

Talk and Log: Wilderness Politics in British Columbia

Jeremy Wilson

Vancouver: UBC Press, 1998. 452 p. Maps. \$85 cloth, \$39.95 paper.

BY BRIONY PENN

*University of Victoria and
Friends of Ecological Reserves*

During the Canadian centennial year, school libraries across British Columbia received copies of *This Is British Columbia* and *British Columbia: Challenge in Abundance*—two illustrated tributes, courtesy of the BC government, to the riches of the province where there was ‘Splendour Never Ending.’ Within their pages lay the philosophical explanation for the next thirty years of conflict and paradox in the forests. Imprinted in our formative hearts were the superb photographs of wilderness by *Beautiful BC* photographers, while accompanying text informed our brains that we were assured of an enviable future full of abundance and challenge – that

British Columbia
was a giant that sleeps no longer ... He is pumping up the oil, growing grain and belching gas in the Peace. He is bulging the fish nets along the coast. He is irrigating the dry interior hills and bringing forth the produce. He is cutting the tall timber at the bases of the mountains while baring their tops for the ore inside. He is fattening the beef stock, building fine homes and ... remembering to have some fun. (*British Columbia: Challenge in Abundance*, 10)

As we dutifully sang “Can...a...da, one little two little three Canadians, we love you,” Premier Bennet assured us that between parks and integrated resource management (with sustained yield) we were going to march bravely with the giant that was British Columbia to a future full of moss-dripping trees, salmon-eating grizzlies, healthy exports, and happy smiling schoolchildren in bustling towns. *Talk and Log: Wilderness Politics in British Columbia* is as much a biography for those of us singing away in 1967 as a comprehensive account of wilderness politics over the last three decades. It documents the gradual public awareness of the ecological impossibility of reconciling the two competing visions. It also chronicles the power of those images to motivate thousands to defend them.

The book’s chronological milestones of the wilderness debate, as it grew in sophistication and broadened into economic and social spheres, mirrored my own awareness and increasing involvement in the wilderness movement. I can remember, around 1973, being driven to Tofino in the back of a station wagon, gazing out over the miles of clear-cuts and feeling confident enough to express concern about the logging even with fishing family friends; a decade later, questioning the much-touted concept of “multiple use” after trying very hard to be reasonable;

and, a decade after that, joining the ranks of protesters over Clayoquot and making the pilgrimage to Merv Wilkinson's ecoforestry lot. Now at the brink of the millennium, we realize that we are in "a new era in which the greatest threats to biodiversity may derive not from the provincial economy's dependence on resource extraction but from its dependence on population growth and the promotion of environmentally destructive high-consumption lifestyles" (342). We looked for the giant and discovered it was us. As Wilson correctly chronicles in the conclusion, we are now restoring our backyards with Native species, restoring streams with displaced forest workers, and buying ecocertified wood. He forgot to mention that we occasionally still have fun.

Wilson's book is epic in covering the events, strategies, and personalities that formed the basis of wilderness politics. The appendices alone cover 100 pages. At the same time it is readable enough to provide a comprehensive structure that will fit anyone's experiences with all of the archetypes: the "cappuccino suckers," the "noble savages," the "ragamuffins," the "family-values-first loggers and their dutiful wives," the "bad corporate CEOs," and the "corrupt politicians with their hands under the table." The analysis of the development of these archetypes in the media is also addressed (e.g., the conscious creation of the Share movement and the need to create an archetype that, as Ronald Arnold of the US Centre for the Defense of Free-Enterprise wrote, can "speak as a group of people who live close to nature and have more natural wisdom than city people" [39]). This historical account allows us all to see where we fought in the battle, what armour we

put on, and how we acted out our parts.

The book starts with excellent overviews of the forest industry, environmental organizations, government policy, and the policy process, then moves into a chronology of the ideological battles over the last thirty years, finishing with prospects for the future. Coming from the cappuccino-suckers camp, I found it fascinating to read about what went on behind the scenes in industry and government. It made me weep at all the hours we spent at meetings or writing letters earnestly talking about salamanders, marbled murrelets, community forests, and intrinsic values when we should have just got straight to questioning the giant who "refused to stop long enough to debate its obligations to future generations" (348). It would be equally fascinating for all the other "stakeholders" at the "round tables" to know what was going on behind the scenes in the various camps. Wilson conducted extensive interviews with the key "players" and has succinctly captured the diverse ethics and moods of an era in his analysis. It should be mandatory reading for every budding politician in British Columbia. The rhetoric of politicians with no historical perspective, of politicians who don't realize that we have *all* come a long way since "Can...a...da," is probably the greatest deterrent to "lively debate" (348). As Wilson points out in the end:

A democratic well-being does hinge on the notion that in vibrant political societies, important policy decisions and nondecisions are preceded by lively debate about the costs, risks and benefits of a full range of options. In this and related respects BC democracy

continues to fall short of its potential ... People of the twenty-first century are likely to deliver a negative verdict when they discover that one of the wealthiest societies of the late twentieth century aggressively pushed policies threatening forest ecosystems,

all in the face of varied and compelling doubts about the long term consequences. (348)

This is a compelling read for anyone who was there. For anyone who missed it but wants to enter the debate, it is the definitive history.

The Wealth of Forests: Markets, Regulation, and Sustainable Forestry

Chris Tollefson, editor

Vancouver: UBC Press, 1998. 396 pp. \$85 cloth, \$35.95 paper.

BY MIKE HARCOURT

University of British Columbia

The *Wealth of Forests*, edited by Chris Tollefson, is a timely, well presented, but incomplete book. It is timely because over the next three to four years British Columbians will have to absorb the painful changes from the pioneering strip mining of our forests to the sustained yield practices of the last fifty years to the implementation of sustainable forestry. The book is timely for British Columbians who are about six years into a ten-year plan to mitigate Peter Pearse's 1975 Royal Commission prediction of a "fall down" period early in the twenty-first century. With the huge changes commenced by my government in 1991-96 – the Forest Practices Code, the CORE/LRMP land use plans, the Protected Area Strategy, Forest Renewal BC, the Nisga'a Treaty, and the Aboriginal Treaty process now being implemented – a review of the shift from sustainable yield to sustainable forestry is important.

The Wealth of Forests is well presented. As editor Chris Tollefson notes, "Although there is broad agreement on the need to achieve sustainable forestry, there is considerable disagreement over which policy instruments should be displayed to promote that goal" (4). "This book has grappled, from differing disciplinary and philosophical perspectives with the challenge of identifying sustainable policy alternatives that would correct the government failures" (375). Tollefson presents a range of views from Stanbury and Vertinsky's "free market environmentalism" to the ecosystem paradigm advocated by M'Gonigle, Dellert, and Gale.

My critique of *The Wealth of Forests* is that it is incomplete, which Tollefson readily admits (382). We are in a period of rapid change and great political fluidity, moving from sustained yield policies and practices to the uncertain practical realities of defining and im-

plementing sustainable forestry. It is unlikely that the ongoing debate in the political realm over the meaning and implications of sustainable forestry, triggered by these demands, will soon subside. Given this political fluidity, as well as the scientific and social uncertainties that characterize forest policy making, a key challenge is to design public institutions and policy instruments that can adapt to, indeed even flourish in, an environment of change. The nature of the governance and related reforms necessary to meet this challenge are only now being explored. This collection is a contribution to that process of exploration, offered in the hope that we can come closer to realizing the true wealth of our forests. My main concern is that the hundred-plus forest-industry-based communities, and the hundreds of thousands of BC citizens caught in this crunch, not be treated as grist for the mill – grist that is being ground around the concept of sustainable forestry.

Part of my critique of *The Wealth of Forests* is the certainty that Tollefson and the majority of its contributors have, both about the failure of contemporary Canadian forest policy and in their commitment to ecosystem-based forestry. The alternatives put forward range from Dobell's "full world" forests to Haley and Luchert's "sharecropping agreements" to M'Gonigle's eco-labelling and "true" community forest tenures and community forest boards. As we enter into the intense and charged next three-to-four year period, many questions remain that the contributors to *The Wealth of Forests* do not answer satisfactorily.

First and foremost, how do we ease the transitional economic pain of forest workers? Wishful thinking about tourism and value-added forest

products needs tougher examination. Leaders of the tourism industry, like Rick Antonson of Tourism Vancouver/Oceans Blue, know that tourism, too, has ecological limits. Are there really huge untapped markets for British Columbia's value-added forestry sector? The jury's still out on this issue, although new resources to advance the value-added forestry sector have been added at the University of Northern British Columbia, University of British Columbia (i.e., the Centre for Advanced Wood Product Manufacturing), Selkirk College Campus at Nelson, Forest Renewal BC, and Skills Now.

Second, the ecosystem-based forestry proponents sometimes have a theologically, rather than an economically or biologically, based opinion that clear-cutting old-growth is bad and that selective logging of secondary growth is good. Almost 50 million hectares of British Columbia's 65 million hectares of forest contain old-growth or original-growth forests. Not harvesting old-growth/original-growth forests would eliminate 75 to 80 per cent of British Columbia's forests, leaving only the 15 million hectares of secondary-growth forests (which have been reforested with over four billion native BC seedlings). No clear-cutting of any sort (even with the significantly smaller cut blocks required with the Forest Practices Code) is problematic when shade-unfriendly species like Douglas fir, lodgepole pine, and larch are involved or when canopy-entangled coastal rain forests are to be harvested.

The proposition that clear-cutting old-growth is bad and selective logging is good is not only a debatable issue (which, along with needed tenure reform, Forestry Minister David Zirnheld has stated is open for a public dialogue in the spring/fall of 1999), but it also needs to be more transparent in the

present eco-labelling systems being thrust forward in British Columbia. As the battle lines form around whether to apply the Canadian Standards Associations (CSA) certification scheme, the Forest Stewardship Council scheme, or some revised amalgam of both, understanding the biases underlying both schemes should be a major requirement.

Proponents of ecosystem-based forestry (not the authors in *Wealth of Forests*) all too often claim solidarity with British Columbia's Aboriginal peoples and their quest for just and equitable treaties. However, the bottom line of these ecosystem-based forestry advocates entails a no clear-cutting, no old-growth cutting position (i.e., Greenpeace regarding coastal rain forests, Friends of the Valhalla Society regarding boreal forests) that would

leave most Aboriginal communities with only the desert lands around Osoyoos. So Aboriginal leaders are justifiably sceptical of such solidarity, as we witnessed with Greenpeace's summer 1997 campaign during the mid-coast Great Spirit Bear campaign to have the whole area protected as a park.

Having raised these many questions and critiques, I welcome Chris Tollefson's *The Wealth of Forests* as timely, well presented, but incomplete. The intensifying dialogue concerning British Columbia's transition from sustainable yield to sustainable forestry requires books such as *The Wealth of Forests* as well as the University of Victoria's 1995 conference, from which it sprang. We need more debate and dialogue about the future of British Columbia's forests.

Red Bait! Struggles of a Mine Mill Local

Al King with Kate Braid

Vancouver: Kingbird Publishing, 1998.
176 pp. Illus. (8096 Elliott, Vancouver v5s 2P2)

BY DAVID ROTH

dmr Research Services, Burnaby

In his introduction to *Red Bait!* Al King notes that his book is not a history; rather, it is a record of his experiences in the International Union of Mine, Mill and Smelter Workers (Mine-Mill) from the late 1930s to its merger with the United Steelworkers of America (Steel) in 1967. King's characterization of his book is bang on. A solid historical analysis of Mine-Mill, the Steel raids, and the subsequent merger has yet to be written. Nor is it

a Communist Party history, although King has been a member of the party since 1938. Instead, *Red Bait!* is a series of telling anecdotes, ably organized and presented with the assistance of Kate Braid. The sum total is a memoir that serves as an entree into the world of industrial unionism from the 1930s to the 1970s. With colourful language and nearly unbridled passion, King shows the reader just how rough and ready that world could be.

King's memoir is a highly personal account of over forty years of union and political work, which included the organization of Trail smelter and chemical workers in the 1930s and 1940s, the travails of a Communist living in a small company-dominated town, battles with the Steelworkers' Union for control of Mine-Mill, and various other skirmishes big and small. Al King has spent most of his life fighting for what he believed to be right and fair, and the reader is treated to his take on the unions, politics, and personalities that made up that life. It is safe to say that King has opinions on pretty well everything and everyone and that he is not chary about offering them to his readers. You might not always agree, but you better damn well listen.

King's memoir exposes a world primarily dominated by males, where families often took a back seat to the union and where women were either office workers or the wives of members. It was a world where the occasional fist fight and heavy drinking were part of the landscape, and organizing sometimes involved a carload of booze and a fistful of union cards (by the 1970s it apparently included a joint or two). For Al King it was also a world where politics were *very* personal. Sixty years down the road King still refers to members of Cominco's company-dominated Workmen's Co-operative Committee as "human barnacles" and "suckholes." All of this may make today's

progressive unionists a tad uncomfortable, but it all rings true, even if a little raconteur's spice has been added. This may not be history, but it's a pretty sure bet that it won't be ignored by historians when the social context of trade unionism is discussed.

King's passionate support of trade unionism and of the left leaps from the pages of *Red Bait!* So, too, does his implacable belief that the demise of Mine-Mill, born of anti-Communist paranoia and the naked opportunism of the Steelworkers, was a near-fatal blow to progressive trade unionism in Canada. According to King, there was no alternative to Mine-Mill's merger with Steel. The rank and file were tired of the constant turmoil, the union was broke, and Steel agreed to keep on Mine-Mill's leadership. So King swallowed his pride and "voted for the goddamned thing too." All of his reasons are valid, but his commentary is curiously staid. The denouement of a thirty-year commitment seems to demand more than mere explanation, especially from the fighter revealed in the preceding pages. Kate Braid must have felt the same way. When she pushed King on the subject, specifically asking him how it felt to give up the long fight against Steel and agree to the merger, King replied, "You're turning the knife in me." Those words embody the "real" chapter on the merger. In the messy reality of lives lived, sometimes six words is all you get, even from Albert Lorenzo King.

Aging in British Columbia: Burden or Benefit?

Herbert C. Northcott and P. Jane Milliken

Calgary: Detselig, 1998. 133 pp. Maps. \$18.95 paper.

BY MEGAN DAVIES, *University of Glasgow*

As BC journalist Bruce Hutchison once modestly remarked about the province, "It is the normal, accepted ambition of most Canadians to spend their last days here." Herbert C. Northcott and Jane Milliken, two Canadian academics with research backgrounds in health and aging, question Hutchison's assumption by asking two key questions: Who are British Columbia's elders? And is this population cohort good or bad for the province?

This tightly organized and clearly argued book is a companion volume to Northcott's 1997 *Aging in Alberta: Rhetoric and Reality*, and it is evidently envisioned as second in a series of regional studies on this topic. Pulling together research by prominent scholars in the field as well as government data and reports, the authors focus their attention on demography, health, and social policy. The first section of the book is a survey of the demographic characteristics and the state of health of British Columbia's older population, often comparing them with those who live in other regions of the country. The authors then turn to a discussion of federal and provincial health and social welfare policy for aged British Columbians. A brief concluding chapter considers the question posed by the book's title: Are British Columbia's seniors a social and economic burden or do they bring positive benefits to our province?

This volume will be a useful text for students and professionals new to the field of gerontology. Non-Canadians, as well, will find the book a good introduction to this topic. Yet, while the merits of succinct policy analysis are obvious, Northcott and Milliken's economical approach to what is undoubtedly a huge topic makes for dull reading. Without question, a lay readership of seniors – who, after all, are the subject of the book – would find this a very difficult read. Discussions of policy need not be dry if all the actors – professionals, caregivers, clients, and policy makers – come on-stage and have their say. Demographic statistics can be brought to life if some of the more interesting facts they reveal are pursued in greater depth (and there are many possibilities to do so in this book).

Nonetheless, I liked this book and learned from it. I was unaware, for example, that there are equal numbers of older men and women in many of British Columbia's rural communities – a major difference from larger urban centres, where older women greatly outnumber their male cohorts. The fact that in 1991 11 per cent of men over sixty-five in British Columbia were either employed or looking for work has made me question my assumption that the culture of retirement has taken a firm hold in Canada. This book also increased my understanding of the difficult question of state medical ser-

vices for seniors. For example, Northcott and Milliken tell us that the high cost of providing health and hospital services to British Columbia's aging population is really the cost of care to the sick and dying rather than to the larger community of elders.

I felt that I knew British Columbia's elders better when I finished this book, but I still longed for a personal perspective and some philosophical ruminations about old age at the millennium. True, both of these were beyond the mandate set by the authors. But two scholars with such expertise in old age must have many insights into senescence. For instance, it seems clear that Northcott and Milliken are presenting us with two groups of elders: well-educated people who live in comparative comfort and have input into the political decisions that shape their lives and those who live in poverty and isolation, effectively disenfranchised from society. What, I wonder, are Northcott and Milliken's thoughts about this situation?

Dr. Mary Pipher, therapist author of the bible for feminist mothers, *Reviving Ophelia: Helping You to Understand and Cope with Your Teenage Daughter* (1994), has just published *Another Country: Navigating the Emotional Terrain of Our Elders* (1999). Pipher offers us some useful insights into old age and agism. She argues that we treat our elderly like children and fail to understand that their emotional characters were defined in a pre-Freudian world. Then we shut them off from society by limiting access to public spaces to those who are physically challenged or unable to drive. Pipher's analysis, however, is primarily rooted in the realm of emotion, downplaying the importance of money, housing, and health. Setting the two volumes next to each other on my bookshelf, I was left thinking what a powerful statement about aging would come from a synthesis of these two approaches. And what better place to situate such a study than in British Columbia, the premier Canadian retirement locale for much of this century?

*Holding One's Time in Thought:
The Political Philosophy of W.J. Stankiewicz*

Bogdan Czaykowski and Samuel V. LaSelva, editors

Vancouver: Ronsdale, 1997. 407 pp. \$37.95 cloth, \$18.95 paper.

BY MARGARET PRANG
Emerita, University of British Columbia

Most of the seventeen essays in this handsome volume were first presented in 1995 at a colloquium on the political thought of W.J. Stankiewicz at the

University of British Columbia, where Stankiewicz (WJS) was a member of the Department of Political Science for three decades. The book's apt title comes from Hegel's description of the

purpose of philosophy: "to hold your time in thought." WJS's "time" is outlined in an introduction by the editors, a discussion between Alan C. Cairns and LaSelva, and in Ian Simpson Ross's account of the arrival of WJS, a nineteen-year-old Polish soldier, at the University of St. Andrews in 1941. There he encountered the continuing influence of Scottish idealism in moral philosophy. During five years of graduate study at the London School of Economics and Political Science, a period outlined by George Feaver (one of WJS's first students and, later, a colleague at UBC), he continued to live in a milieu where ideas, ranging from those of Harold Laski to Michael Oakeshott, were assigned high significance.

When WJS began his work, behaviouralism and relativism dominated the social sciences, especially in their most flourishing home, the United States. WJS saw both as destructive of civilization and social order, believing that they can tell us little about what it means to be "human" or contribute to any formulation of "a common good," without which a coherent society cannot exist. Liberalism and socialism both lead to a lack of social and political responsibility, since they are based on moral relativism and reject the possibility of norms of behaviour. Here the philosophical villains are Hume, J.S. Mill, and Marx. In the moral chaos of our time, when there is no accepted hierarchy of values and one person's ideas or opinions are as good as another's, and society is a "construct" of "the self," democracy and individual human freedom are destroyed. WJS, for both philosophical and experiential reasons, sees Marxism and its political expression in communism as the worst possible form of human organization.

Despite the demise of so many communist states, WJS believes that the Marxist mindset is still widespread and that the struggle against it must be maintained. According to WJS, the alternative to all these false doctrines is to be found in the tradition of Hobbes and Burke, whose "prudential conservatism" draws on humanity's accumulated wisdom and provides the only basis for individual freedom within a democratic state.

Today, with the increasing recognition of the bankruptcy of the behaviouralistic social sciences and a willingness to recognize the place of human motivation in the lives of individuals and communities, WJS has more intellectual company among political philosophers than he did when he began his studies. Several of his interpreters in this volume credit him with contributing to current efforts to create a new "Grand Theory," which, in the words of Quentin Skinner as quoted by the editors, is not "in the least shy of telling us that [its] task is that of helping us to understand how best to live our lives."

For this historian, who has no claim to expertise in political theory, these essays provide a wealth of illuminating and provocative reading. In such a feast, it is difficult to select the most substantial items. Two this reader finds particularly interesting are Robert Jackson's "Sovereignty and Relativism" and Jean Bethke Elshtain's "Reflections on the Crisis of Authority and its Critics." Both essays elaborate on a concept central to the thought of WJS: that sovereignty is essential to any political order, whether between states or in the state's relation to its citizens. Jackson argues for the importance of distinguishing between relativism and pluralism. "The former is properly to be scorned, but the latter is to be

celebrated, and it is the main function of State sovereignty – in its external dimension – to uphold the value of pluralism.” He contends that “State sovereignty ... is the only practicable arrangement that can enable our planet’s diverse human groupings to live together side-by-side in peace,” and he rejects “postmodern and cosmopolitan international relations theorists [and] humanitarians,” who see sovereignty as “an obstacle to global justice,” which ought therefore to be abolished.

Elshtain examines JWS’s thought in dialogue with that of Hannah Arendt and St. Augustine and, to some degree, with Luther, “both liberator and father of our travail.” In the process, Elshtain shows clearly that in both philosophical (theological) and political terms, acceptance of legitimate authority is the condition of freedom. In doing so she provides content for JWS’s “prudent conservatism”: “We must begin with the recognition that [authority] is the opposite of violence and coercive force; [and with] recognition of the extent to which our control over the world is limited ... for it is an intractable place where many things go awry and go astray.”

Can a way out of chaos be found? An appendix to this volume contains four essays by WJS, two of which are entitled “Ecology and Natural Law.” In a wide-ranging, complex, and highly theoretical discussion, WJS finds ground for a new understanding

of “natural law” and for the development of a perception of a common good from the “science of ecology,” the study of the relationship of plants and animals (including human beings) and their environment. This ground disappears as a practical hope in the face of WJS’s analysis of the flaws in efforts to apply an ecological perspective to the future of our planet: most geographers, environmentalists of various stripes, and the Green Party are found to be “determinists” and often Marxists or liberals whose false premises render their actions destructive. Despite his belief in the dominance of ideas, WJS recognizes that we cannot will ourselves to adopt a philosophy of natural law or any other “rational” basis for ordering the world. Perhaps WJS too easily disposes of the approach of the Harvard biologist, Edward O. Wilson. At least in his recent work (*Consilience: the Unity of Knowledge*, 1998), Wilson outlines the basis of a secularized theology of care for the Earth that may have wide appeal.

Altogether, the book evokes pessimism, even despair. In the concluding words of Elshtain’s essay, “a world to which and by which we are bound, but within which we are free to act – has vaporized. We are all alone with our freedom and coerced in ways beyond our imaginings.” Through their engagement with the thought of W.J. Stankiewicz, the contributors to this volume help to explain how we got where we are.

Street Names of Vancouver

Elizabeth Walker

Vancouver: Vancouver Historical Society, 1999. 147 pp. Illus., maps. \$24.95
paper. (VHS, PO Box 3071, Vancouver V6B 3X6)

BY G.P.V. AKRIGG

Emeritus, University of British Columbia

For years Elizabeth Walker worked in the Special Collections Division of the Vancouver Public Library. Her duties there included responding to enquiries, many of which concerned the origin of various Vancouver street names. Gradually she built up a fund of relevant information. Then came retirement, and research into street-name history became her full-time occupation. A curtain-raiser to publication of her findings was a brief article on Kitsilano street names, co-authored with Peggy Imredy. Now comes the final achievement, Elizabeth Walker's own *Street Names of Vancouver*, a monumental work covering the entire City of Vancouver, with its 773 current street names (to which Walker has added another 400 no longer in use).

The person who played the greatest role in naming Vancouver's streets was Lachlan Alexander Hamilton (1852-1944), the Canadian Pacific Railway (CPR) surveyor who, in two short years, made detailed plans for much of the CPR's new terminus. Water Street, Cordova Street, and Hastings Street he laid out to lead in to Granville Street, which ended at the new CPR station. For the West End he took names off an Admiralty chart. For Fairview he took the names of trees, supplying his draftsman with such names as Alder, Birch, and Cedar but apparently forgetting to tell him that they were to

be applied in alphabetical order. The result has been that generations of newcomers to Vancouver have had to torture themselves trying to remember which streets come after which, that Spruce Street comes before Oak, which comes before Laurel, Willow, Heather, and Ash.

For years Walker was a familiar sight as she travelled around Vancouver with a bag filled with index cards and other scholarly impedimenta, possibly en route to the Land Registry Office in New Westminster or the City Surveyor's Office in Vancouver, the Vancouver City Archives, or those of the University of British Columbia. City directories and lists of deaths became her common fare. Ever more deeply she became versed in "dedicated" roads (those on city property) and the more romantic names that real-estate developers used to entice purchasers to their new subdivisions. (The developers of Ashleigh Heights, wanting names "with a soft elegant sound - associated with history in a sophisticated manner," named streets after Brahms, Handel, Strauss, and Vivaldi, while Imperial Ventures Limited chose Spyglass Place and Wheelhouse Square for their False Creek development.)

Delving deep into council minutes or files of municipal or personal correspondence, Ms. Walker sought information about street names long

since superseded, rescinded, or applied to other thoroughfares. In so doing she has created a major research instrument for those interested in the minutiae of Vancouver history. Thus if one had a letter written in 1909 by one's grandfather from an address on "Clifford Street," which simply does not exist on today's maps of Vancouver, all one needs to do is to turn to Walker (24):

CLIFFORD STREET (DL 301). Now East 14th Avenue between Main and Prince Edward Streets. Shown on Plan 187 (1885), the owner, H.V. Edmonds, named it after his daughter, Mary Gifford Edmonds, who married C.M. Marpole. It was entered in the Land Registry Office as Clifford rather than Gifford. When DL 301 was absorbed by Vancouver in 1911, it became part of East 14th Avenue.

It will readily be seen, with entries as precise and detailed as this, that *Street Names of Vancouver* will prove invaluable to local historians.

Of course, even Walker's sleuthing skills and industry have not been able to determine the origins of all Vancouver's street names. The field remains open for those who want to tackle Adera Street or Avery Avenue.

Walker, as she clearly indicates, has not been without helpers in her enormous project. Noel Petes, Vancouver's city surveyor, and his staff have helped her to locate needed documents, while Bruce Macdonald has, among other things, prepared the useful maps included in this book.

In a book covering a field as extensive as this one, a few slips are more or less inevitable. Walker's book is generally clear of errors. However, in the next edition the editor should give the correct title of the noble lord who is remembered for Granville Street. He was Earl Granville, not "the Earl of Granville." The present reviewer occasionally had to read closely to determine whether a particular name is current or not. It would help if, in the next edition, names that are only of historical interest were printed in a distinctive font, such as Gothic or Old English.

It remains only to congratulate Elizabeth Walker on having carried through her project to such a successful conclusion. *Street Names of Vancouver* is not only an authoritative reference work to be ordered by public and school libraries, but one that anybody who is interested Vancouver history will want for his/her shelf of Vancouver books.

Vancouver's Society of Italians

Raymond Culos

Madeira Park: Harbour, 1998. 223 pp. Illus. \$39.95 cloth.

BY GABRIELE SCARDELLATO, *University of Toronto*

Raymond Culos, the author of *Vancouver's Society of Italians*, is particularly well placed to undertake a study of Italian-Canadians in Vancouver. He is the son of a prominent Italian-Canadian Vancouver family who followed in his father's footsteps by pursuing a long and successful career as a journalist for a variety of Vancouver-based newspapers, including the important *L'Eco d'Italia*.

In compiling the current study, Culos was fortunate in having access not only to his father's interwar publications, which deal with various aspects of Italian-Canadian life in Vancouver, but also to his father's extensive personal papers, to a network of individuals who shared their memories with the author, to the Pacific Press library in Vancouver, and so forth. This impressive range of research materials is reflected in part in the volume's 200-plus photographs, virtually all of which are well reproduced by the volume's printer. Indeed, the publisher is to be complemented for an extremely attractive volume. More careful proofreading however, possibly by an Italian-language reader, would have prevented some glaring typographical mistakes: for example, Spillingbergo for Spillimbergo, Bangi di Lucca for Bagni di Lucca, cantini for cantine, locondiera for locandiera, compestre for campestre, Statari for Spatari, Camillio for Camillo, and many more. Also, one might question

the editorial decision to include many Italian-language terms in the text, usually without translation for non-Italian language readers.

Culos's study spans the period from 1904 to 1966. His opening date coincides with the beginning of Vancouver's first Italian-Canadian mutual aid society, while the closing year marks the final merger of a number of societies into an umbrella organization called the Confratellanza Italo-Canadese Society. The volume opens with a foreword by Judge Dolores Holmes (herself a scion of the Branca family, one of Vancouver's notable Italian-Canadian families) and includes an author's preface followed by twenty-four relatively short chapters organized chronologically.

The author reports his motivation in writing this work, which he describes as a "historical account of Vancouver's pioneer Italians and their institutions," as having been the desire "to chronicle the documented contributions of the men and women closely associated with Vancouver's Italian mutual aid societies." The result, for individuals interested in the history of one of Vancouver's oldest and best established ethnic groups, is a mixed success.

Culos has amassed a great deal of information for this volume, and, as noted, it is very well illustrated throughout with well reproduced historical photographs of both people and events.

Most, if not all, of the better known individuals in Vancouver's Italian-Canadian community appear here. Understandably, the author's family, and his father in particular, are featured prominently, as are various members of the Branca and other families. These individuals appear within the retelling of a fairly well known sequence of events, for which insightful detail sometimes is added. One of the few accounts previously available of association life amongst Vancouver's Italian-Canadians, a few paragraphs in Antonino Spada's *The Italians in Canada* (1969, 368-70), is augmented very significantly here.

Culos is also much more detailed in his treatment of events like Italy's entry into war in June 1940 and the subsequent arrest and internment of a number of Vancouver's Italian-Canadians. Indeed, this episode is covered in one of the book's longest chapters, and the author treats its events in a much more balanced fashion than most others who have written about them. There is ambiguity, however, in Culos's presentation and interpretation of these events and, equally significantly, in his recounting of activities that preceded them amongst Vancouver's Italian-Canadians. These ambiguities are indicative of what for this reader is the volume's major weakness – a general failure to present events in a useful historical context. Thus, although the internment of some forty-four of Vancouver's Italian-Canadians shortly after Italy entered the war against Great Britain in June of 1940 is covered in detail, there is little either in this or preceding chapters that would help a reader to understand why these individuals might have been singled out for arrest and internment by Canadian authorities. The episode is made even more quixotic

because it is introduced with the relatively well known story of the formation of the Canadian Italian War Vigilance Association of Vancouver by local barrister Angelo Branca, who brought together more than 300 individuals who pledged their loyalty to the Allied war effort.

Similar hesitations arise with regard to Culos's general presentation of the history of Italian-Canadians either in Vancouver or elsewhere in British Columbia. Readers who are not familiar with Vancouver, for example, might have difficulty in following Culos around the locales named in his text. North Vancouver is juxtaposed with locations in Vancouver's Downtown Eastside (on Hastings and other nearby streets that can be said to have been the location of the city's original Little Italy). These, in turn, are juxtaposed with locales sometimes hundreds of kilometres distant (such as Fernie or Natal in the Rocky Mountains near the Alberta border), with no warning for readers that, in geographical (or other) terms, they might be very distinct settlements. Furthermore, there is usually no information provided that would help us to understand how, or if, Italian-Canadians in these disparate communities were connected.

In a similar vein, this volume cannot be recommended to readers wishing to gain an overall understanding of the history of the settlement of Italians in Vancouver. There is little information, for example, concerning the number of Italian-Canadians settled in the city between 1904 and 1966, why they might have settled where they did, and so forth. There is also surprisingly little reported about the general membership of the institutions whose history otherwise is chronicled here, often in considerable detail. Instead, readers are presented with the histories of a

number of relatively prominent Italian-Canadian families in Vancouver and the activities of some of their members and the institutions with which they were associated. In fairness, and despite the author's claim in his preface, these cannot be claimed as being all of Vancouver's pioneer Italians.

Culos does incorporate, however, a wealth of detail in this volume, and

he is to be complimented for having devoted himself so assiduously to what clearly has been a labour of love. Perhaps we can look forward to other studies from him that will expand this undertaking to include the many thousands who have featured in the broader history of Vancouver's Italian-Canadians.

The Hotel Georgia: A Vancouver Tradition

Sean Rossiter

Vancouver: Douglas and McIntyre, 1998. 128 pp. Illus. \$40 cloth.

BY RHODRI WINDSOR LISCOMBE
University of British Columbia

The construction of identity, especially as the representation of social grouping, is a preoccupation of poststructural discourse. In setting aside the authority of document or text and author, the necessary concern to account for the person has legitimated closer study of the ephemeral and anecdotal staffage of lived lives. This enables greater attention to be directed towards the manner in which we inscribe and invest meaning through the apparently commonplace. The postcard, photograph, and publicity copy are now recognized as significant bearers of meaning, especially around popular attitudes.

That resource is exploited most effectively in this entertaining, if uncritical, biography of a local landmark. Illustrative material and personal narratives relate the changing repute of the Hotel Georgia and the socio-economic context of Vancouver from the former's construction in 1927 to

the present. These are arranged in a partly chronological, partly thematic, structure obviously designed to attract the new cyberspaced reader accustomed to chatty yet seldom annotated script and highly sophisticated visual techniques. This envisioned digital medium also requires sequenced structure, which the book designer, George Vaitkunos, has mimicked with elegant discipline through the architecture of the main photographic plates. These begin with an entry grouping of tinted postcards of the hotel and its environs, which provides a timely reminder of the extent to which we establish meaning through the very process of looking or of the acquiring of visual record. The placement of the Hotel Georgia and of other civic edifices in these postcards, so as to stress the buildings' commanding scale and hence technical attainment in relation to the magnificent topography, articulate the rhetoric of the last phase of the

Imperial era in Canada. The aggrandizement of everyday commerce and social activity is signified through architectural and urban construction and its associated mapping and exploiting of the vast natural resources beyond its boundaries but under the control of its networks of transportation and influence. Later pictures – excellently chosen by Sean Rossiter and his researcher Meg Stanley – reconstruct the subsequent envisioning of Vancouver as American modern metropolis or Pacific Rim entrepot. All the while, other photographs of the building and events within or without its historicized walls display, or unintentionally deconstruct, the cementing of popular civic identity with real-estate investment. The survival of the hotel, indeed, is less the consequence of the heritage sensibility the book embodies than the result of the real-estate development opportunities accruing to the current owner through conservation of its fabric.

The conflictual aspect of the urban development in which the Hotel Georgia is involved, however, can only be inferred through the photographic material. The text excludes the problematization of such larger operations or of contingent factors; in that respect this book corresponds with the account of the Empress Hotel written by Terry Reksten and also published recently by Douglas and MacIntyre. Both Rossiter and Reksten prefer to narrate the pattern of events largely through recounting the conventional life stories of the major proponents, or actors, from the redoubtable Colonel Henry Tobin to the resourceful Peter Eng (present owner) or his architect Bing Thom. It is largely the contemporary journalistic record of doing, interspersed with the selected archaeology of related artefacts, such as the

Canadian Pacific Railway Night Letter authorizing construction. Those “human interest” stories obviously matter, pace the current preoccupation in architectural history with the ideological instead of formal-structural building of the walls.

Nevertheless, the text would benefit by a closer analysis of typology – paradigmatic models of plans and iconography – and of professional and political context. For example, the design style of the Hotel Georgia is rather loosely denominated Beaux-Arts classical of the United States stripe. More likely it corresponds with the Wrennaissance mode popularized by Sir Edwin Lutyens and Sir Herbert Baker in London commercial architecture, a notable example being Britannia House 1919–20. The Georgia was erected contemporaneously with the completion of the hybrid Indian neoclassical Vice-Regal complex at New Delhi (1913–31), which marked the final vaunting of Imperial myth that still prevailed in pre-Depression Vancouver. The formal composition and internal plan of the Georgia are also less complex than is contemporary United States and eastern Canadian hotel architecture due to Vancouver’s economic and demographic situation. Its other cultural coordinate, the Bay Region, is evident in the Mezo-American (namely, Aztec) ornamentation of the ballroom: a modest echo of the exotic imagery of Hollywood movie theatres offset by the comfortably British Club décor of the original dining room.

Beyond the continuing relevance of iconographic analysis in measuring presumed and received meaning in architecture is the potential for contextual explication afforded by closer examination of technical design and development financing. Rossiter in-

cludes a useful summary of the investment network behind the commissioning of the hotel, one that underlines the intriguing happenstance of familial, professional, and service contacts. More might have been included on the statutory financial requirements, and on how these have altered over the intervening decades, so as to demonstrate the commercial politics of modern urban development. That latent privatization of the public domain through manifestation of supposedly commercial improvement is a tale but little or poorly told in the literature of town planning and political economy. Similarly, a closer comparative reading of the layout, accommodation categories, and

service facilities of the hotel would have augmented the historical contribution of the book and its visual ethnography of a site of civic memory.

Despite the relative absence of critical and contextual analysis, this visually based approach to architectural history is worthwhile. The inclusion of the popular visual record offers a legitimate means to counterbalance the more recent tendency to concentrate on the theoretical and discursive fabrication of the built environment. Architecture, more than any other cultural production, involves the popular and the commonplace in its strategies of economic, functional, and symbolic representation.

Canada and Asia: Guide to Archives and Manuscript Sources in Canada

G. Raymond Nunn

London and New York: Mansell, 1999. 2 vols. 1304 pp. \$371 cloth.

BY GEORGE BRANDAK

University of British Columbia

There has been a lengthy discussion on an archives list-server recently about how students are not making sufficient use of archival resources. A perusal of the sources relating to Canada and Asia in these two volumes should give any students sufficient information to develop studies on Asian-Canadian subjects. The index has approximately 50,000 entries and is the key to the mammoth compilation. It brings together material from various archival

institutions in Canada and enters them under both subject and location.

Raymond Nunn's extensive research trips came after the publication of *Asia and Oceania: A Guide to Archival and Manuscript Sources in the United States* (Mansell 1986). Although Canada was not a colonizing country, he noted that its research collections had features similar to those of the colonial powers. These included Asia-related documents of government departments (particularly external affairs and immigration),

executive offices, military records, and archives with references to missionary activities. Asia has been defined as the geographical area from Afghanistan in the west to Hokkaido and the Kuriles in the east, but excluding the former Soviet Asia and including the Pacific Islands, Turkey, and Iran.

The listings consist of textual and microfilmed government records, manuscripts, theses and dissertations, photographs, sound recordings, film, documentary art, and newspaper clipping collections. The National Archives of Canada generate the greatest amount of space with a total of 403 pages (Government Archives Division records groups [276 pp.] and Manuscript Division [115 pp.]). The next largest listings consist of the United Church of Canada Archives in Toronto (232 pp.) and the Presbyterian Church in Canada Archives in Toronto, with 94 pages (owing to their overseas mission programs). The BC section consists of 75 pages covering 10 institutions, of which 21 pages refer to the British Columbia Archives; 27 to the Special Collections and University Archives Division of the

UBC Library (of which 13.5 pages refer to theses); 6 to the City of Vancouver Archives; and 8 to photograph listings for the Vancouver Public Library.

Of course, a printed list is going to be out of date as soon as it is printed. Websites and tools such as the British Columbia Archives Union List, which the author used, are updated constantly as new holdings are acquired. New institutions such as the Vancouver Chinese Cultural Centre develop archival components. Much of the lists are dependent on the reliability of the existing finding aids and the assistance of the reference archivist(s). If the finding aid does not state that cannery plans within the records of the Insurers' Advisory Organization contain locations of Japanese and Chinese bunkhouses, then the compiler cannot list it.

Raymond Nunn is to be congratulated for painstakingly compiling and indexing a work that shows researchers the rich heritage that constitutes Canada's relations with Asia. I will return to his informative two volumes time and time again to assist researchers.

*Down from the Shimmering Sky:
Masks of the Northwest Coast*

Peter Macnair, Robert Joseph, and Bruce Grenville

Vancouver: Douglas and McIntyre, Seattle: University of Washington Press, and Vancouver: Vancouver Art Gallery, 1998. 192 pp. Illus, maps. \$39.95 paper.

*Native Visions: Evolution in Northwest Coast Art from
the Eighteenth through the Twentieth Century*

Steven C. Brown

Vancouver and Toronto: The Seattle Art Museum in association with Douglas and McIntyre, 1998. 216 pp. Illus., maps. US\$70 cloth.

BY CHARLOTTE TOWNSEND-GALT
University of British Columbia

Down from the *Shimmering Sky: Masks of the Northwest Coast*, the book, is remarkable for the same reason that the exhibition, at the Vancouver Art Gallery in the summer of 1998, was remarkable: it allows a close and uninterrupted look at masks, and only masks. To an extent the book overrides the contradictions implicit in such a project and a variety of critiques. (A mask exhibition had been in the gallery's plans for four years before it was brought forward in what all concerned admit to having been too much of a rush.) It is illustrated in the same style in which the masks were displayed – radiant, glowing, isolated. The curators' essays supply what the gallery labelling, for complex reasons, largely withheld; that is, the nicely judged curatorial collaboration, the narratives of new scholarship, of context, of the masks themselves, which constitute the significant contribution of *Down from the Shimmering Sky*.

Arguably the contradiction is really between visual and other forms of knowledge, the balance between them shifting in response to the state of the struggle over who knows what and who has the right to tell it, and who has the right, or the need, to apply the art label. That the art label is problematic is one of the interesting issues of the politico-aesthetic present. For the narratives about other ways of valuing do not tell themselves, as vox populi pointed out in the gallery, asking for more information, aware of ambiguities: If masks should not be shown except when performed, why are we looking at them? Where are the stories without which they are diminished and misunderstood? Significantly, Wilson Duff is invoked in the curators' introductory essay as a kind of presiding genius – the anthropologist who struggled eloquently with the problems caused when objects come adrift from their narratives.

Bruce Grenville manoeuvres the enterprise into the art gallery zone – where the Vancouver Art Gallery has its own history of paradigm-shifting exhibitions in this area – most notably *Arts of the Raven: Masterworks by the Northwest Coast Indian* (1967) and *Images, Stone, B.C.: Thirty Centuries of Northwest Coast Indian Sculpture* (1975) – rightly identifying the split between aesthetics and ethnography that has shaped the discussion and that this project aspires to narrow.

In his eloquent essay Chief Robert Joseph says things of great consequence with a light touch, giving a much-needed account of what it is to grow up as a dancer, to encounter Bakwas and Dzunukwa as a child, and to see masks playing their roles as instruments of moral instruction and social control. This kind of exegesis is an invitation to a wide audience to think about masked beings as something beyond quintessential exotica, as part of the human struggle with the unspeakable in humanity and of cosmic battles between order and chaos. Macnair's commentary follows the same cosmologically derived organization as does the exhibition.

The representative selection of masks from all the coastal peoples, with a numerical emphasis on the Kwakwaka'wakw, was assembled by Joseph and Macnair from the international diaspora of Northwest Coast material in public and private collections. It includes the sightless stone mask (one of a pair from Tsimshian territory) and masks that show remarkable modulations of anatomical structure, from skin on bone to the most elaborate constructions.

Peter Macnair, for thirty years curator of ethnology at the Royal British Columbia Museum, is himself a repository of knowledge that has

been acquired through his long-standing friendship with Robert Joseph and other Kwakwaka'wakw associates. This publication forced him into print, although his original contribution to scholarship is modestly marked with very small asterisks in the catalogue listing. His text explicates the cosmological organizing principles of the exhibition display. Having assembled masks, most of which could not have been seen together before, his text demonstrates continuity, proves longevity, and extends attributions and influences. An important assertion has to do with the extent to which masks have been made for non-Native consumption. This, in turn, complicates an over-simple picture of cross-cultural contact in this part of the world, implies that visitors' interest may not always have been malign, and points out that Native artists are perpetuating a tradition by working for the market (rather than betraying authenticity) and that they were not averse to adapting their iconography to changing circumstances.

Bill Holm's *Northwest Coast Art: An Analysis of Form* has been an extremely influential book since it first appeared in 1965. It established, on a formal level, the understanding of style, particularly what Holm termed the Northern two-dimensional style of the nineteenth century, as a formal language with grammatical rules. The identification and schematic drawings of formlines, ovoids, u forms, and the permutations and combinations of these elements, offered a route to understanding at a time when the transmission of knowledge seemed to be at risk. Few carvers are without a well-used copy, Robert Davidson among them (who called it his bible when he was learning). It has enabled many to do as well as to see. Holm's claims for his

work were more modest and more limited than many who have used it to perpetuate the discussion of Northwest Coast art as a detached, if brilliant, schema (what Marjorie Halpin and other have criticized as "the Boasian paradigm").

Steven Brown, like Holm, is an expert (non-Native) carver himself, and they share an infectious curiosity about how it is done. His book *Native Visions* makes an even-handed assessment of the role of formal analysis. It would have been more valuable if the conversation between protagonists and detractors about whether and how "the visual elements and principles of the Northwest Coast tradition reflect the tenets and values of the cultures and social systems that artistically employ them," which emerges at certain points, had been further developed. But Brown's own belief about time and society are summed up when he speaks of "a natural, karmic return of the tide."

The importance of *Native Visions* (the title may be misleading) lies in its detailed amplification of these principles. Two things emerge: some subtle readings of individual pieces and an account of what Brown terms the evolution of stylistic paths – paths that began at least 5,500 years ago. He shares Macnair's interest in establishing earlier dates than has hitherto seemed possible and in showing that he has a plausible technique for doing so. That it can also be problematic is betrayed in remarks such as the following (with regard to establishing a date before 1860 for a Chinookan sheep horn ladle): "By that time, it would seem that many traditional pursuits would have been interrupted through settlement of the region" – a masterly understatement.

The book is based on an exhibition drawn from private collections in the

Seattle area and is complemented by works from that particular assemblage of material known as the Hauberg Collection (now in the Seattle Art Museum). As such, it will provide further scope for studying the symbiotic relationship between collectors, institutions, and what gets talked about.

Brown is at his most persuasive, and his prose at its most limber, when he is most moved. He provides some subtle accounts, particularly of the classic period formline art of the mid- to late-nineteenth century, extolling the perfectly judged tension that determines the degree of curve, for example, or the way in which calculation seems to yield to sensuality in the conjunctions between elements. By the time Brown has worked his way through the analysis, the well-placed illustrations allow the reader to register the nauseating slackness when the tension is eased, by accident or design, or by the grossness of lumpy, misconstrued ovoids.

Such responses might seem to vindicate the notion – one subtext of formal analysis – that there is a trans-cultural aesthetic in operation. Such was the theme of the discussion between Holm and Bill Reid that was published as *Indian Art of the Northwest Coast: A Dialogue on Craftsmanship and Aesthetics* (1975). It could be argued that it is here that modernism has made itself felt on the Northwest Coast. But here also is the interesting difficulty. Modernism made its case independently of signification. Those who want to claim that this is "art" today have to build their case on more than form to satisfy all those, Native and non-Native, who are interested in something other than formal values – who want to know about what cannot be seen.

*Colonizing Bodies: Aboriginal Health
and Healing in British Columbia, 1900-50*

Mary-Ellen Kelm

Vancouver: UBC Press, 1998. 248 pp. Illus., maps. \$75 cloth, \$25.95 paper.

BY BRUCE MILLER

University of British Columbia

and

LARAINÉ MICHALSON

Vancouver/Richmond Health Board

C*olonizing Bodies* makes the argument that the ill health of Indigenous people in British Columbia between the years 1900 and 1950 was created by the deadly combination of recently arrived pathogens, colonial policies, and Euro-Canadian medical practices. In making this case, Kelm contests the widely held view that Indigenous people are naturally stressed by the processes of contact and that it is sufficient merely to understand the transmission of disease to know what went wrong in the first half of the century. She argues that government Indian Health Service practices and records serve a surveillance function and reinforce the image of sick, disorganized communities in a manner that appears to justify paternalism. She contends that Indigenous bodies (or people, to avoid the jargon she employs in this book) emerged with practices and beliefs that incorporated both the old and the changing. She contrasts Indigenous views of the provision of health care (i.e., that the government is to provide it free to Indigenous communities) with the Indian Health Service view of it (i.e., that it is a tool of integration) – a contradiction that helps explain

even current conflicts over health coverage. Kelm, an ethnohistorian, relies on archival sources, including Indian Health Service records and interviews with contemporary Indigenous people, to build her arguments.

These claims are not contentious; indeed, they echo current interpretive modes applied to other areas and populations. A similar set of claims was previously advanced by John O'Neill (as reported in the Royal Commission on Aboriginal Affairs), and Culhane and Stephenson et al. have also demonstrated the connections between colonialism and the loss of control over one's own community and health in British Columbia. Given that this is not news, the value of the book lies in its careful attention to the strengths of the various Indigenous communities in addressing health issues rather than to the far more common deficiency models of Native health. We wish to point out that this reflects a fortunate convergence between historiography and public health theory and practice – a circumstance that makes *Colonizing Bodies* important to a wide range of readers and the sort of book that ought to find its way into social science,

public policy, history, medicine, and nursing courses.

There are problems in framing and making the argument, however, and the first concerns the unit of analysis. British Columbia is both too small and too large to easily address Indigenous health. It is too large for the generalizations about Indigenous communities that Kelm makes, relying, as she does, on examples from all over the province (e.g., snippets concerning the Tlingit are mixed in with material regarding the Coast Salish some 2,000 kilometres to the south). Circumstances on the Lower Mainland were not the same as those along the Yukon border, and disease histories and responses to colonialism are not identical on the Coast and in the Interior. On the other hand, stopping at the northern and southern borders arbitrarily divides both Indigenous communities and scholarly discourse. The most relevant material on Coast Salish responses to disease, for example, is found in the work of Guilmet, Thompson, and colleagues (uncited by Kelm), who have proposed significant models of response to epidemics and to how Indigenous people chose among a range of Indigenous and non-Indigenous health practitioners.

Kelm carefully differentiates between practitioners (missionary doctors and nurses, she writes, were generally more committed than government-appointed health care providers). Nevertheless, one of the major efforts of the book is to portray medical and nursing practitioners as

the "advanced guard" (120) of colonization and as legitimating colonial relations. This is fair enough, and a valuable thing to say, but the issue is more complicated, and the data presented can be read to make the opposite point. The activities of health professionals are intrusive, but they also support the ritual practices that buffer communities from intrusion and help keep them intact. The catch here is that these traditional activities (namings, potlatches, spiritual burnings, and so on) are expensive and are dependent on personal and community physical, mental, and economic health.

Although Kelm is an ethnohistorian, there is an ahistorical feel to this book in that, although Indigenous concepts of the body are presented, there is little sense of Indigenous conceptions of what health is or how it has changed; instead, ideas of health are treated as constant, as is the social organization of "Indian doctors" and other community health practitioners. *Colonizing Bodies* makes no attempt to examine what motivates the health discourses in Indigenous communities and how these shift historically. This suggests a passivity that is at odds with the major thesis regarding Indigenous agency. Despite these problems, by discrediting the destructive and paternalistic deficit model, Kelm plays an important role in pointing communities, academics, and public health officials to the vital task of continuing to recognize and support the sources of community resilience and, ultimately, health.

*Positioning the Missionary:
John Booth Good and the Confluence of Cultures
in Nineteenth-Century British Columbia*

Brett Christophers

Vancouver: UBC Press, 1998. 200 pp. Illus., maps. \$27.95 paper.

BY JOHN BARKER

University of British Columbia

The title of this book is significant. Rather than presenting a straightforward historical narrative, Christophers positions his interpretation of a nineteenth-century mission to the Nlha7káp̓mx (Thompson Indians) near Lytton within three frameworks. In so doing he brings fresh insights into the motivations and paradoxes of one branch of the international missionary movement. Some of the more important of these concern missionary attitudes towards the sexual relationships between Native women and men (Indigenous and White), hence the play in the book's title on the so-called "missionary position."

The main object of this study is John Booth Good, who was born and trained as an Anglican missionary in England. Good worked for five years in Nanaimo before being reassigned, by Bishop George Hills of the Diocese of Columbia, to the mining town of Yale in 1866. In March 1867, three groups of Nlha7káp̓mx invited Good to relocate his mission to the Lytton area. Concluding, as missionaries are wont to do, that this solicitation expressed the workings of Divine Providence, Good overcame the objections of his bishop and moved. The first few years were encouraging. By 1870, Good had some 2,000 Nlha7káp̓mx under instruction. He purchased a large

site outside of Lytton, which he hoped would become a centre where Christian Nlha7káp̓mx would settle and farm. With the assistance of Nlha7káp̓mx converts, he began learning the local language, extended Christian instruction to the villages, and introduced a system of watchmen to monitor behaviour among Christians in the outlying villages. Despite a promising beginning, the mission soon began to falter. Good proved unable to manage his meagre funds, leaving the mission in debt more years than not. The Nlha7káp̓mx proved uninterested in settling at the St. Paul Mission, forcing Good to make extended trips to his widely dispersed parishioners. In addition, Good remained responsible for providing religious services to a growing White population. As the years passed, an increasing number of converts ran afoul of the mission's moral code, forcing some out and alienating others. Only eight years into his mission, Good was already considering resigning. From 1876 on, he spent each winter in Victoria, where his wife and children had relocated. In 1883 he closed his part-time mission for good.

Christophers positions Good's mission first within the framework of Nlha7káp̓mx ethnography, as recorded by James Teit. He specifically addresses the questions of why the Nlha7káp̓mx

first invited Good to settle among them and later largely rejected his mission, and he also considers the social changes caused by the missionary intrusion. I found this the least satisfying level of analysis, as it rarely rises above common-sense observation.

Christophers' second framework, an analysis of missionary discussions, is far more interesting and convincing than his first. He spends much of the early chapters discussing the deeper theological motivations for missions, exploring both their ideological and practical effects. It is, to say the least, very unusual to find an intelligent discussion of Pauline mission theology in a secular history. Christophers also fruitfully explores differences between Good and Bishop Hills, particularly concerning the treatment of polygamous marriage (although, surprisingly, Christophers does not seem to be aware that most Tractarian Anglicans regarded marriage as a sacrament).

Within his third framework, colonial discourse, Christophers strongly supports the emerging scholarly consensus that stresses the diverse nature of colonial projects and voices. He rightly asserts that missions had a basic religious and humanistic motivation that distinguished them from state and commercial colonial enterprises. His interpretation of the ways that

Pauline theology conditioned Anglican notions of space and strategies of mission puts this insight into good effect, as does a fascinating discussion of church attitudes towards common-law marriages between Native women and White men.

Christophers' account of the Lytton mission itself is surprisingly thin. He provides only the barest sketches of the mission, converts, or Good himself. Indeed, in some chapters Good appears only as a bit player. As a consequence, Christophers' discussions often have a rather ethereal quality. I do not doubt, to give one instance, that Good was aware of Augustine's condemnation of the fourth-century Donatist movement, but I do wonder whether this ancient argument really explains much about his immediate motivations and actions in Lytton. *Positioning the Missionary* works best as an informed and intelligent commentary on some general themes of the Protestant missionary movement in the late nineteenth century, with John Booth Good as a convenient vehicle. Regional historians may object to the inadequacies of the history, while students of mission may take exception to Christophers' apologetic tone. Still, the book deserves a close reading for its provocative insights and tentative opening of new grounds for future exploration.