forest industry and society from its roots in industrialized Scandinavia to the timber-mining invasions of tropical rain forests and the establishment of fast-growing plantations on natural grasslands and degraded secondary forests in the Southern Hemisphere. Case studies of five producing regions (British Columbia, Thailand, Indonesia, Brazil, and Chile) and one consuming region (Japan) comprise the data and illustrate the broader points.

The power of the book comes as it draws links between communities separated by thousands of kilometres and great spans of culture. For example, Marchak demonstrates how logs exported from the US Pacific Northwest pressure rural Japanese communities traditionally dependent on forest-

products manufacturing. These social effects of globalization are as important as are the more-studied economic ones (e.g., Perez-Garcia's work showing that environmentally related harvest reductions in the US Pacific Northwest largely show up as increased harvests elsewhere in the world and that the total area logged each year actually rises as a consequence of the relatively high timber volumes found in the Pacific Northwest). Understanding such linkages is critical as we examine domestic policies about our own forests. Think globally while acting locally.

For readers of *BC Studies*, Marchak's analysis of British Columbia might be of greatest interest. She describes the situation as that of a "captured state," where Crown lands (which comprise about 95 per cent of all the forest land in the province) nominally managed in the public interest are actually controlled by companies through a client provincial government and captured bureaucracy. While my own personal experience and study of forestry in the province dates only to the beginning of this decade, a wide body of facts appears to falsify this interpretation. For example, in 1988 the conservative Social Credit government of the day unilaterally and without compensation "clawed back" 5 per cent of all volume promised under replaceable timber licences, and changed the terms of the licences with the effect of adding over \$500 million in costs not previously agreed to. And again, in 1994, the provincial government — this time a socialist one — increased stumpage payments by an estimated \$450 million, added at least a similar amount in new regulatory costs, and further weakened the property rights embodied in long-term tenures. Over a full business cycle, the returns to capital in the BC forest sector are now so low that securities analysts publicly question the wisdom of investing in it. It is difficult to reconcile these facts with Marchak's client-state characterization of the situation in BC.

Similarly, Marchak talks of BC's "seriously depleted timber reserves" (p. 116). No doubt the province faces serious challenges in managing its forests. Yet of the sixty million hectares of forest she mentions at the chapter's beginning, perhaps some eight to nine million hectares have ever been logged (and some of this total has already been logged more than once). At current harvest rates, it will take nearly a century to cut the timber now standing on the so-called "productive, operable" lands, a category which includes not even half the total forest land base. Also ignored by Marchak is the fact that, in the last thirty years, the area of forest in BC over 100 years old has actually *increased* by about seven million hectares. And each day brings new evidence that BC's secondary forests will grow at much higher rates than have been envisioned in virtually all of our timber supply planning. In short, the analysis of British Columbia relies far too heavily on a conventional but contrafactual wisdom.

Ironically, the current restrictions on timber supply in the province derive from the policies of the government Marchak claims is controlled by the companies. While there is no absolute shortage of economically attractive timber to harvest, much of it is indeed unavailable either because of

bureaucratically determined rules putatively designed to protect environmental values or because of the enormously complex administrative structure standing between the right to log and the roar of the chainsaw.

The book contains numerous minor errors, ranging from the misspelling of names to incorrect mathematical units. A scholar of Marchak's stature deserves better editing than this.

In the end, Marchak asks about communities, "are they worth saving?" She answers: "Human life may depend on the survival of communities as much as trees depend on larger ecosystems . . . Real economic development . . . will depend on creating economic capacities that sustain, not just individuals, but more—viable human communities." No thoughtful person will disagree with this objective. *Logging the Globe* is brilliant when Marchak sticks to this theme but falters when she strays into the less familiar territory of economics and forestry. Hold your breath in those sections, and learn from the book what is good.

University of British Columbia

CLARK S. BINKLEY

All Possible Worlds: Utopian Experiments in British Columbia, by Justine Brown. Vancouver: New Star, 1995. 96 p. Illus. \$16 paper.

British Columbia has been the location of many communities founded to practise versions of the good life, most of them known only to the residents, their neighbours, and an unsympathetic government. This short book provides a popular introduction to a range of these communities.

The author makes it clear that in trying to understand these communities she is also coming to grips with her own childhood on one of them, and the best sections by far are those in which she deals with the communities from the "Sixties." This is also where she had original sources with which to work and, as a result, adds to what had been known.

The book is both uneven and unsure of what it is. The Sixties material is the outline of a serious contribution to scholarship; the rest is a quick survey of communities ranging from the almost unknown to the widely studied. But, given only ninety-six pages, the author covers a lot of ground.

Brown begins with Metlakatla, a late nineteenth-century community among the Tsimshian led by an Anglican lay minister, which strikes me as a bit out of place since it was a missionary created community. But, while the imposition of Victorian dress, a choir of Tsimshian singing the Messiah, and a Tsimshian brass band clearly says that this is a colonial "utopian experiment," it is a powerful reminder that our conceptions of what constitutes significant improvement change over time. Metlakatla is also striking because, when we look at so much Sixties and post-Sixties communitarianism, we see the colonizers trying to adopt a romanticized version of the way