

BOOK REVIEWS

Death or Deliverance: Canadian Courts Martial in the Great War

Teresa Iacobelli

Vancouver: UBC Press, 2013. 192 pp.
\$32.95 paper.

CHRIS MADSEN

Canadian Forces College, Toronto

IN THE SUMMER of 1919, newspapers in several communities in British Columbia printed special victory editions with honour rolls of soldiers and airmen who died or returned wounded from serving on the Western Front during the First World War. The province's contribution to the war effort was significant. War industries produced shells and ships, while recruiting in British Columbia was the highest per capita in relation to other regions of Canada. One out of every eight eligible males enlisted for overseas service, the official count standing at 498,375 nationwide by November 1918. Canada's armed forces, until the controversial introduction of conscription in 1917, comprised volunteers drawn from cities, towns, and the rural countryside. Few men were prepared for the rigours and

terror of combat that awaited them in France and Belgium, where horrible conditions and the threat of death abounded. In some cases, soldiers decided to run away from danger or fall out of the ranks at opportune times behind the front lines. Such actions invited charges of desertion and cowardice that were tried before courts martial, an integral part of a military justice system that enforced discipline and good behaviour among troops within the Canadian Corps, in which many British Columbians served. Unlike today, death was an available punishment if one was convicted for these types of military service offences.

Teresa Iacobelli, a Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council postdoctoral fellow at Queen's University, presents the rationale and background behind more than two hundred cases in which death sentences were passed on Canadian soldiers, including twenty-five actually executed. The First World War has fascinated historians interested in social memory and public remembrance, and this book follows those approaches. Iacobelli skilfully sets the Canadian experience within broader political and historical debates about the justness of executing soldiers during

wartime, and she considers subsequent pardons and attempts at redress. She challenges many assumptions that have been made about the working of military justice on the Western Front, especially concerning Canadians. She draws comparisons with the British, French, and Australian armed forces to show the relative commonality of Canadian military justice under war conditions. Whether or not a defaulting soldier was tried and executed was highly situational and depended on the operational context, the attitudes of superior officers, and perceptions of potential disciplinary breakdown within individual units and formations. Death sentences in the majority of cases were suspended or remitted by convening authorities to lesser terms of imprisonment or other punishment.

Court martial records offer a rich source of documentary evidence into the lives of common soldiers, including the charge sheet, a convening order listing the members of the military panel, a transcript of proceedings, any appeals regarding mitigation of sentence, and reviews conducted by convening and superior authorities. The soldiers tried were typically lower in rank, and few other sources exist for them besides nominal rolls and personnel files that provide basic dates of recruitment, training, wounds, and disciplinary offences. Many of these are now available online through Library and Archives Canada. Iacobelli mines available records in Ottawa to build her argument and to provide insights into the soldiers sentenced to death by military authorities. That said, records of courts martial have limitations and should be used carefully. The offenders were a self-selecting representative sample of a broader population that, for the most part, stayed out of disciplinary trouble. In fact, application of military

justice usually says more about institutional responses than it does about the actual incidence of crime or criminal behaviour offending military norms. As well, court martial records take the serious researcher only so far before the trail runs cold. Iacobelli, on several occasions, merely notes that individual soldiers were released in 1919 and provides no further details as to their eventual fate or return to civilian life. With the passing of the last veterans, oral histories are no longer possible. While Iacobelli identifies soldiers from Ontario and Quebec, the number of British Columbians sentenced to death before courts martial remains unclear.

Iacobelli has produced a book that will interest general readers as the centenary of the First World War begins, and it will engage specialists in the historical dimensions of military law in the Canadian context. The names of any soldiers from British Columbia who faced execution by the nation and military that sent them abroad to fight deserve a place on the honour rolls. They were ordinary men put into trying and exceptional circumstances.

*Raymond Collishaw and the
Black Flight*

Roger Gunn

Toronto: Dundurn Press, 2013.
272 pp. \$26.99 paper.

ANDREW IAROCCI

University of Western Ontario

RAYMOND Collishaw (1893-1976), a native of Nanaimo, began his career in uniform as a teenager with the Canadian Fisheries Protection Service. In 1915, Collishaw volunteered

for the Royal Naval Air Service (RNAS). He qualified as a pilot in early 1916, embarking on a career in military aviation that was to last until 1943, when he retired from the Royal Air Force (RAF) with the rank of air vice marshal. During the First World War, Collishaw flew with the RNAS until it was amalgamated with the British Army's Royal Flying Corps (RFC) to form the RAF in 1918.

In *Raymond Collishaw and the Black Flight*, Roger Gunn focuses primarily on Collishaw's experience during and immediately after the First World War, a conflict that took him from Canada to Britain to the Western Front, and then to Russia and Mesopotamia. Gunn addresses Collishaw's interwar and Second World War service only briefly, in an epilogue.

Employing a heavily narrative approach, Gunn leads the reader through Collishaw's various wartime postings while illuminating some key themes in his career. In particular, Gunn's rendering of Collishaw's war service sheds light on the material culture of First World War flying and the everyday routine of the aircrew. Readers who are familiar with Great War aviation will be reminded that surviving flight training was a feat in itself, not to mention two or three years of active operations.

Drawing on primary evidence from Library and Archives Canada, Gunn also cites a broad selection of memoirs and other published material. Scholarly readers will note that lengthy tracts of the text are less than fully cited, a deficiency that obscures Gunn's specific use of evidence at many points. Gunn also makes rather frequent use of lengthy block quotes from primary and secondary sources, which tends to interrupt the narrative flow. A portion of these might well have been cut back or paraphrased.

This study leaves room for further analysis of certain aspects of First World War aviation and Collishaw's career. Gunn acknowledges, for example, that the official scores credited to air aces in the British flying services were likely inflated or otherwise distorted. It would have been beyond the scope of Gunn's research, and probably beyond the available evidence, to offer any concrete revisions of Collishaw's score (which may have been under-reported). At the same time, Gunn would have done well to explore more fully the various factors that influenced official scoring as well as the role that air aces played in wartime propaganda. In this regard, the reader is left to wonder why Billy Bishop (with seventy-two official victories) is so widely remembered today, while Collishaw (with as many as sixty-one official victories) is far less well known – certainly outside his home province of British Columbia.

Given Collishaw's significance as an aviator and a leader during the First World War, it is perhaps unfortunate that Gunn did not examine his postwar career in greater detail. As it stands, the book is relatively compact, and there is certainly space for a chapter-length examination of Collishaw's role in the RAF between 1919 and 1943. For example, it would have been interesting to learn more about how Collishaw's experience during the First World War shaped his approach to command during the Second World War. Gunn offers no explanation for Collishaw's apparently sudden retirement from the RAF in 1943.

Concise and accessible, *Raymond Collishaw and the Black Flight* will appeal to general readers and aviation enthusiasts. Scholars may find that the book invites further fruitful questions about Collishaw's postwar career and his role in Canadian public memory.

*The Ones Who Have to Pay:
The Soldiers-Poets of Victoria BC
in the Great War, 1914-1918*

Robert Ratcliffe Taylor

Bloomington, IN: Trafford Publishing, 2013. 258 pp. \$18.50 paper.

JAMES GIFFORD

*Fairleigh Dickinson University,
Vancouver*

ROBERT RATCLIFFE Taylor's study of the soldier-poets of the First World War is both useful for scholars and pleasurable for casual readers. Although the tone of this review must be critical, this utility and pleasure needs to be emphasized as Taylor's subject matter and methodology work well for this increasingly rare combination of readerships. Readers who wish to know about the literary works on the Great War that emerged in the context of the West Coast, particularly Victoria, will appreciate Taylor's careful recovery of manuscripts and print materials, as will mainstream scholars moving forward from traditional works such as Paul Fussell's *The Great War and Modern Memory* (1975) or Samuel Hynes's *A War Imagined: The First World War and English Culture* (1990). Taylor examines the soldier-poets' regimental publications, overseas publications, and Victoria publications as well as civilian verse dealing with the First World War. The historical and regionalist considerations have much merit and will appeal to both pleasure- and history-oriented readers. However, literary critics, especially those attuned to New Modernist Studies, will be suspicious of the absence of recent scholarship, will be aware of some production and editorial limitations, and will wonder at the work's most

contentious claims: that Victoria poets differ from their British counterparts in that (1) they do not critique the war or present it outside of a Romantic nationalist ideology and (2) that they have neither the educational depth nor the scope of their British counterparts. These claims need a response.

Taylor draws a distinction between his own work and earlier studies, mainly those of Fussell, by emphasizing his regionalist perspective (a welcome element) and the modesty of his subjects' literary aspirations. With regard to the latter, he recognizes the "literary education and aspirations to universal significance" of Fussell's British poets and acknowledges that the Victoria poets "did not write great poetry." However, he adds that "their poems have the virtue of sincerity and a desire to communicate" (xvi). He also mentions that the Victoria poets lacked meaningful tertiary education. This is somewhat odd since he also notes the repeated references to literary works likely encountered first in the Victoria schoolroom as well as the literate nature of Victoria's population (3), including those with a classical education. This leads him to contend, as a way of suggesting his subjects' limited literary appreciation: "Few of these men were 'English majors' at university ... however, [they] show a similar familiarity with the poetry of both classical and modern writers" (ii). This is a minor point, but with the exception of Robert Graves, Wilfred Owen, Siegfried Sassoon, and Rupert Brooke, this could also be said of British war poets. Of these, Owen (Taylor's most recurrent point of reference) did not have the education or privilege against which the Victoria poets are contrasted. In fact, of the poets with a "literary education," Brooke uses the same traditional form and Romantic

imagery that Taylor notes in his Victoria poets. By and large, the most critical and dark depictions of the war were published only after it was over. This matter is secondary, however, since Taylor's poets need not differ from the British poets in order to be of regional interest.

What is problematic is the book's simultaneous insistence that the Victoria poets did not voice their disillusionment with the war (23-28, 34-36) and its discussion of the extensive censorship exacted by the Victoria press and by military officers (8, 34-35, 40, 103-7). The argument that "none wrote as bitterly or as angrily as Wilfred Owen or Siegfried Sassoon in England[, that] no poems published in Victoria's periodicals and newspapers approached the devastating critique of Owen[.]" (28) simply cannot stand since, as Taylor notes, even Owen's bitter works were not published in the newspapers of London or during the war. Indeed, a study of the war poets of a single English city, especially a smaller city, would be unlikely to yield results that differed from Taylor's with regard to Victoria. Wider considerations of Canadian poetry would help here, perhaps Joel Baetz's very fine *Canadian Poetry from World War I: An Anthology* (Oxford University Press, 2009). However, if one is to stick with the purpose and scope of Taylor's work, then generalizing about what may or may not have existed either in Victoria or elsewhere merely serves to distract from a pleasurable and informative study.

Readers will notice frequent typographical, proofing, and typesetting errors (there are unexpectedly bolded and/or underlined words or letters). This is unfortunate.

Aside from the readability and genuinely pleasurable nature of Taylor's work, scholars will benefit from its

second half, which records the soldiers' poetry and biographical information. This section alone is worth the cost of the book and will make it a necessary addition to university libraries. It does not seem probable that a readier source for these materials is likely to come any time soon, and Taylor's careful efforts in collecting them must be appreciated. *The Ones Who Have to Pay* will be an essential part of any work on twentieth-century BC poetry and/or on Canada's literary contributions from the First World War.

Catching the Torch: Contemporary Canadian Literary Responses to World War I

Neta Gordon

Waterloo: Wilfrid Laurier Press,
2014. 222 pp. \$65.00 cloth.

JAMES GIFFORD

*Fairleigh Dickinson University,
Vancouver*

NETA GORDON'S *Catching the Torch: Contemporary Canadian Literary Responses to World War I* is a contemporary study of the notion of the Great War in modern memory: that is, it concerns the imaginative reconstruction of the First World War in Canadian literature since Timothy Findley's *The Wars*, which was published in 1977. In many respects, Findley is the touchstone for Gordon's work, marking a rupture in Canadian thought between an emerging pacifist vision of wartime horrors and a lingering patriotic understanding of the First World War as the birth of the nation (or, in the language of the text, its "crucible"). As a survey of Canadian

representations of the First World War from the 1990s to the present, Gordon is on firm ground (most frequently in *Broken Ground*), and the volume's value is indisputable in this respect. Readers should, however, note that *Catching the Torch* is concerned neither with the First World War nor with the literature of the war itself. Small issues remind the reader of this, such as the misspelling of Robert Graves (8) and, apart from John McCrae, the absence of First World War works that have influenced contemporary Canadian writers.

The most compelling chapter, and probably the most important for Gordon's stated aim of rethinking presentations of the First World War after Findley, is "Abandoning the Archivist," in which she contrasts "*The Wars* as a historiographic metafiction" (86) with Alan Cumyn's, Jane Urquhart's, and Jack Hodgins's "relative disinterest in sorting through the problem of how to confront a historical record" (86). The work is also highly convincing in its analysis of how depictions of the war function to shape concepts of the nation and authorial resistance to essentialist understandings of national characters. In some respects, this reflects an impassioned belief in cultural pluralism, perhaps best described here under the moniker of "multiculturalism." Gordon presents this pluralism as deeply bound to the operation of the First World War in literature as transformed after Findley, such that the "crucible" that bore the nation is displaced by a recognition of "the essential nation as a fraught, possibly misguided, and ultimately failed venture" (61).

The book's opening literature review will be helpful for many scholars, and, in its narrative development of critical understandings of the way in which the First World War figures

in contemporary Canadian literature, *Catching the Torch* is unlikely to be superseded any time soon. Critically, Evelyn Cobley's *Representing War: Form and Ideology in First World War Narratives* is the strongest influence here, and for good reason. Gordon's work convincingly adds to Cobley's by bringing the analysis forward to the twenty-first century. There is a passing mention of the parallel resurgence of depictions of the First World War in British literature, particularly Pat Barker's *Regeneration* trilogy, but Gordon neither explores the comparison nor offers a sense of how Canada's simultaneous recovery of such materials is unique. In some respects, the literature review continues throughout the book, with numerous responses to various articles or chapters: my impression is that Gordon has, of necessity, responded to calls to include existing critical works. While the survey component is useful, at points it distracts from the "red thread" of her compelling interpretive efforts. Similarly, the theoretical frame is unclear and perhaps not needed. The opening literature review invokes Georg Lukács: "The historical drama necessarily presents the activities of figures to be taken as exemplars of dialectical historical forces at work," while "historical novels depend on ... the sense that historical forces are producing conflict and change" (4). Nevertheless, the Marxist analysis does not resurface, despite the natural moment in which she (again, compellingly) contends: "[Nationalist] myth as a product of imaginative energy is something that has long proved to be an amazingly powerful, even dangerous, motivator" (60). A discussion of the ideology and the forces producing the historical drama or the historical novel in the final decade of the twentieth century and the

first decade of the twenty-first would be helpful in this regard.

A related frustration concerns the absence of a cultural studies approach to the fact that concern with the function of the Great War in literary works emerges at the same time as does concern with that of other contemporary conflicts. It would seem no accident that the flowering of Canadian responses to the topic of the war that Gordon identifies came during the end of the Cold War and Canada's involvement in other conflicts for which nation-love would be more complex or discomfiting, ranging from Oka and the first Gulf War to Somalia and the Yugoslav Wars of Succession. Much as John Storey has explored the differences between the American war in Vietnam and its afterlife in popular media as a tool for use in later conflicts (Bush Senior's feeling in the midst of the first Gulf War that the United States had kicked the "Vietnam Syndrome" is best understood through Hollywood, not history), in the various works under examination there seems to be a relationship between the image of one war and its representation during another. It is, for this reason, a surprise to find no exploration of contemporary military conflicts or service. This is perhaps most notable in relation to Gordon's very much needed discussion of Vern Thiessen's play *Vimy*, which, in reviews, media, and marketing, has been inescapably related to Canada's role in the Great War.

Despite these critiques, Gordon's monograph is excellent and is vital to understanding the contemporary literature of British Columbia and Ontario. *BC Studies* readers will find her analysis of Hodgins's *Broken Ground* of particular merit.

*For King and Country: 150
Years of the Royal Westminster
Regiment*

Robert M. Harley, editor

New Westminster: Vivalogue, 2012.
328 pp. \$84.00 cloth.

JAMES WOOD
Okanagan College

THE SETTING SUN of the BC flag provides a fitting background for the regimental colours of the Royal Westminster Regiment. Authorized in 1863 by Governor James Douglas as the New Westminster Volunteer Rifles, in 1910 it became the 104th Regiment, Westminster Fusiliers of Canada. In *For King and Country*, editor Rob Harley amasses an impressive collection of operational detail, weaponry, awards, medals, and ceremonies to illustrate the regiment's century and a half of service to the British Empire and Canada in this province and overseas.

The book's title, a translation of the regimental motto *pro rege et patria*, captures the unit's imperial ties. Twenty-nine volunteers from New Westminster served in the Boer War from 1899 to 1901. In 1914, volunteers from the 104th Regiment went overseas, serving mainly in the 47th and 131st Battalions of the Canadian Expeditionary Force. In the Second World War, the Westminster Regiment earned a reputation as a highly efficient fighting organization, first as a machine gun and then as a motor support unit with the 5th Canadian Armoured Division in the Melfa River region of Italy and in northwest Europe.

Harley's focus on the importance of tradition also highlights a series of royal visits in which the regiment played a prominent role: King George VI

and Queen Elizabeth in 1939, Queen Elizabeth II and the Duke of Edinburgh in 1951 and 1983, Queen Elizabeth II and Princess Anne in 1971 to celebrate the centennial of British Columbia's entry into Confederation, and Princess Alexandra in 1967 on behalf of the queen to recognize the great honour of the unit's designation as the Royal Westminister Regiment. Further excitement accompanied visits by Field Marshal Bernard Montgomery, whose brother Donald had served with the 47th Battalion in the Great War, and, in 1994 and 2010, by the Duke of Westminster, the regiment's colonel-in-chief. Harley also examines the unit's participation in the Korean War and its continuing support of multinational NATO and UN campaigns, including those in Cyprus, Greece, Egypt, the Golan Heights, the former Yugoslavia, and, finally, Afghanistan.

For those interested in BC social or military history, excellent data are found in the final 120 pages of *For King and Country*, including embarkation rolls from the New Westminster area from the time of the Boer War to the Second World War, including next of kin, addresses, nation of birth, former militia unit, and occupation prior to enlistment. *For King and Country* also emphasizes the Canadian militia's links to the community. In particular, the unit's association with Holy Trinity Cathedral represents a relationship that predates Confederation. Regimental sports teams, especially the lacrosse "Salmonbellies," date back to the early 1900s and continue through to the Afghanistan era. The New Westminster Armoury, built in 1895 and today used for both community and militia events, is believed to be the oldest wooden armoury in Canada still in use. In 2013, the Royal Westminister Regiment celebrated its distinguished

sesquicentennial as the longest-serving military formation in British Columbia. The strong community-regimental connections illustrated in *For King and Country* complement other recently published histories of local regiments, such as *Swift and Strong: The British Columbia Regiment (Duke of Connaught's Own)* by Ron Leblanc et al. (2011), and *Vancouver's Bessborough Armoury: A History*, edited by R. Victor Stevenson (2010). Although Harley's work does not present the same wealth of personal journals and wartime reflections as is found throughout *Swift and Strong*, nor the extensive primary research on changing urban landscapes found in *Vancouver's Bessborough Armoury*, it certainly complements these recent studies of the lower Fraser Valley's military heritage. Harley's extensive personal collection of cap and collar badges, uniforms, the regimental flag, royal gift boxes to the soldiers, and a variety of weapons, both Allied and German, provides the core of this pictorial history.

Harley poignantly captures the proud spirit of the Royal Westminister Regiment through his coverage of the funeral of Master Corporal Colin Bason, killed in action by an improvised explosive device detonated in Afghanistan on 7 July 2007. In his home community of Aldergrove, British Columbia, members of Bason's unit refurbished a vintage Bren gun carrier to transport his remains through the city streets to his church. The ceremony honoured the contributions of this young soldier in a way that showed the love and respect of his comrades. Books such as *For King and Country* also reflect the dedication and sense of duty that form an essential part of every serving regiment of the Canadian Armed Forces.

For King and Kanata: Canadian Indians and the First World War

Timothy Winegard

Winnipeg: University of Manitoba Press, 2012. 240 pp. \$24.95 paper.

SARAH NICKEL
Simon Fraser University

EXPLORING THE participation of Canadian First Nations in the First World War, Timothy Winegard takes aim at two historiographical problems: (1) the tendency to simply insert Aboriginal military contributions where they have been otherwise ignored and (2) the limited national focus of existing narratives. *For King and Kanata* seeks to move past these weaknesses by rejecting what has been labelled the “Forgotten Warrior” genre, with its racial categorization and white guilt-driven scholarship, and instead critically evaluating Aboriginal participation within a transnational perspective.

Emphasizing the basic, albeit oft-forgotten, reality that Canada’s foreign policy was tethered to Britain during the First World War, a crucial starting point for Winegard is the recognition that First Nations military involvement was negotiated through multiple national and transnational bureaucratic realities as well as cross-cultural dialogue.

Winegard notes, for instance, that the policies of the British War Office, the Canadian Ministry of Militia, and the Department of Indian Affairs dictated Aboriginal military participation and that prevailing racial attitudes about the unsuitability of Aboriginal men in a “white man’s war” were initially used to exclude their involvement. Later, the British Colonial Office and the

British War Office, citing thinning enlistment numbers, first relaxed and then flouted provisions barring First Nations service and began actively recruiting in Aboriginal communities. Potential enlistees were motivated to join the war effort by patriotism, as well as by a desire for equality, adventure, and steady employment, and Aboriginal communities on the home front responded with equal enthusiasm by sending cash donations and care packages. This dedication waned, however, as First Nations peoples discovered that military inclusion did not ensure equality and citizenship.

The book is organized into nine chronological and thematic chapters, each focusing on a particular aspect of Native-newcomer interactions before, during, and after the war. While this structure effectively integrates the transnational component of Winegard’s argument into the narrative, it comes at the expense of the book’s broader organization. Because the first six chapters are outlined chronologically, while the final three are principally thematic, the same themes and topics often emerge more than once in different chapters, creating repetition.

Undoubtedly, the greatest strength of this book is its transnational focus. Using extensive materials from the Imperial and Canadian archives, and referencing Indigenous military involvement in other Imperial colonies, Winegard is able to situate Canadian First Nations activities within the complex narrative of Empire, adding depth and dimension to our understanding of the war effort.

However, Winegard is less successful in contesting the Forgotten Warrior genre. Because the author’s arguments both critique and reinscribe this historiographical approach, the reader is left with a lingering sense of ambiguity. Winegard clearly

complicates Aboriginal military participation, highlighting both the humble and prestigious roles taken on by soldiers to undermine a purely celebratory narrative, but aspects of the Forgotten Warrior idea remain. For example, Winegard's discussion of wartime racial profiling, which cast First Nations soldiers as inherently talented snipers and scouts, addresses the challenge in balancing settler guilt and racial essentialism, yet he ultimately acknowledges that archival evidence supports this same congratulatory categorization (113-17). In response, Winegard suggests that historians should attempt to move away from classifying achievements with reference to race, but his own struggles with this reveal the challenge of recognizing First Nations military triumphs and involvement without perpetuating the Forgotten Warrior trope.

Despite these limitations, this book makes an important contribution to the history of First Nations participation in the First World War, and it will appeal to scholars interested in Canadian history, transnational narratives, Native-newcomer relations, settler-colonialism, race, governance, and Empire.



In the Shadow of the Great War: The Milligan and Hart Explorations of Northeastern British Columbia, 1913-14

Jay Sherwood

Victoria: Royal British Columbia Museum, 2013. 208 pp. 80 b/w photos. \$19.95 paper.

ROBIN RIDINGTON AND

JILLIAN RIDINGTON

University of British Columbia

JAY SHERWOOD has given us another chapter in the story of how the talented surveyors of the early twentieth century put vast areas of northern British Columbia on the map. The places visited by E.B. Hart and George Milligan have been home to Dane-zaa, Sekani, and Dene-tha people for millennia and were known to Hudson's Bay Company traders for more than a century before the survey expeditions. Still, until these surveys, the only detailed knowledge was held by First Nations hunters and passed down through a comprehensive system of place names and oral history. The two men were commissioned to assess the economic potential of northeastern British Columbia and to produce maps of the area. Hart, by all accounts, was a reprobate and schemer with no surveying experience. His reports lack substantive data but always included requests for more money and supplies. However, he covered a lot of territory and collected unique botanical specimens and fine examples of Sekani and Dene-tha clothing, which are now in the Smithsonian. In contrast, Milligan was meticulous, talented, and tenacious. Sherwood's book is based on carefully edited journals from their expeditions and correspondence

between them and British Columbia's surveyor-general, George Herbert Dawson.

Both surveyors must be praised for their attention to First Nations place names, which they used in their maps wherever possible. One humorous exception is Prespatou Creek, which Milligan named for his dog. It is now the name of a small Mennonite community northeast of Fort St. John. During his eighteen months in the field Milligan "travelled 7211 kilometers" (174) primarily by foot, horseback, dogsled, or canoe. As the First Nations people well knew, winter travel over muskeg country was easy once a toboggan trail had been broken, but Milligan travelled in all seasons. In addition to his survey notes, Milligan took many excellent black-and-white photographs and developed some in the field. Sherwood includes many of these. Many are photographs of First Nations people, some of whom, like Bellyfull (Makenacha, or Bigfoot), are named. Some of the men Milligan used as guides – Ha ho, Det-sedah (Notseta), Bellyfull, Joseph Apsassin – are familiar to us through Dane-zaa oral history. One photograph (137) of Milligan with First Nations men at Fort Nelson shows a man in his late teens who is probably Augustine Jumbie, a Prophet River man we knew as an elder.

Sherwood's own narrative leads the reader easily through the journal entries. The text, in combination with the photographs, present a vivid picture of what it was like to live and travel in northeastern British Columbia shortly after the turn of the nineteenth century. Milligan, in particular, was an intrepid pathfinder and capable of living off the land for extended periods of time. Sometimes his only source of food was the rabbits he snared, and even those could be in short supply. As the book's

title implies, the survey work came to an abrupt halt at the onset of the First World War. Hart survived the war, although he was injured, and became a major. Milligan lost his life. His work, along with that of Hart, was not seriously consulted until the Second World War, when the maps and reports were used during the construction of the Alaska Highway. The book is an interesting read as well as a complement to First Nations oral history of the area.

*Where Happiness Dwells: A
History of the Dane-zaa First
Nations*

Robin Ridington and
Jillian Ridington

Vancouver: UBC Press, 2013. 420 pp.
\$34.95 paper.

DANIEL SIMS
University of Alberta

"HE EXPECTS THE listener to be familiar with that part of the story, in the same way that Homer expected ancient Greeks to know about the Trojan horse and didn't include it in *The Iliad*" (125). This quote beautifully explains the rationale behind Robin Ridington and Jillian Ridington's history of the Dane-zaa, *Where Happiness Dwells*. That is to say, they have attempted to provide cultural and historical context to the numerous oral histories found in the book rather than to rework or paraphrase the histories themselves. In doing so, the Ridingtons treat oral histories according to their own integrity and merit, not merely as supplementary information to enrich the written record. As with Luise White's book on colonial Tanganyika, *Speaking with Vampires* (2000), or, more

recently, Keith Thor Carlson's book on the Stó:lō, *The Power of Place, the Problem of Time* (2010), this approach means working with concepts and histories that do not easily fit into the traditional European academic discourse: Europeans as vampires in the case of White, and Europeans grappling with the mystical tunnels of the Stó:lō, in the case of Carlson. And yet, as with these two works, this book benefits from treating oral histories as histories in their own right and not just as evidence.

Putting aside the obvious concerns some readers might have with pre-contact history as discussed in the first four chapters, one area sure to cause concern among some readers, and, I argue, one of the book's greatest strengths, is the Dane-zaa lack of concern for colonial categorizations. This is most notably seen in the complex relationship of the Dane-zaa to the Tsegennu (Tsekene, a.k.a. Tse Keh Nay) found throughout the book, in the Dane-zaa view of the Alberta-British Columbia border and its general lack of importance to them (212), and in the overarching Dane-zaa view of the world as consisting of numerous familial relations (202). As John Lutz points out in *Makúk* (2008), cultural categorizations are mere constructs and in no way inherent (31-33). For example, many people treat the Tse Keh Nay and Dane-zaa as two completely different and distinct categories of First Nations. But in the case of the Dane-zaa relationship to the Tse Keh Nay, I have been told by elders in my home community of Tsay Keh Dene that I should learn our language thoroughly so that, if I am linguistically tested by our people in Fort St. John (the Ridingtons' Dane-zaa), I can pass.

Another potential area of concern is with the intended audience. The Doig

River chief and council commissioned the book with the intended goal of providing the Dane-zaa with a written version of their collected oral histories (1-2). Because of this, the Ridingtons avoid overly complicated language and non-Dane-zaa theory (2). If you are looking for overtly anthropological theory, I would recommend looking elsewhere. Even here, however, the Ridingtons have you covered, for the entire sixteenth chapter consists of recommended works by academics you can consult for further information. Furthermore, although the book is lacking in non-Dane-zaa theory, it does contain numerous passages explaining Dane-zaa world views, theories, and concepts. And because, before 1977, Doig River and Blueberry River were legally the Fort St. John Beaver Band, and because prior to that individuals could move from nation to nation, *Where Happiness Dwells* naturally includes the history of the Dane-zaa in general (xi). So if you want to know more about this, this book is an excellent source of information.

Robin Ridington has been working with the Dane-zaa since the 1960s (2). This alone is a testament to his ability to work with the community. He was in the vanguard of academics willing to form relationships with the First Nations with whom they were working rather than simply taking information and leaving; or worse, merely using the work of others and never actually talking to the nation in question. This book is a fine example of what a good relationship between First Nations and academics can produce. *Where Happiness Dwells* provides an excellent history of the Dane-zaa from earliest times to the present and stands as an example of the abiding power of oral history.

*The True Story of Canada's
"War" of Extermination on the
Pacific plus the Tsilhqot'in and
Other First Nations Resistance*

Tom Swanky

Burnaby: Dragon Heart, 2012.
\$19.72 epub.

ROBIN FISHER
Nanaimo

ONE SHOULD always be sceptical of books whose titles proclaim that they are providing the "true story" of any aspect of history. For truth, like beauty, is in the eye of the beholder. Tom Swanky's book on the impact of smallpox on the Aboriginal peoples of British Columbia is a case in point. There is some truth here, but not the whole truth.

There can be little doubt, as Swanky argues, that governments and settlers in British Columbia deprived First Nations peoples of their land and undermined their traditional systems of government. Nor can there be any question that Europeans introduced smallpox and that this disease, along with others, resulted in a sharp decline in the Aboriginal population. What is less convincing is the extent to which Swanky argues for an explicit and conscious connection between the two. That is, he strongly believes, and vociferously argues, that the Douglas government and prospective landowners engaged in a deliberate, premeditated, systematic, and covert operation to spread smallpox among Aboriginal peoples in order to eliminate the population and make the land available for speculators and settlers.

I have several concerns with the way this conclusion is presented. The line of argument is circuitous rather

than straightforward and, therefore, difficult to follow. As the author puts it: "Like a coyote on the hunt, we have been crisscrossing space and time" (66). Swanky also has a great fondness for adjectives, hyperbole, rhetorical devices, and forced allusions. Suggestions or suppositions in one sentence become dead certainties in the next. There are particular assertions that stretch credulity to the limit, such as the claim that James Douglas stopped signing treaties with First Nations on Vancouver Island because he knew that smallpox would solve the problem by removing the population. And then, for Swanky, historians with different views are not worthy of the name or, worse still, are the authors of "criminally negligent work" (24 and 11).

These, perhaps, are details. My fundamental concern is with how the conclusions in this book are reached – in other words, with the use of evidence. Like a coyote on the hunt, the route may be circuitous, but there can be only one outcome. And so the evidence is marshalled and manipulated to prove a predetermined point. The author knows that the written record is easily manipulated but does not believe that he himself is doing it. The oral record of First Nations peoples, on the other hand, is apparently not open to question. For one so dubious about the written record, Swanky places a great deal of reliance on the gospel according to the *British Colonist*. The Victoria newspaper was strongly opposed to the Douglas government and, on that subject especially, is a better source of opinion than of fact. When the author fails to find evidence of a deliberate introduction of smallpox it is because it was a covert operation and therefore kept secret. Those who claimed to be trying to limit the impact of smallpox on First Nations communities through

vaccination were either misguided or lying. Much of the argument in the book is based on inference and the interpretation of evidence in light of a predetermined conclusion. Unfortunately, this approach makes it too easy to dismiss Swanky's more controversial claims.

Readers of this review should understand that Swanky would probably consider me totally disqualified to comment on his book. While he seldom identifies those historians to whom he objects, though clearly it is most who have written on the Aboriginal history of British Columbia, I have to assume that, because I have written some reasonably positive things about James Douglas, I am merely one of the many "later apologists and collaborators in genocide" (219). Before I got my academic hackles up too much about that comment, I recalled that this is not the first time that I have heard the allegation. I once invited a distinguished historian to speak at my university, and he presented his high population decline view of disease on the Northwest Coast. When I raised some questions about his argument the response was that only "Jim Keegstra types" would question his views. I thought at the time that such aspersions have no place in academic debate. Now, having read Swanky's book, I dare say that I would have to add – unless, of course, they are true!



Rewriting Marpole: The Path to Cultural Complexity in the Gulf of Georgia Region

Terence N. Clark

Ottawa: University of Ottawa Press,
2013. 200 pp. \$55.00 paper.

JESSE MORIN

Tsleil-Waututh Nation

Rewriting Marpole is the published version of Clark's PhD dissertation (Clark 2010) and an outgrowth of his MA thesis (Clark 2000). The primary goal of his research "is to determine the spatial and temporal extent of Marpole" (1); the secondary goal is to examine the processes under which social complexity, as equated with Marpole, arose in the Salish Sea region (3). Clark utilizes an innovative array of multivariate statistical techniques to identify spatial and temporal relationships between culture-historical units and, perhaps most important, to equate language groups with such units. In doing so, he greatly refines the culture-historical sequence and provides considerable new insight into our understanding of the spatio-temporal extent of such culture-historical units in the Salish Sea. (For reasons that are unclear, Clark adheres to the old name "Strait of Georgia" for this body of water.)

In my opinion, unlike with his successful cultural historical enterprise, in *Rewriting Marpole* Clark's application of these methods to explaining the origins of social complexity misses the mark. I am unconvinced that his method, as laid out, is able to identify or describe "social complexity" in any way other than automatically associating it with Marpole Phase sites/assemblages. A much more detailed review of variable indicators and measures of

cultural complexity within Marpole Phase versus non-Marpole Phase sites would have been a very strong addition to this book. I think Clark missed an opportunity to comment on another cultural phase that involved the origins of social complexity – the “Classic Lillooet” Phase – and that was coeval with, and practically adjacent to, Marpole.

Clark’s multivariate statistical methods, termed integrative distance analysis (IDA), represent an outgrowth in both the complexity of techniques and in the number of site assemblages considered in a long trajectory of multivariate comparison of artefact assemblages in the Salish Sea region (Burley 1980; Clark 2000; Matson 1974, 2010; Matson, Ludowicz, and Boyd 1980; Thom 1992; Thompson 1978). Such analyses have identified subphases within regional cultures, such as the Garrison, Beach Grove, and Old Musqueam subphases of Marpole (Matson et al. 1980; Matson and Coupland 1995, 213). Clark’s (2000) earlier research realigned the earliest subphase of Marpole (Old Musqueam) with the Locarno Beach Phase and found that Marpole did not appear to exist on southern Vancouver Island (i.e., Clark identified a regional bifurcation of contemporaneous Marpole and Locarno Beach phases). Building on this, Clark’s current IDA analysis combines multivariate methods, as applied by previous scholars to artefact assemblages, and adds faunal assemblages, ethnographic language, and geographic location to the multivariate mix (97). Clark’s discussion of IDA in Chapter 5 is not for the faint of heart, but it does provide food for thought for readers with a foundation in multivariate statistics.

In Chapter 6, Clark applies IDA to 149 archaeological sites from the Salish

Sea (97–101). However, only sixty-four of these sites have artefact data and nineteen of them have faunal data, thereby greatly reducing the true size of Clark’s dataset. The artefacts were divided into a fifty-one-class typology and analyzed using IDA alongside fauna, language, and geographic location (97, 103). Surprisingly, Clark found geography to be a poor predictor of assemblage composition (127) and language to be highly correlated with assemblage composition (136). I find these conclusions very confusing as language distribution in the Salish Sea is strongly structured by geography; I suspect that the simplistic use of UTM (universal transverse Mercator) coordinates to represent geography is the culprit here. Fauna and artefact assemblages do not show significant correlation (136).

Figures 6.4 (149) and 6.13 (180) are undoubtedly the most important in this book. These two figures (multidimensional scaling plots) purport to display both temporal (dimension 1) and spatial (dimension 2) variation between the sites under consideration. The strongest separation occurs between assemblages from the San Juan Islands and all others (180). (I would hope that anyone who has read Close’s [2006] analysis of the English Camp lithics and has some experience with Salish Sea lithics would come to an identical conclusion.) It would have been interesting to remove the San Juan Islands sites as outliers and rerun the remaining dataset to further explore it for variation because removal of such outliers and reanalysis might reveal new patterns among the remaining dataset. San Juan Islands sites aside, Clark finds that, while Halkomelem-speaking regions have sites that belong to both Marpole and Locarno phases, Straits Salish-speaking regions lack

Marpole assemblages (171, 180). Clark presents a revised spatio-temporal culture historical framework for the Salish Sea region.

Rewriting Marpole provides an especially useful critical review of the usefulness of so-called “temporally diagnostic artefacts” and finds most of them to be much less diagnostic than previous generations of researchers led us to believe (193-203). This is an additional contribution to the field, and it speaks to the need for archaeologists to submit more radiocarbon dates from their excavations in order to place them within a chronological framework.

That said, I found the relatively few radiocarbon dates (about one hundred) available for the whole sample of sites analyzed here rather disconcerting. Stein and Duo (2003) present eighty-two radiocarbon dates for the San Juan Islands alone for interpreting shell midden development there. And, just north and east of Clark’s study area, in the mid-Fraser Canyon, Brian Hayden and Anna-Marie Prentiss have obtained over one hundred dates from just two Interior Salish villages – Keatley Creek and Bridge River – and they can’t agree on the timing of (1) aggregated occupation, (2) origins of social complexity, or (3) abandonment of the very large Classic Lillooet villages there (Hayden 2005; Hayden and Mathewes 2009; Kuijt and Prentiss 2004; Prentiss et al. 2012; Prentiss et al. 2008). Based on my experience in the mid-Fraser region (Morin 2010; Morin et al. 2008-09), I find the one hundred dates from 149 sites in the Salish Sea pretty thin ice on which to place any chronological foundation.

I must mention here that Chapter 6 alone has at least twenty-five pages of tables that should have been placed in an appendix; I found their inclusion in the text very frustrating. Additionally,

the section on art and mortuary architecture (178-89), while providing a great respite from the extremely formal discussion that preceded it, was also brief and out of date and lacked, for example, a recent master’s thesis (Hannah 1996) on seated human figure bowls. Rattlesnake iconography on bowls from Victoria (Duff 1975, 54-55), made from steatite from the Fraser Canyon, screams out for a non-local explanation here. Recall that the mid-Fraser Canyon is between four and eight days’ travel from the Salish Sea, where socially complex hunter-gatherer villages were also developing in the Classic Lillooet Phase (Hayden 2000; Hayden, Bakewell, and Gargett 1996; Hayden and Ryder 1991, 2003; Hayden 2005; Morin et al. 2008-09; Prentiss et al. 2005; Prentiss et al., 2008). Some acknowledgment of this coeval and practically adjacent phenomenon, which also involves the development of social complexity, is lacking in this book on Marpole.

As someone who spends a lot of time studying lithic artefacts and who is also interested in regional interaction, I can’t help but wonder whether, rather than tracking the percentage of “types” through time, it might perhaps be more profitable to track the changing use of raw materials through time (e.g., Carlson 1994; Choquette 1980-81; Hayden et al. 1996; Morin 2012; Reimer 2011). Reimer (2011, 168) identifies the introduction of considerable quantities of new lithic materials (e.g., Garibaldi obsidian) into the Fraser Delta region during Marpole. My research (Morin 2012) identifies a “pulse” (an increase in quantity) of ground stone celts made beyond or at the extreme periphery of the Coast Salish world during the Marpole Phase, especially at the Fraser Delta. Clark did not have access to this data during the completion of his

dissertation, but perhaps raw material use is an additional variable that could be integrated into IDA?

Rewriting Marpole provides useful insight into the cultural historical sequence of the Salish Sea region. I am certain it will be cited for this for decades to come. However, for the reasons expressed above, I do not feel that it makes much of a contribution to the study of social complexity in the region. Despite this, as a regional synthesis, this book will provide direction for future regional-level investigations into the political economies and the nature of social inequalities during the Marpole period.

REFERENCES

- Burley, D. 1980. *Marpole: Anthropological Reconstructions of a Northwest Coast Culture Type*, vol. 8. Burnaby: Simon Fraser University Department of Archaeology.
- Carlson, R.L. 1994. "Trade and Exchange in Prehistoric British Columbia." In *Prehistoric Exchange Systems in North America*, ed. T.G. Baugh and J.E. Ericson, 307-61. New York: Plenum.
- Choquette, W. 1980-81. "The Role of Lithic Raw Material Studies in Kootenay Archaeology." *BC Studies* 48 (1): 21-36.
- Clark, T. 2000. "Prehistoric Culture Change on Southern Vancouver Island: The Applicability of Current Explanations of the Marpole Transition." MA thesis, University of Victoria.
- . 2010. "Rewriting Marpole: The Path to Cultural Complexity in the Gulf of Georgia." PhD diss., University of Toronto.
- Close, A. 2006. *Finding the People Who Flaked the Stone at English Camp (San Juan Island)*. Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press.
- Duff, W. 1975. *Images, Stone, BC: Thirty Centuries of Northwest Coast Indian Sculpture*. Toronto: Oxford University Press.
- Hannah, J. 1996. "Seated Human Figure Bowls: An Investigation of a Prehistoric Stone Carving Tradition from the Northwest Coast." MA thesis, Simon Fraser University.
- Hayden, B. 2000. "An Overview of the Classic Lillooet Occupation at Keatley Creek." In *The Ancient Past of Keatley Creek: Vol. 2: Socioeconomy*, ed. B. Hayden, 255-86. Burnaby: Simon Fraser University Department of Archaeology Press.
- . 2005. "The Emergence of Large Villages and Large Residential Corporate Group Structures among Complex Hunter-Gatherers at Keatley Creek." *American Antiquity* 70 (1): 169-74.
- Hayden, B., E. Bakewell, and R. Gargett. 1996. "The World's Longest-Lived Corporate Group: Lithic Analysis Reveals Prehistoric Social Organization Near Lillooet, British Columbia." *American Antiquity* 61 (2): 341-56.
- Hayden, B., and R. Mathewes. 2009. "The Rise and Fall of Complex Large Villages on the British Columbia Plateau: A Geoarchaeological Controversy." *Canadian Journal of Archaeology* 33 (2): 281-96.
- Hayden, B., and J.M. Ryder, 1991. "Prehistoric Cultural Collapse in the Lillooet Area." *American Antiquity* 56 (1): 50-65.
- Hayden, B., and J. Ryder. 2003. "Cultural Collapses in the Northwest: A Response to Kuijt." *American Antiquity* 68 (1): 157-60.
- Kuijt, I., and W. Prentiss. 2004. "Villages on the Edge: Pithouses, Cultural

- Change, and the Abandonment of Aggregate Pithouse Villages.” In *Complex Hunter-Gatherers: Evolution and Organization of Prehistoric Communities on the Plateau of Northwestern North America*, ed. W. Prentiss and I. Kuijt, 155-69. Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press.
- Matson, R.G. 1974. “Clustering and Scaling of Gulf of Georgia Sites.” *Syesis* 7: 101-14.
- , ed. 2010. “The Crescent Beach Site and the Place of the Locarno Beach Phase.” Vancouver, UBC. <https://circle.ubc.ca/handle/2429/39218>: unpublished m.s.
- Matson, R.G., and G. Coupland. 1995. *The Prehistory of the Northwest Coast*. San Diego: Academic Press.
- Matson, R.G., D. Ludowicz, and W. Boyd. 1980. *Excavations at Beach Grove (DgRs 1) in 1980*. Vancouver: UBC, Laboratory of Archaeology.
- Morin, J. 2010. “Ritual Architecture in Prehistoric Complex Hunter-Gatherer Communities: A Potential Example from Keatley Creek on the Canadian Plateau.” *American Antiquity* 75 (3): 599-626.
- . 2012. “The Political Economy of Stone Celt Exchange: The Salish Nephrite/Jade Industry.” PhD diss., University of British Columbia.
- Morin, J., R. Dickie, T. Sakaguchi, and J. Hoskins. 2008-09. “Late Prehistoric Settlement Patterns and Population Dynamics along the Mid-Fraser.” *BC Studies* 160 (1): 9-34.
- Prentiss, A.M., G. Cross, T. Foor, M. Hogan, D. Markle, and D. Clarke. 2008. “Evolution of a Late Prehistoric Winter Village on the Interior Plateau of British Columbia: Geophysical Investigations, Radiocarbon Dating, and Spatial Analysis of the Bridge River Site.” *American Antiquity* 73 (1): 59-81.
- Prentiss, A.M., T. Foor, G. Cross, L. Harris, and M. Wanzenried. 2012. “The Cultural Evolution of Material Wealth-Based Inequality at Bridge River, British Columbia.” *American Antiquity* 77 (3): 542-64.
- Prentiss, W., M. Lenert, T. Foor, and N. Goodale. 2005. “The Emergence of Complex Hunter-Gatherers on the Canadian Plateau: A Response to Hayden.” *American Antiquity* 70 (1): 175-80.
- Reimer, R. 2011. “The Mountains and Rocks Are Forever: Lithics and Landscapes of SKWXWÚ7MESH UXWUMIXW.” PhD diss., McMaster University.
- Stein, J., and J. Deo. 2003. “Big Sites – Short Time: Accumulation Rates in Archaeological Sites.” *Journal of Archaeological Science*, 30: 297-316.
- Thom, B. 1992. “An Investigation of Interassemblage Variability within the Gulf of Georgia Phase.” *Canadian Journal of Archaeology* 16 (1): 24-31.
- Thompson, G. 1978. *Prehistoric Settlement Changes in the Southern Northwest Coast: A Functional Approach*. Seattle: University of Washington, Reports in Archaeology 5.



*Native Claims: Indigenous Law
against Empire, 1500-1920*

Saliha Belmessous, editor

Oxford: Oxford University Press,
2012. 278 pp. \$74.00 cloth.

DANIEL CLAYTON

University of St. Andrews

THIS MAJOR interdisciplinary study shatters the illusion that only Europeans contributed to modern legal debate about the legitimacy of empire and the nature of imperial sovereignty and colonial possession. The basic – twofold – premise of the conceptually and thematically interwoven ten chapters of *Native Claims* is that the established need on the part of Europeans to justify their claims to distant territory and dominion, both to each other and to Native peoples, did not have just European roots (in Roman, canon, and natural law traditions) and was never simply imposed on alien lands and peoples. Aboriginal groups had their own (diverse) ways of dealing with property and territory, and they were not silent witnesses to their own dispossession. They adapted quickly to the way European arguments about conquest and possession were presented, articulated their own arguments rigorously and effectively, and thus helped to forge legal middle grounds. “In the history of legal argument regarding indigenous rights,” Saliha Belmessous observes in her wide-ranging Introduction, “the people most concerned have been kept off stage. Our study ... shows that the struggle for reconciling indigenous peoples with settler societies can only be met through the inclusion of a legal voice that has often been present but not heard” (15).

“Present but not heard”: these words capture the challenge that the case studies developed in this volume pose to both imperial historiography and contemporary debates over Native rights. The authors (all of them leaders in the fields of history, law, philosophy, and international relations) examine Native and European claims to property and possession with compassion and subtlety, original scholarship, and richly detailed examples. The first three chapters deal with sixteenth-century Iberian imperialism in the New World; the next three with seventeenth- and eighteenth-century British and French North America; a further three with nineteenth-century Australia and New Zealand; and a final chapter with colonial West Africa between 1840 and 1920. (The Dutch and Portuguese are not covered in any detail.) The normative implications of these historical explorations for contemporary debate are dealt with in an Afterword by political philosopher Duncan Ivison.

Such a project faces significant methodological problems of “ventriloquism” and ethnographic “up-streaming”: the fact that many of the archival fragments that scholars today read as Native “legal” argument were generated by Europeans; and the problem of translating past Native language and imagery into latter-day legal categories and understandings. The authors grapple with these problems creatively, if not in every instance convincingly. Interestingly, their historical work brushes against the grain of subaltern and postcolonial strictures about how Native subjects only enter colonial history, and then with a compromised agency, when they rebel and their actions are decried by colonial state authorities and represented as “primitive” and “illegitimate” (Ranjit

Guha's famous colonial "prose of counter-insurgency"). The authors here reveal how, on some occasions, Native dialogue and protest over property and dispossession preceded rebellion, and colonial authorities were pressed into responding to Native arguments and petitions that were taken to be rational and emphatic. However, such dialogue and protest are dealt with in this volume chiefly in textual terms. While there are references to maps, there is considerably more scope for the ways in which European and Native cartography served as a crucial modality of dialogue and dispute.

Another important facet of the book is the way Native inclusion in what has hitherto been seen as a largely European framework of thought about "the law of nations" can be derived from the same traditions of post-Renaissance humanism that gave us the noble savage and ideas of Native primitivism (including Hobbes's infamous characterization of Native life as "nasty, brutish and short"). In a fine chapter on Powhatan legal claims, for instance, Andrew Fitzmaurice seeks to show that "it was no more remarkable for the English that the Powhatans should launch these legal arguments than that they employed bows and arrows" (102).

At the same time, Craig Yirush points out that "the sophistication of the natives' legal and political arguments did not, of course, stop their dispossession" (146). History cannot simply be rewritten. However, history can be – and to some degree, in places such as British Columbia, already has been – revalorized: made more responsive to historic injustices over the alienation of Native land and resources and how they have been shaped by the politics of the archive. Native claims have come in a wide

variety of forms, are often not easily heard, and generalizations are not easily reached. The authors writing in this volume generally err on the side of empirical caution and take a regional and case study approach. Yet the fact that, in all likelihood, there was always and everywhere some sort of Native argument against dispossession, and thus that law was not solely a European matter, might now form the crux of a different kind of historical project. There is no heady political idealism at work here; rather, in this volume there is a superbly crafted scholarly effort to show that Native people have helped to shape a shared (if unequal) legal tradition. If this is accepted, there is no longer the same need for judges, politicians, and advocates to agonize over how or whether (given their colonizing inflections) it is appropriate to deploy or abide by "European" legal conventions in legal and political adjudications of Native rights. Admitting Native precepts and voices into colonial legal history does not make European law seem any less important or egregious; rather, it works to correct the "terrible mistake" of assuming that legal history unfolded in exclusively European terms (248).

"Brilliant" and "groundbreaking" are much over-used adjectives in blurbs for academic works, but their appearance on the back cover of this edited collection is fully deserved. None of the chapters in this volume is about British Columbia. But *Native Claims* has far-reaching implications for the way the relationship between law and history are construed in the province. It is an international and interdisciplinary work with profound regional implications, and it will give considerable encouragement to those in the historical and legal professions in British Columbia who are committed

to developing more complex and less divisive ways of talking about the overlapping and competing histories and entitlements of Natives and newcomers.

*Juan de Fuca's Strait: Voyages
in the Waterway of Forgotten
Dreams*

Barry Gough

Madeira Park: Harbour Publishing,
2012. 288 pp. Illus. and 40+ b/w
maps. \$32.95 cloth.

DANIEL CLAYTON

University of St. Andrews

THE STORY OF Greek mariner Juan de Fuca's report to English merchant Michael Lok, in Venice in 1592, of the entrance to a waterway on the northwest coast of North America around the parallel 48°N that stretched across the continent – the fabled Northwest Passage, promising to cut the travel time between Europe and China dramatically – is perhaps the closest thing that non-Native British Columbia has to a foundation myth. De Fuca's tale piqued British and Spanish interest in this remote region and lent the beginnings of exploration, trade, and empire along the coast in the last quarter of the eighteenth century an air of legend and illusion. What Lok heard, and the attempt by a host of others to confirm or disprove de Fuca's speculations, is here assiduously and lovingly retold for a popular audience by historian Barry Gough. He is essentially right in suggesting that much of British Columbia's early history can be told around the fallout of de Fuca's story. He is also right that, in order to fully understand this story,

it needs to be related to a longer and more expansive historical geography of imperial aggrandizement.

Part One of the book, tracing the story from the 1590s through to the late seventeenth century, and dealing with how Francis Drake, Samuel Purchas, Dr. John Dee, Martin Frobisher, and other celebrated explorers, pundits, and privateers became linked to it, is the most original element of the work (35–71). Gough provides a stimulating synthesis of how the English, particularly, became fixated on what Juan de Fuca's strait portended. He tracks how the elusive meeting between de Fuca and Lok opens out onto a global history of European rivalry, and a scientific and social history of national and imperial aspiration that revolves around a complex mixture of fact and supposition, truth-seeking and deception, and cartographic endeavour and error. Part Two takes the story through to the late eighteenth-century (and, to British Columbians, better known) exploits of James Cook, John Meares (and other fur traders), Alexander Dalrymple, George Vancouver, and Dionisio Alcalá Galiano, and Cayetano Valdés, and it culminates in Vancouver's "achievement" in disproving the existence of a Northwest Passage at this latitude while circumnavigating the island that bears his name and enabling the British to stake an imperial claim to a vast territory (215).

Juan de Fuca's Strait is a well produced book, with more than forty black-and-white illustrations (including many rare historical maps), a glossary, and a full bibliographic apparatus of endnotes and references, although I am not sure why a foreword, preface, prologue, and introduction were all deemed necessary before the historical action starts on page thirty-five.

Gough acknowledges that his interpretation of this labyrinthine story is “guided” in many respects by Warren Cook’s 1973 *Flood Tide of Empire* (259). But he also draws on much (although by no means all) of the scholarship on this topic that has appeared since Cook wrote, including his own work. Gough knows the terrain and sources he is dealing with inside out and, for the most part, writes about them evocatively. However, the narrative is a little recondite and repetitive in places; and Gough sometimes draws connections between actions and texts, and attributes direction to history, where matters are probably muddier. In all, I think, his writing and imagery reinforce the romance of the story he tells – as one of “forgotten dreams” – and perhaps with some adverse effects. Describing his subject as “a charming theme” that comes “out of the fog banks of history,” and in thus celebrating the exploits of Europeans as they navigate their way from parable to fact, the book is something of a throwback to a less politically correct time when Native history had a less exacting hold on how BC history was conceived and written (17). Native people appear in Gough’s story, and prominently so at crucial points, such as at Nootka Sound in 1792. But by and large Native attachments to the lands around Juan de Fuca’s Strait, and the implications of European exploration and imperial rivalry for their position on their land, come second in a story, which is basically one of European endeavour. As such, Gough’s book raises some important questions about the nature of historical origins and why some historical narratives emanating from them become dominant and others don’t.

*Empires, Nations, and Families:
A History of the North American
West, 1800–1860*

Anne F. Hyde

Lincoln: University of Nebraska
Press, 2011. 628 pp. \$45.00 cloth

JEAN BARMAN

University of British Columbia

Empires, Nations, and Families: A History of the North American West, 1800–1860, by Anne Hyde is the second of six volumes scheduled to appear in the History of the American West series, which is intended to reflect current thought alongside earlier approaches to gender, ethnicity, and the environment in texts that are both scholarly and broadly engaging. *Empires, Nations, and Families* has been justifiably commended for doing this, winning the Bancroft Prize and being shortlisted for a Pulitzer Prize. The volume is relevant to British Columbia both for what it does and for what it does not do.

While British Columbia, as such, never enters the text, Hyde considers the Pacific Northwest fur economy, centred first at Astoria (Fort George) and then at Fort Vancouver, across the Columbia River from today’s Portland and extending north through much of the future province. She takes this region so seriously that it merits a full eighty pages of text and notes (89–145, 400–7, 507–11, 522–29, 550–51, 561–62). In doing this, Hyde extends the usual approach by attending to, as she frames it, the local alongside the global. Centring on long-time Fort Vancouver head John McLoughlin, her account is distinguished by its close and respectful attention to the family he had with a half-Cree woman and to women’s roles

more generally in the fur economy. “Native people” and “Métis,” to use her terminology, are integral to the story she tells at a sometimes very personal level. Hyde rightfully reminds us that, in probing such relationships, we need to move beyond “our own deep cultural worries about race” to “how these families thought about themselves” (97), and this she very commendably accomplishes.

Hyde does not, at the same time, extend her interest and analysis much beyond that thin layer at the top of the Pacific Northwest fur economy. Regular employees she characterizes not very accurately as “Native or French Canadians, often of mixed race and illiterate” (119), their number purportedly including, for some inexplicable reason, “West Indians” (120). Hyde recognizes that officers were likely to leave at the end of their employment, whereas employees “often settled in frontier areas with their Native families” (101). However, she assumes that these families headed to Red River and hence out of her purview, whereas in practice they remained in clear sight, which she would have realized had she cast her net a bit more widely. Hyde’s account is perforce limited by her reliance on the usual secondary and some printed primary sources, and by American historical assumptions, as with her placing French-Canadian settlement in the Willamette Valley south of Fort Vancouver after the arrival of American Protestant missionaries (133), whereas in reality the latter set themselves down next door precisely because French Canadians were already there and doing so well.

Empires, Nations, and Families is well worth reading not only for its Pacific Northwest sections, which essentially form a small monograph, but also,

and in its entirety, for setting early British Columbia within a larger North American context.

*Landscapes and Social
Transformations on the
Northwest Coast: Colonial
Encounters in the Fraser Valley*

Jeff Oliver

Tucson: University of Arizona
Press, 2010. 264 pp. \$55.00 cloth.

R. SCOTT SHEFFIELD
University of the Fraser Valley

Landscapes and Social Transformations on the Northwest Coast is a significant addition to our understanding of colonialism, settler-Indigenous relations, and human-land relations in British Columbia. Jeff Oliver’s work is part of a growing trend that grants primacy to *place* in this historical process and privileges the local over the broader brush strokes of the grand narrative. Oliver employs this sharp local focus to articulate “a view of the landscape that engages the social experiences of people living in the past, individuals as well as social groups,” and a perspective presenting “a more ambiguous and messy picture, exposing a canvas of false starts, interruptions, and uncertainty” (5). After setting the scene, Oliver begins in the immediate pre-contact era with a reconstruction of Indigenous relationships in the landscape of the Fraser Valley and then tracks these relationships and settler conceptions of the land through to the early twentieth century. He examines much of this historical and geographical terrain through the lens of encounter while eschewing or unsettling the

field's common binaries: colonizer versus colonized, core versus periphery, hunter-gatherer versus agriculturalist, among others.

Landscapes and Social Transformations is a highly intelligent and important monograph deserving of much praise. Oliver possesses the rare gifts of eloquence and economy of words, which enables him to produce, for all its conceptual complexity and temporal coverage, a book comprising just over two hundred pages of text. More impressive, however, is the thoughtful and deft manner with which he takes the familiar tropes and more recent revisionist nuances of colonial history and complicates them with his ground-level engagement with the Fraser Valley. It is not that Oliver rejects the value of the broader conceptual framework, but, as he puts it, "attempting to read the permutations of place through such broad frames of reference can result in rather predictable plotlines, histories that homogenize patterns across time and space and reduce complex issues to black-and-white caricatures" (202). This insight is evident in his exploration of precontact Stó:lō interactions with the landscapes of the Fraser Valley, which reveal a more complex and interventionist relationship that was "not as ecologically passive as perceived" (161). Significantly, Oliver provides the same thorough and sophisticated exploration of settler interrelationships with the land, a side of the exchange too often simplified within the broader linear trajectory of the grand narrative. Instead, Oliver finds a colonizing population with diverse, and sometimes conflicting, values and relationships with the landscape they came to settle and transform. At the very local level, he notes: "Where individuals went about the routine tasks of homesteading, concepts of progress and visions of a

better future were sometimes difficult to grasp" (162). Even the landscape itself is problematized, with the usually unidirectional colonial transformation from wilderness to bucolic landscape unsettled when a wilderness recolonized previously cleared spaces abandoned by failed or disillusioned newcomers.

Only in the last substantive chapter, which explores settler identity into the early twentieth century, is the evidence a little thin and the argument less persuasive. However, this does not detract from a thoughtful and excellent work of scholarship.

*Marjorie Too Afraid to Cry:
A Home Child Experience*

Patricia Skidmore

Toronto: Dundurn, 2012. 304 pp.
\$30.00 paper.

PATRICK A. DUNAE
University of Victoria

THE PRINCE OF WALES Fairbridge Farm School was located near Duncan, British Columbia. Between 1935 and 1950 it accommodated over three hundred underprivileged British children. Marjorie Arnison was one of them. She arrived at the farm school in 1937 when she was ten years old, accompanied by her eight-year-old brother. She came from a large, impoverished family in northeast England. Local authorities persuaded Marjorie's mother to entrust some of her children to the Fairbridge Society, knowing that the children would be sent overseas to Australia or Canada. At the time, it seemed like a reasonable survival strategy – one that would ease the family's financial difficulties while promising a more comfortable future for

some of the children overseas. But the consequences of the decision were dire, as this account by Marjorie's daughter, Patricia Skidmore, reveals. Marjorie was treated callously by social workers and immigration officials in England; and, as the title of the book indicates, she was acutely anxious when she and her brother were despatched to Canada. After a very long trans-Atlantic and transcontinental journey, they reached the Fairbridge children's village at Cowichan Station. She and her brother were assigned to different dormitories. There were fourteen duplex dormitories and four single houses on the property. Each unit accommodated about a dozen boys and girls and a resident supervisor who was called a cottage mother. Children attended a provincial elementary school, on site, and were given additional vocational training, with the expectation that boys would become farmers and girls would become homemakers. Like other Fairbridgians, Marjorie and her brother stayed at the facility until they were sixteen years old, when they went to outside employment and, it was hoped, embarked on a prosperous life in Canada.

The Vancouver Island farm school was modelled on a concept developed in the early 1900s by Kingsley Fairbridge, a Rhodes Scholar from South Africa. He envisaged Arcadian communities in the British dominions where children from impoverished homes and crowded cities in Britain would be raised in a nurturing, rural environment. His objective was to promote child welfare and empire settlement. Inaugurated in Western Australia in 1912, the Fairbridge system was widely admired when it was implemented in British Columbia. Certainly it was better than earlier schemes, whereby disadvantaged children from Britain were consigned to farm families in remote places in

central and eastern Canada. The plight of British home children is now well known. But the Fairbridge system was also flawed and, the author asserts, Fairbridgians should be included in the larger diaspora of British home children.

Skidmore regards child emigration as an appalling practice and "shameful part of British history" (14). The author and her mother were extremely gratified when the British prime minister, Gordon Brown, formally apologized to "the victims of the child migrant program on behalf of the UK government" (9). They were invited to London in February 2010 to hear the apology. The experience was transformative. For a long time, Marjorie was embittered that her mother had apparently colluded with the child welfare authorities in the breakup of their family. Marjorie felt like a cast-off and so never spoke of her background after she married and had children of her own. Unsettled by this genealogical void, the author coaxed her mother into "unlocking" her personal history. They travelled to England, where Marjorie reunited with siblings she had not seen in seventy years. The prime minister's apology a few years later helped them to reconcile, posthumously, with their late mother. It was also redemptive for the author, who came to appreciate Marjorie's tenacious character and to value her lineage: "I began to see who I was. I was no longer the daughter of a child migrant; I was the daughter of a child migrant with a family history" (31).

Most of the book deals with the rediscovered childhood of Marjorie and her family in England and the powerful emotional experience of witnessing the official apology for child migration in the British House of Commons. The book includes a transcript of Brown's statement and a foreword by

the former prime minister, lauding the courage of former child migrants like Marjorie. But the book also deals with historical events in British Columbia. In the 1940s, the Fairbridge farm school was the focus of a struggle between professional social workers, who opposed institutional childcare in any form, and the England-based Fairbridge Society and its supporters in British Columbia. The author alludes to this struggle and to some of the contestants, including Harry T. Logan, who was principal of the farm school at this time. Remembered today as a distinguished UBC classicist and historian, Logan was a colleague of Kingsley Fairbridge at Oxford University and a champion of the Fairbridge child welfare system in British Columbia. From her mother's recollections and other sources, the author describes life at the farm school. She remarks that, while Marjorie "never forgot her family [in England] and never stopped missing them ... in time the pain of losing her family lessened and the other Fairbridge children became her substitute family" (218). The book includes a bibliography of works relating to the Fairbridge system and the larger topic of child migration. It is illustrated with archival documents and photographs.

Fishing the River of Time

Tony Taylor

Vancouver: Greystone Books, 2013.
216 pp. \$19.95 paper.

J.F. BOSHER
Qualicum Beach

HERE IS AN entertaining addition to the shelf of books about

Vancouver Island. Depending upon the reader's own experiences in life, and the breadth of her or his interests, s/he may be amused by Taylor's rambling memories of fishing in the Cowichan Valley in the early 1960s and again forty years later, or by the potpourri of thoughts about life that leak out of Taylor on nearly every page. "I am here to review every aspect of life and," he tells us, "I have found I do that best while fishing. For many of us, going into the bush, climbing mountains or canoeing down rivers are ways of coming to terms with reality" (21). He fishes for much the same reasons that Michael Kitchen does in the film series Foyle's War. But "reality" for Taylor is far from simple. An adventurous British professor of geology who has settled in Australia after many travels, he worries about global warming and thinks about life on Vancouver Island as what he calls "the mystery of the great batholith" (171). Why, he wonders, does all this flora and fauna grow so abundantly on its massive bed of acid granite? And why is Australia so different?

What prompts the author to write is an unexpected chance to spend a few days with his eight-year-old grandson, Ned, whom he has never met before because the family dispersed when he and his wife divorced. Halfway through the book Ned arrives in the care of Taylor's son, Matthew. We learn nothing about Matthew; it is Ned who interests the author. We are treated to Taylor's reflections on children and how to deal with them. While they are out fishing, he gently and indirectly tries to interest Ned in the great world. "My grandson and I had been exploring one of the outer layers of a ball of iron hurtling relentlessly through space. Although the locals called this piece of water the Cowichan and our species called this globe the Earth, the most

obvious layer is water” (204). It is in this context that he thinks about the Cowichan River and the life around it. Readers will interpret this book in various ways. For me the most interesting passages are those that present Taylor’s comments about other British emigrants on the island, such as: Roderick Langmere Haig-Brown (1908-76); Lieutenant-Colonel Dr. Richard Nugent Stoker (1851-1931); Raymond Murray Patterson (1898-1984), an author from County Durham in England; and Henry March (1866-1950) from Rochdale, Lancashire. Strange to relate, Taylor knows almost nothing about Robert Aubrey Meade (1852-1912), whose cabin he lived in for some years, about forty kilometres from Duncan. This is a pity as he might have enjoyed the story of this “remittance man” from Suffolk who had tried unsuccessfully to grow coffee in Ceylon, habitually drank champagne, was called out of his cabin to meet distinguished visitors because he owned the only formal dress-suit in the district and was a descendant of the impoverished earls of Clanwilliam. Son of a British army officer from the Isle of Madeira and a woman born in Penang on the Malay coast, Meade was a second cousin of Admiral Richard James Meade, RN (1832-1907) and of Sir Robert Henry Meade (1835-98), permanent under-secretary at the Colonial Office (see Boshier 2012, 403-4).

These contacts show that, instinctively, Taylor lived within a British circle. Even the American, James Scott Negley Farson (1890-1960), to whom he often refers, lived in England for many years, joined the Royal Flying Corps in the First World War, married a niece of Stoker’s brother Bram, and died at home in Georgetown, North Devon. As Taylor writes, Farson “considered himself an Englishman” (73), spent some years

on Vancouver Island, and published a book about it, *Going Fishing* (1946), of which Taylor speaks highly. Although he does not seem to think of himself in these terms, Taylor turns out to be another of those English emigrants who feels at home on Vancouver Island, even though he has settled in another part of the Empire. The Canadians who invaded the Island in such numbers during the Second World War no doubt felt uncomfortable with him, and the feeling was certainly mutual. But Taylor carries on “irregardless” (as my university students used to say), his mind flooded with thoughts about the great outdoors he loves so much.

REFERENCES

- Boshier, John, 2012. *Imperial Vancouver Island: Who Was Who, 1850-1950*, 2nd ed. England: The Book Repository.

Secret Service: Political Policing in Canada from the Fenians to Fortress America

Reginald Whitaker, Gregory S. Kealey, and Andrew Parnaby

Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2012. 720 pp. \$39.95 paper.

JEREMY BUDDENHAGEN
University of Victoria

Secret Service is the first full-length narrative on security intelligence in Canada since Stan Horrall and Carl Betke’s 1978 official RCMP history, *Canada’s Security Service: An Historical Outline, 1864-1966*. This is a significant achievement for the study of intelligence in Canada. The book traces a variety of perceived threats

to national security, beginning with Fenians in the 1860s, extending to Bolshevism and communism in the early and mid-twentieth century, and concluding with separatism and Islamic fundamentalism in the late twentieth and early twenty-first centuries. In the process of exploring these threats, the authors reveal that Canada has had a long and dramatic history with espionage. They suggest that Canadian elites have been able to maintain power by waging clandestine assaults against certain segments of the population they deemed “subversive,” thereby sidestepping the democratic process. The authors term this a “secret history of conservatism” (11) in Canada.

One of the strengths of this book is its ability to transform intelligence history from a subdiscipline to a lens through which to view broader historical themes in the history of Canada. Of particular interest for BC historians is the exploration, in Chapter 2, of Vancouver immigration officer William Hopkinson. While Hopkinson was officially an immigration officer, he was secretly working as a spy for the Canadian government to investigate Sikh radicalism on the west coast before and during the *Komagata Maru* crisis of 1914. The authors weave together the historical narrative of Hopkinson’s activities to show how anti-Asian sentiments were institutionalized by secret regimes within the Canadian state. This is just one fascinating and powerful example of how “secret police with extraordinary powers ... are an ongoing problem for a healthy democracy” (15). As the authors point out, a disturbing question concerns why the existence of a secret police has not been controversial in Canada.

“Democracy” serves as a dominant theme in the book, and at one point the authors note that a comparison

with the East German Stasi “reveals a mild Canadian version” (9-10) of the same tools that are employed by totalitarian states to maintain power. Unfortunately, the authors do not expand on this observation to include recent scholarship on intelligence theory. In their *Secrets d’Etat : Pouvoirs et renseignement dans le monde contemporain* (2005), Olivier Forcade and Sébastien Laurent point out that there is a “reluctance” on the part of “Anglo-Saxon” (44) scholars to examine the role of secret police in the construction of liberal democracies. However, they also argue that this does not mean that secret services have not been just as important to the construction of liberal democracies as they have to the construction of totalitarian states. While a deeper engagement with intelligence theory would have given this work an added dimension, it does not diminish its overall achievement.

This is a must-read for anyone interested in intelligence in Canada and will no doubt set the pace of scholarly inquiry into its history for some time. It is also a very important study for those interested in how the boundaries of race, class, gender, and difference were (and are) coercively enforced by a “secret state within the state.”



*Yorke Island and the Uncertain
War: Defending Canada's
Western Coast during WWII*

Catherine Marie Gilbert

Campbell River: Ptarmigan Press,
2012. 72 pp. Illus. \$24.95 paper.

PETER N. MOOGK

University of British Columbia

THE SECOND World War is fading from living memory, and military veterans of that conflict are now rare. Their average age is eighty-seven. Given this situation, the author and Danny Brown, a Campbell River Museum volunteer, deserve praise for obtaining contemporary letters and for interviewing those people who had a connection with the five-hundred-man garrison on Yorke Island. Coastal guns on this island at the junction of Sunderland Channel and Johnstone Strait guarded the north end of the Inside Passage against Japanese surface raiders. The cover's claim that, "from 1937-1945[,] this was Canada's key western defence against Japanese attack [by sea]" overstates the island's role. The gun batteries of Victoria-Esquimalt and Port Angeles deserve that honour. I also doubt that it was effective as "a lookout post for possible Japanese aircraft heading for Vancouver" (2). That would be a circuitous route.

The Foreword exaggerates the originality of this book. In the early 1970s, R. Victor Stevenson began researching the island's military history and contributed a chapter about Yorke Island's wartime role to his and my book *Vancouver Defended: A History of the Men and Guns of the Lower Mainland Defences, 1859-1949* (1978). Since then, the island, with its decayed brick and concrete buildings and

gun emplacements, has attracted the attention of local historians. It is now an attraction for water-borne tourists.

The strength of this book is its account of living conditions on the island and its stories about the relationships that developed between the servicemen and civilians in this once-remote area. The book is generously illustrated with amateur snapshots and official photographs from the war years. The narrative is anecdotal and sometimes digresses into extraneous details. The use of sources is uncritical. Quotations from secondary and primary sources sometimes appear in the text without Gilbert's identifying the author or the context. Conflicting opinions on the volume and quality of food served to the garrison, or regarding the experience of being stationed on the island, are left unresolved. All evidence is not of equal value and it can be appraised for veracity. A personal letter from the period carries more weight than does later hearsay. In this book, first-hand memories from a few veterans, such as Sergeant Bernie Smith, Justice John Layton, and John Rorison, are supplemented by second-hand recollections from the children and even from a grandchild (39-40) of those who knew the fortified island. Some eyewitness informants were teenagers or small children during the war.

A proofreader familiar with the Canadian army and navy could have prevented several blunders: the Canadian Scottish Regiment is called the "Royal Canadian Scottish"; the RCASC is identified as the "Army Service Corp"; HMCS is rendered as "His Majesty's Canadian Service"; and there are "navel guns" (47). The 15th (Vancouver) Coast Brigade/Regiment, whose men operated the island's guns and searchlights, is given various names. An officer in a naval

uniform is identified as army major J.E. Piercey (39). Canadian artillery buglers played “Retreat at Sunset” and not the American “Taps” (55).

Despite these shortcomings, the book is an attractive evocation of the war years in the area of Johnstone Strait. And it contains some fascinating details, such as how servicemen evaded military censorship by giving their letters “to somebody going to town on leave” to be posted on Vancouver Island or in Vancouver (58).

*Righting Canada’s Wrongs:
Italian Canadian Internment in
the Second World War*

Pamela Hickman and Jean
Smith Cavalluzzo

Toronto: James Lorimer and
Company, 2012. iii pp. \$34.95 cloth.

STEPHEN A. FIELDING
University of Victoria

THIS BOOK IS part of the Canadian government’s Community Historical Recognition Program (CHRP), a five-year effort to revisit uncomfortable moments in its past. It re-examines the experiences of so-called Italian enemy aliens during the Second World War. The authors draw from a broad range of primary sources. Their use of images is so extensive and orderly that the reader can follow the story apart from the written narrative. There is also an interactive website with personal interviews and video footage, ideal for the Grades 8 through 12 readership.

Chapters 1 and 2 tell the Italian migrant story by weaving together conditions in turn-of-the-century Italy, oceanic voyages, resettlement,

early community life in Canada, and surviving connections between Canada and the Italian peninsula. At each stage, Italian arrivals were targets of exploitation – from their *padroni* farm “masters” in Italy to *padroni* employment brokers in Canada. They were second-class citizens in Canada’s social “northern exposure,” which preferred arrivals from northern and western Europe. The country’s Italian population – some 100,000 in 1930 – found respite from cultural dislocation and hard labour in the “four f’s” of family, faith, food, and festivals. Chapter 3 charts the rise of fascism during the 1930s, showing how Mussolini’s 1935 invasion of Ethiopia, and the public backlash that followed, prompted most Italian Canadians to abandon ties with Il Duce and a sizeable minority of three thousand to maintain their fealty (48).

Chapter 4 paints Italian Canadians as loyal wartime subjects. We find them buying Victory Bonds, planting victory gardens, enlisting for Canadian military service, and making public pledges of allegiance to the Crown. It is a powerful juxtaposition to what follows in Chapters 5 and 6, where Italy joins Nazi Germany against Canada and its Allies. The RCMP rounds up some six hundred Italian Canadians and sends them to camps in Alberta, Ontario, and New Brunswick. None is formally charged. Moving images, oral testimonies, and letter excerpts capture the raids and dislocation that followed. In a powerful example, a man is led away in handcuffs while (his?) children run behind. At times, the authors suggest that these were concentration, rather than internment, camps by emphasizing the shooting targets on prisoners’ backs and the ubiquitous barbed wire. Elsewhere we find a more nuanced picture, with men

firing the kitchen staff and replacing them with Italian cooks (77), or with the internee whose pasta company supplied the camps while he himself was under watch (89). Chapters 7 and 8 show the financial and emotional strain placed on prisoners' families, and Chapter 9 is a fascinating walk through the process of historical redress and its multiple iterations.

I have a few qualms. A promotional farming pamphlet, reproduced here, asserts that "many were attracted" by the offer (21). In reality, the number of Italian agricultural migrants was scant. Kananaskis is in Alberta, not British Columbia (68). And a picture of Toronto's Little Italy from the 1970s illustrates a section about the 1930s (37). More troubling is the authors' use of "racism" to explain the mistreatment of Italian Canadians. The term also features in the official press release ("how prejudice and racism set the stage for interment"). It implies that Canadian society understood there to be an Italian race in the 1940s and that Italians were not considered white. I am aware of no academic work that takes either position for this period. Italian Canadians were certainly victims of discrimination and prejudice, but "racism" seems misguided. The book and series title, *Righting Canada's Wrongs*, is similarly problematic. The notion of righting something is awkward. We can't fix the past, but it is possible to visit and address it in a sensitive manner. The book accomplishes this feat wonderfully; the title should better reflect this.

*Injustice Served: The Story
of British Columbia's Italian
Enemy Aliens during World War II*

Ray Culos

Montreal: Cusmano Books, 2012.
216 pp. \$50.00 cloth.

STEPHEN A. FIELDING
University of Victoria

HISTORICAL redress is a touchy subject and should be handled with care. At root, it is a question about *what* to address. *Injustice Served* is funded by the vaguely termed Community Historical Recognition Program (CHRP), the Canadian government's five-year effort to revisit uncomfortable moments in its past. It is part of a larger project that re-examines the experiences of so-called Italian enemy aliens during the Second World War.

The Italian word for the study of history is *La storia*, literally meaning "the story." *Injustice Served* conveys the truest sense of the word. Like Culos's earlier writings, the chapters are thematic and chronological, readable and intimate. Many of the personal accounts are drawn from his first survey, *Vancouver's Society of Italians* (vol. 1), but they find new life in this comprehensive coffee-table format. The author's storytelling style effectively places the larger forces of geopolitical conflict, home front anxieties, and Italian community tensions at a level of lived experience.

On 10 June 1940, Italy declared war on Canada and its allies. Two days later, Canadian minister of justice Ernest Lapointe declared illegal all "politically and nationalistically skewed [i.e., Italian-Canadian] organizations." The RCMP arrested 632 Italian-Canadian

men, forty-four of them from British Columbia, and sentenced them without trial to three internment camps. They were destined to spend an average of fifteen months under military supervision. The other Italian “enemy aliens” in the province were Italian nationals ordered to leave the Pacific coast and some nine hundred Italian residents required to report monthly to the RCMP (18). Vancouver was the fulcrum of pro-fascist activity in British Columbia, alongside a smaller pocket in Trail. The fascist question primarily concerned the activities of the club *Circolo Giulio Giordani*. Formed in 1927 and knitted together by an oath to Mussolini and support from the Italian vice-consul, the *Giordani* trumpeted the virtues of fascist Italy through meetings, youth activities, propaganda film nights, and a local newspaper. Members took pride in Italy’s political and economic resurgence, particularly in response to the discrimination they faced in Canada. However, Culos contends that beyond the *Giordani* element, “pro-Canada was the majority sentiment of the Italian Colony” (18). Even those interned for their fascist leanings ranged from “strongly committed, otherwise naive, [or] innocent” (19–20, 64).

Italy’s war with Canada exposed fractures in Italian-Canadian communities. Pro-fascist and anti-fascist sides were already clashing in local newspapers and club politics, and some discovered in the theatre of war an opportunity to frame an adversary. Such tragic outcomes were possible because the RCMP relied heavily on community informants to select internees, a practice hauntingly showcased in the new CHRP-funded play *Paradise by the River*.

The book has its surprises. Chapter 9 tells of the sad irony of a man serving in the air force while his father was

quarantined at Kananaskis, Alberta (144). We also learn that internment had its sunnier features. Guards were generally quite amicable and lenient to the Italians, joining them in a game of cards or glass of wine. Nor were camp responsibilities or mealtimes cumbersome. One man left the compound healthier and 11 kilograms heavier than the day he arrived. Internees admitted that their loved ones suffered greater hardships, struggling to raise children and to support households in the absence of a husband, father, son or brother.

The book ends on a surprising note, asking: “Was justice served?” The author has already answered the question in the title. Justice was certainly not served to the internees, who, regardless of political fealty, were denied legal counsel and habeas corpus. Is Culos suggesting that the state committed a greater “crime against ethnicity”? This was the argument made by the National Congress of Italian Canadians and contained in Prime Minister Brian Mulroney’s official apology in 1990. Other writers have since challenged this view. The question simplifies the author’s implicit point that the Canadian government pursued suspected fascists and not Italians per se, but evidently humiliated Italian Canadians well beyond the activities of a fascist minority.

It is sad, but perhaps fitting, to discover that all of the interned BC Italians died before the writing of this book. They never lived to see their stories in print. Yet somehow in their absence, and in the spirit of Italian *storia*, *InJustice Served* guarantees that their stories will live on.

REFERENCES

- Culos, Raymond. 1998. *Vancouver's Society of Italians*, vol. 1. Vancouver: Harbour.
- Rossi, Vittorio. 2010. *Paradise by the River*. Dir. Marianne McIsaac. Richmond Hill, ON, Shadowpath Theatre Productions. Based on Vittorio Rossi, *Paradise by the River*. Vancouver: Talonbooks, 1998.

*Cartographies of Violence:
Japanese-Canadian Women,
Memory, and the Subjects of the
Internment*

Mona Oikawa

Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2012. 492 pp. \$39.95 paper.

JORDAN STANGER-ROSS
University of Victoria

IN THE SECOND chapter of her powerful book, Mona Oikawa indicts the critical reception of well-known Japanese-Canadian representations of internment. Readings of Muriel Kitagawa's *This Is My Own*, for example, have tended to "exceptionalize" it (reinforcing a broader trope of "silent survivors") or to "suggest resignation and even pathology" on the part of the author, masking her "sheer outrage and sharp critique" (69). In this study of the transmission of knowledge about the internment, by contrast, Oikawa situates Kitagawa within a vital multigenerational tradition: the Japanese-Canadian women who are the focus and inspiration of this book fought back against the multiple harms of internment and, since the 1940s, have continued to articulate critiques of Canadian racism and to serve as the

most important caretakers of their own histories. *Cartographies of Violence*, itself a work of "outrage and sharp critique," makes a valuable contribution to this legacy.

After two chapters that critique interpretations of the internment that minimize its significance, sever it from the present, and homogenize the experiences of its survivors, Oikawa uses her interviews of twenty-one Japanese-Canadian women to illuminate "what the forced movement of over 22,000 people and the places in which they were incarcerated enabled both in the past and the present, and the role the Internment has played in the reproduction of a racial social order and a white settler nation-state" (13). Pairing historian Ian McKay's analysis of Canadian liberalism with the theoretical literature on racialization and gender, Oikawa positions the internment and its representation at the centre of the ascendancy of the Canadian "symbolic liberal subject" (10).

The book is most persuasive when it is grounded in the rich and revealing interviews that Oikawa conducted in the 1990s. Aya had three young children and was pregnant with a fourth when she was uprooted from her home in Steveston, where she was born, and separated from her husband and her own mother and brothers. Interned first at the Greenwood camp, she and her children were relocated four further times between 1942 and 1946 (132). Her fourth child was one of twenty-five hundred Japanese Canadians born in captivity. Aya's story, among others, teaches us that Japanese-Canadian experiences of internment were shaped by the particulars of place, personal circumstance, gender, and economic standing. The effects of these highly differentiated, and yet shared, hardships linger to the present day.

Although Canadian policies racialized Japanese Canadians as “one group and one enemy” (104), Oikawa forcefully demonstrates that our histories must not do the same.

Despite its many strengths, the book is not without missteps. Oikawa criticizes Patricia Roy on the basis of a short co-authored volume, overlooking Roy’s more influential, substantial, and recent work (which Oikawa might have folded into her critique of liberalism). Similarly (following scholars like Ann Gomer Sunahara), Oikawa is severely critical of mid-century sociologist Forrest E. La Violette, whom she lumps together with federal officials under the category of “white men” seeking to justify Canadian policies (28). Careful criticism of La Violette’s work is well warranted; however, his volume (published in 1948) also situates the internment within a century of racism, highlights Japanese-Canadian resistance, and criticizes the government’s handling of Japanese-Canadian property at a time when that issue remained before a royal commission. (La Violette describes the property liquidation as “entirely racial and without concern for Canadian citizenship.”) More broadly, Oikawa’s theorization of spatial as opposed to “temporal” analysis could perhaps have been more fully articulated. While Oikawa’s point that history is not easily left in the past is well taken (and well sustained in the volume), it is not clear that this insight derives, as she suggests, from freeing history from “temporality” (226). Finally, in rare but important instances the analysis seems to flatten its sources. Detailing the views of women who did not see themselves as interned despite their own uprooting – “it wasn’t like internment at all ... I mean there was freedom,” says one woman (181) – Oikawa nonetheless

presses to convey these experiences as incarceration (176–81). She is right to stress that such freedoms were very limited, but greater fidelity to her own emphasis on the equivocation and complexity inherent in memory and experience might have led Oikawa to a richer analysis of these reflections.

Future scholars will grapple with Oikawa’s book. This is an important and serious contribution to the scholarship on a topic of vital importance. *Cartographies of Violence* demands attention, provokes reflection, and is sure to generate response.

REFERENCES

- Roy, Patricia. 2007. *The Triumph of Citizenship: The Japanese and Chinese in Canada, 1941–67*. Vancouver: UBC Press.
- La Violette, Forrest Emmanuel. 1948. *The Canadian Japanese and World War II: A Sociological and Psychological Account*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.

Finding Japan: Early Canadian Encounters with Asia

Anne Shannon

Victoria: Heritage House, 2012. 256 pp. \$19.95 paper.

YUKARI TAKAI
York University

Finding Japan: Early Canadian Encounters with Asia depicts stories of Canadians who went to Japan, or whose lives, dreams, achievements, and failures were intimately connected to Japan. In contrast to the far more familiar experiences of Japanese who moved across the Pacific in the other direction, this collection of stories of

Canadian men and women highlights how central their encounter with Japan was to their personal lives. More important, it sheds light on how significant their interactions with Japanese men and women were in shaping a history of modern Japan as well as a history of Canada.

Finding Japan chronicles intriguing, surprising, and at times sombre stories of Canadians and their Japanese contemporaries over the space of a century, from about 1850 to 1950. This was the very time when Japan transformed from a self-secluded feudal society into an emerging power in Asia, the Pacific, and the world. Canada, for its part, also went through significant change as it solidified its identity (or its many identities) from a British colony, to a dominion, and to a rising middle power in international politics and in the world economy.

Anne Shannon claims that Canada has long been a Pacific as well as an Atlantic and North American country. Fascinating narratives of colourful and extraordinary characters support her argument beautifully. Some well known, others less or little so, they include a half-Aboriginal son of a Hudson's Bay Company trader, who smuggled himself into Japan; missionary educators; social workers; prisoners of war during the Second World War; railway baron and Japanese art collector William Van Horne; Prime Minister Mackenzie King; and scholar-diplomat E. Herbert Norman. Of particular interest is Shannon's attention to Canadian women, including Martha Cartmell, Margaret Elizabeth Armstrong, and Deaconess Archer, who poured into Japan from the 1880s onward. Largely from the prosperous middle classes of small-town Ontario and Atlantic Canada, they were educated, independent, and

often unmarried. It is hardly surprising that these Canadian contemporaries of Isabella Bird were critical of the position of Japanese women in a society in which, Canadians and other foreigners generally believed, a vision of women oscillated between a beautiful yet mystified image of geisha, on the one hand, and its polar opposite of the "good wife and wise mother," on the other. However, Meiji Japan was undergoing rapid Westernization from above under the strong initiative of the imperial government. Female education was one of the sites where political, economic, social, and ideological reforms took on a new prestige. Seizing the moment, Cartmell founded a private school in a sought-after neighbourhood of Azabu, offering an education similar to that offered at an Ontario boarding school to daughters of prominent Japanese businessmen and politicians (62-63).

The book is written without any academic trappings. Footnotes are absent, but the references at the end of the book provide additional information for readers interested in knowing more about the portraits of the captivating characters. This is not to downplay the significance of this book. On the contrary, written with wit, personal flair, and acute observation of human behaviour, *Finding Japan* engages an educated general public as well as students and scholars interested in the intersection of the modern histories of Japan and Canada. Further, a remarkable collection of photos and images enhances the delight of reading. Ultimately, the book offers a new and pleasant way to assess the historical roots of Canada's links and connections to Japan and the Pacific world.

*The Punjabis in British
Columbia: Location,
Labour, First Nations, and
Multiculturalism*

Kamala Elizabeth Nayar

Montreal and Kingston: McGill-
Queen's University Press, 2012.
384 pp. \$32.95 paper.

ANNE MURPHY

University of British Columbia

KAMALA Elizabeth Nayar's groundbreaking work, *Punjabis in British Columbia*, represents a significant addition to a number of fields. At a basic level, it focuses on the important but sorely understudied community of Punjabis who played a crucial role in the resource economies and overall development of the northern regions of the province, but the scope and potential impact of the work extends much further: it contributes in a profound way to our understanding of the "intercultural interaction" that characterizes many locations in North American society. It focuses not on the urban communities that so often garner attention but on a highly diverse rural community, in the process revealing "both the complexity of ethnic pluralism and the process through which immigrant communities became collaborative members of Canadian society" (177). Most significantly, this is a finely tuned and sensitive study of the interactions among members of the First Nations of northern British Columbia, Punjabis, and some other non-Anglo immigrants. In this it joins a range of works that explicate the evolving relationships among individuals and communities that have shaped the history and present of British Columbia and the western

United States (Hayashi 2007; Mawani 2012). Anglo-Canadians also figure in this complex story, but not at its centre; instead, we are given access to the changing worlds of diverse "social actors" (73) who have lived and worked in northern British Columbia (and later, in other locations in urban Canada).

Nayar's work is structured around three variables: aspects of Punjabi ethnicity, including the "cultural assets" (63) that helped Punjabis adjust and thrive; British Columbia labour issues and histories; and policies and practices of Canadian multiculturalism. She pays careful attention to how different locations (primarily urban versus rural) and gender have affected the lived experiences of these variables (5, 18-19). She draws on an impressive array of carefully delineated sources, so refreshing today when too much contemporary culture work is vaguely defined (19ff.). Interviews richly animate the work and are well utilized, with only occasional senses of "too much" of the first-person narrative. This is a common problem in oral history texts, and there are good reasons to see this text as being within that genre. This is particularly true of the three longer "ethnographic narratives" (21) included in Chapters 3, 5, and 9, which contribute significantly to the overall narrative and the rich presence of the individual voices within it. Nayar's deep overarching analysis, however, goes beyond what most oral histories achieve.

The remaining chapters define the labour history of the Skeena region and the role of Punjabis, among others, in this developing economy over the course of the twentieth century (Chapter 2); the ways in which gender was configured and reconfigured in the experience of migration and in the opportunity that this afforded women to work outside the home (Chapter 4); and the cultural

interactions – both antagonistic and not – that ensued over the course of nearly a century of significant Punjabi presence in the region (Chapters 6–8), including the crucial roles played by unions as “intercultural mediators” (160ff.). The general historical introduction to Punjab and Punjabi culture in the Introduction is one of the least compelling aspects of the work, given that it does not engage fully with recent critical scholarship; however, the overall orientation of the work on the history of the development of northern British Columbia and its communities is finely wrought and compelling.

Two aspects constitute a notable contribution: the attention of the work (1) to gender, and (2), as noted above, to intercultural interactions, particularly between First Nations and Punjabis. Nayar argues that women in the Skeena region engaged in work outside the home for economic reasons, as might be expected, but that, in so doing, they experienced significant personal satisfaction, which was particularly surprising given the grueling difficulty of the work in which most engaged. This, she finds, is in direct contrast to the experience of Punjabi women who immigrated to the Vancouver area in the same period (100). For many Punjabi women in the Skeena area, working in the fish cannery provided a crucial “social base” and a “substitute for village life” (105). This afforded Punjabi women new opportunities and drew on Punjabi cultural resources, such as *izzat*, or honour, of which Nayar provides an unconventional and wholly positive reading (without, however, sufficient discussion of some of the more negative consequences for women of the burden of maintaining honour) (128ff.).

The book’s approach to gender is compelling not just for its ethnographic detail and for the historical context

within which it is placed. When Nayar asserts that “what Punjabi – as well as other – women needed was not to be saved from their patriarchal culture, but rather to be treated fairly on the job” (160), we have a unique and assertive articulation of what must be attended to both in analytical and in public policy terms. This book eschews the simple evocation of “culture” as an explanatory device and carefully delineates why doing so is bound to fail. In this way it can help to shape policy and practice on a broad level.

The book’s exploration of “Skeena’s multi-ethnic workforce” provides a model of what a rich inter-ethnic study can achieve, both in its exquisite detail and in its comprehensive analysis (138ff.). Nayar does a fine job of detailing the nuances of the relationship between Punjabis and First Nations; the confusion among some Punjabis about the tensions between the groups, given that they seemed to have much in common with their respective experiences of British colonialism (185); and the ways in which some Punjabis sought to differentiate themselves as workers. “While Punjabis were successful in demonstrating that they were different from First Nations,” she writes, “this differentiation – regardless of what they endured as immigrants at the hand of the First Nations – only perpetuated the First Nations’ status as third class and reinforced the stereotypical image that the ‘established elite’ had of the First Nations” (19).

Cannery work brought Punjabi women into a problematic contact zone with First Nations workers who perceived their presence as a threat. Conflicts were common between Punjabis and First Nations, and were complex in their origins (e.g., 167ff., 188ff., 254–56). Such conflicts lessened as Punjabi immigrants acquired greater

English skills and mutual awareness grew among the groups. This is evident, Nayar argues, in the active interests many Punjabis took by the mid-1980s in broader intercultural events and activities as they reached out to a larger community. It also reflected a growing awareness among Punjabis of the grievances of First Nations in Canada and the brutal history that they had endured prior to contact with Punjabis (249-50). This portrait of the power of intercultural understanding and awareness provides compelling evidence of the need for education and awareness-building activities. Nayar's comparison with the United States in this context is shallow: the American "melting pot" model of conceptualizing cultural accommodation has been directly challenged since the 1970s in the United States, and that nation has no overarching "cultural policy" anyway (252). But this misunderstanding of the United States is mysteriously ubiquitous in Canada, so I note it here only as part of a general attempt to correct it. (For an engagement with the idea of the "melting pot" in more complex terms, see Wilson [2010].)

Nayar's critique of multiculturalism is substantive. She speaks of its "misuses," particularly with reference to "appeals for the ethnic vote;" she highlights the "ethnic insularity" of the Vancouver/Surrey community; and she provides compelling analysis of cultural and electoral politics up through the 2011 provincial election (212, 232-33). Nayar asserts what should be obvious but desperately needs stating: "the Punjabi community is not a single, monolithic entity" (222). Nayar not only says this, she shows it. If we can convince a larger community of this, it will do much to reorient cultural and political discourses in British Columbia towards evincing greater understanding and appreciation across community and

individual boundaries – something that Nayar shows us is possible. Nayar closes her work with an assertion of the need not to overly *culturize* such discourses of understanding but, rather, to address the issues Punjabis and others face in Canada today: "If ... issues of social inequality were to be adequately addressed, immigrants would be in a better position to move confidently towards a common ground with other citizens" (281). As is evident through *Punjabis in British Columbia*, it is Nayar's attention to concrete detail along with her cogent analysis that proves this to be true.

REFERENCES

- Hayashi, Robert. 2007. *Haunted by Waters: A Journey through Race and Place in the American West*. Iowa City: University of Iowa Press.
- Mawani, Renisa. 2009. *Colonial Proximities: Crossracial Encounters and Juridical Truths in British Columbia, 1871-1921*. Vancouver: UBC Press.
- Wilson, Sarah. 2010. *Melting-Pot Modernism*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press.

*The Artist in the Cloister:
The Life and Works of Father
Dunstan Massey*
Daphne Sleight

Victoria: Heritage House, 2013. 208
pp. \$26.95 paper.

MARIA TIPPETT
Cambridge University

ART AND ROMAN Catholicism have, for most of the Church's long history, gone hand in hand. And Roman Catholic churches, schools,

and abbeys in British Columbia are no exception. During the first decades of the twentieth century, the work of artists Sisters Mary Osithe and Marie Helene de la Croix adorned the walls of Victoria's St. Anne's Academy. From the middle of the last century, Father Dunstan has produced frescoes and paintings, sculptures, and stained glass windows for the Westminster Priory in Burnaby as well as for Westminster Abbey in Mission. And this is not all. Dunstan is an accomplished pianist, the author of several plays and poems, and the creator of films and multimedia events.

Bill Massey was born in Vancouver in 1924 to a modestly successful businessman and his French-Canadian wife. The couple's early separation saw Bill and his mother move to the east end of the city. Bill might have remained there had not Isabelle Burnada, an internationally known mezzo-soprano, and Amy Buckerfield, a wealthy philanthropist, heard about the boy's musical and artistic ability. These women paid for young Bill's music lessons. They subsidized his instruction at the Vancouver School of Art and later at the Academy of Applied and Fine Art. They saw to it that he visited the studios of local artists, such as former Group of Seven member Lawren Harris. And when Bill had accumulated a substantial body of work, they helped him show it at the Vancouver Art Gallery. He was sixteen years old.

The art critics made much of Bill Massey's east-end-of-the-city upbringing. And they praised him for not succumbing to Modernist art. What Bill's critics and patrons did not know, however, was that, in two years time, Bill Massey would renounce a career in art and music and enter the Benedictine Order, where, as Daphne Sleight tells us

in *The Artist in the Cloister: The Life and Works of Father Dunstan Massey*, "he would feel at home in a community that set high value on art and music and literacy" (61).

For his part, Father Dunstan could not have foreseen that he would initially be encouraged to paint in the austere late nineteenth-century Beuronese style. That he would sometimes be told what to paint. That carelessness would occasionally result in the destruction of his work. And that, prior to the construction of the Order's abbey in Mission, Abbot Eugene would make "a tour to study world art and architecture" instead of sending the artist who would produce the artwork for the new building (180).

It took a great deal of single-mindedness and tenacity for Father Dunstan to oversee these and other difficulties. Even so, he thinks: "The monastic life has been a blessing ... because it removed me from the mainstream of modern art" (192). This is true. Throughout his long career, Father Dunstan's stylistic touchstones have remained William Blake and Picasso, Salvador Dali and the Old Masters. His favourite subjects have, equally, remained death, purgatory, and the Resurrection.

Daphne Sleight regrets that Father Dunstan's work is not better known – and if he were better known, she has no doubt that he would be among the province's most distinguished artists. This is an ambitious claim for someone whose work is largely derivative. Even so, one cannot fail to admire what Father Dunstan has accomplished within the parameters of sacred iconography. His output has been, and will continue to be, enormous. And Father Dunstan's following, thanks to Daphne Sleight's well-researched book, will no doubt increase.

*Arthur Erickson:
An Architect's Life*

David Stouck

Vancouver: Douglas & McIntyre,
2013. 496 pp. \$37.95 cloth.

RHODRI WINDSOR-LISCOMBE
University of British Columbia

DAVID STOUCK has written a remarkable history. More than a biography, it is an encompassing account of a remarkable figure in later modern Canadian and international cultural history. Stouck recovers the spirit and material record of someone remarkable for qualities of personality and creativity as well as for their ambivalence. Arthur Erickson became not only “Canada’s Greatest Architect,” in the words of another scholar of his life in design, Nicholas Olsberg, but also a veritable local urban myth in Canada’s Terminal City, Vancouver.

Erickson mythology has tended to cast him as unique, overlooking both the broader burgeoning architectural culture of the West/Coast and the variability in his design growth and attainment. Setting aside deficiencies in structural detailing, Erickson did not exhibit his marked perception for the architectonic, particularly of site, until the latter part of his first decade in practice. Nor was Erickson so much an innovator of formal or aesthetic solution as an extraordinarily imaginative reinterpreter of historical and contemporary idiom and motif. Witness the brilliant alchemy of ancient Classical, Asian, and Aboriginal trabeation – the interplay of powerful vertical with horizontal structural members – for the Museum of Anthropology at the University of British Columbia. Similarly, the

articulation of the Filberg House in Comox, the Robson Square Complex in Vancouver, and the Canadian Chancery in Washington, DC, derives from a wide genealogy of design but results in buildings that are original and distinctive for their variously appropriate lyricism, practical and symbolic functionalism, and material and intellectual substance. Erickson was thoroughly imbued with the ideals of the Modern Movement in architecture (not really the superficial Philip Johnson/Henry Hitchcock tag, the “International Style” [the early Modernists detested stylism]). Yet, in company with Le Corbusier and Mies van der Rohe, he was equally imbued with the “great game” of design, but not just the Classical tradition Sir Edwin Lutyens invoked by that phrase. Erickson learned modes of architectonic thinking rather than specific iconography from historical practice and, most especially with respect to formulation of architecture, from environmental and cultural conditions. One entrancing example – entrancing because of its punning and unexpectedness – is the entirely Modernist yet completely Baroque staircase leading from the roadway entrance up to the main mall level at Simon Fraser University. This commission, won with Geoffrey Massey, established Erickson’s reputation beyond the province and nation. Four photographs of that reconfiguring of the physical and pedagogical fabric of European and North American university education atop the unlikely acropolis of Burnaby Mountain appear in the photo insert that accompanies the book.

At first, the absence of illustrations in the text seems unfortunate. However, it facilitates a more intriguing elision of life-to-design time: we can look

over the judicious selection of family and (more extensive) architectural photographs – several (taken by Simon Scott) superb – as we traverse Erickson’s life experience. If the excellence of the architectural photographs creates a greater consistency of design quality, it also lends vivid force to the quality of Erickson’s finest work, ending with the Museum of Glass in Tacoma. This is a fitting climax because it recalls Erickson’s poetic response to natural light and the aesthetic potentiality of glass as well as to his related comprehension of the nature of both natural wood and concrete. Rightly omitted are the rather less persuasive essays on Arabian architecture relating to the many unbuilt schemes for Iraq and Saudi Arabia and the several commissions in which his participation was more nominal.

Stouck narrates those episodes with the same diligent but lively attention, thereby maintaining a balance between what can best be termed occurrence and achievement. The subtle sophistication of his recovery of the life of the architect is evident from early on. Take just two quotations from Part One: “He [Erickson] loved the attention and praise” (27) and, quoting his Japanese teacher, Mrs. Griffiths, “He is a genius and a good man” (37). Stouck’s attention to detail in the record of memory and document is never turgid; rather, it allows the reader, preferably armed with the photo insert, to arrive at independent insight and understanding. Moreover, the many facets of the person and designer emerge with great potency. Through an alchemy of words, fitting with Erickson’s alchemy of form and motif, Stouck presents a visceral sense of Erickson’s elegant, perceptive, intelligently intellectual, and most engaging presence.

Thus, Stouck constructs a highly readable yet revealing recollection of life experience and lived achievement. He joins the company of such commendable bio-historians of architects and artists as Robert Twombly and Jack Lindsay. And Stouck’s description of the documented and remembered goods and chattels of growing up and coming into full maturity parallels the animated yet probing teaching and lecturing of Erickson himself. The importance of these lesser-studied activities, together with the complexities of his private life, receive due attention. These form part of the interweaving of the ordinary with the distinctive, the intimate with the contextual, the anecdotal with the significant, and, increasingly throughout the book, the experiential with the executive dimensions of creative practice. Stouck is particularly adept at balancing the plethora of incidents with important flows in situation and accomplishment. Fundamental is his empathetic and eloquent evocation of the profoundly lyrical yet sensual weft and warp of Erickson’s individual and artistic being. This is woven through much of the twenty chapters and four sections of the book, parsed according to major phases or commissions. The process of sexual self-discovery coincides with the travel experience that moulded his architectural sensibility. In this manner, Stouck reanimates Erickson’s evolving personal nature in tandem with his developing thinking on design and practice. Nor does Stouck neglect the sticky presence of financial reality or the politics of professional activity. *An Architect’s Life* is a worthy companion to such architectural monographs as Olsberg and Castro (2006).

A reviewer has a duty to present some matters for consideration. These are few but bear upon the charting of

Erickson's place in temporal and critical space. His early career occurred in a more broadly creative environment than is acknowledged, even in this judicious bio-history. In Windsor-Liscombe (1997), I examine the quite rich vein of ideal and pragmatic Modernism being mined in post-Second World War Vancouver. A markedly astute assessment of Erickson's design genealogy and ability appears in Thomas (1996), while Nicholas Olsberg (2011) composes a most discerning analysis of Erickson's work.

Stouck reminds us with discerning grace that history arises from lives that are affected by multiple occurrence, agency, and interest. He carries the reader beyond the somewhat tawdry controversy attending Erickson's final years, beyond the diametrically opposed readings Stouck weaves into his Epilogue – Erickson the snobbish sybarite versus Erickson the ascetic aesthete – to the enduring, delightful, and deeply talented Living Architect.



REFERENCES

- Olsberg, Nicholas. 2011. "Canada's Greatest Architect." In *Architecture and the Canadian Fabric*, ed. R.W. Liscombe, 429-45. Vancouver: UBC Press.
- Olsberg, Nicholas, and Ricardo L. Castro, eds. 2006. "Arthur Erickson: Critical Works." Vancouver: Douglas & McIntyre.
- Thomas, Christopher. 1996. "Reconciling the Universal and the Particular: Arthur Erickson in the 1940s and 1950s." *Bulletin of the Society for the Study of Architecture in Canada* 21: 36-43.
- Windsor-Liscombe, Rhodri. 1997. *The New Spirit: Modern Architecture in Vancouver, 1938-1963*. Vancouver: Douglas & McIntyre.