# BOOK REVIEWS

*Victims of Benevolence: The Dark Legacy of the Williams Lake Residential School*, by Elizabeth Furniss. Vancouver: Arsenal Pulp Press, 1995. 141 pp. Illus., map. $12.95 paper.

*The Oblate Assault on Canada's Northwest*, by Robert Choquette. Ottawa: University of Ottawa Press, 1995. 258 pp. Illus., maps. $26.00 paper.

These two works provide a glimpse into the debates on the role of missionaries in western Canada. While neither author fully embraces either pole of much of the contemporary scholarship on missionary activity — hagiography versus virulent condemnation — they stakes out very different positions.

Robert Choquette follows the expansion of the missionary Oblates of Mary Immaculate — a largely French, Roman Catholic congregation — into western and northern Canada in the nineteenth century. He sees Oblate contact with, and proselytization of, Canada's Native peoples as a "conquest"; Native people were "conquered religiously and . . . largely assimilated" (p. 21). Choquette's primary interest lies in the relations between the Oblates and the Anglo-Protestant missionaries, and he employs military terminology to highlight the "real" battle between Roman Catholic and Protestant missionaries. The first two-thirds of the book follows Oblate-Protestant confrontations in Red River, Athabasca-Mackenzie, Alberta, and, to some extent, British Columbia. The last third offers an analysis of Oblate missionary strategies, Roman Catholic/Protestant relations, and Anglo-Franco relations, the latter described largely through the prism of the Manitoba and North-West Territories school questions.

Choquette's most interesting section is his analysis of the material consequences of Catholic theology. He explains baptismal practices and the role the sacraments were to play in Native "conversion." Oblates baptized potential converts sooner than did Protestants, believing that baptism washed away sin and that the convert's faith could be nurtured and brought to maturity through sacramental teaching and practice. Protestants were slow to baptize, believing that baptism was "the symbolic recognition of a [sudden and complete] conversion that has already taken place in the person's heart" (pp. 192-93).

Choquette claims that, overall, Catholics were more successful than were Protestants in converting Native peoples. Oblate success, he believes, hinged on the clergy's practice of celibacy, mission practices which were consonant with Roman Catholic theology, the Oblate emphasis on Native languages, and the high quality of Oblate Christian witness. In the final analysis, he grants the Oblates the dubious distinction of having "served to liberate the Indian people of Canada, but . . . within a context of ethnocultural subjugation . . . driven by the Euro-Canadian conquest of Canada's North and West" (p. 236).

Focusing on the first thirty years of St Joseph's residential school near Williams Lake, British Columbia, Elizabeth Furniss provides a very different account of Oblate activity in western Canada. Her objective is to examine the "long-term structural relations between First Nations and the Canadian government" (p. 15), in which she considers the Oblates to be profoundly implicated. She wants to pry apart the types of control — legal, administrative, and ideological — that the Oblates and the provincial and federal governments were able to exercise over Native peoples. To do so she concentrates on the events surrounding the death of Duncan Sticks, a young Shuswap boy attending St Joseph's in 1902, and, to a lesser extent, on the suicide of Augustine Allan in 1910.

Furniss claims that the Oblates and the government collaborated to manipulate the meaning and interpretation of these tragedies, not only to effect damage control, but also to legitimate the residential school system itself. She argues that material circumstances surrounding the deaths — poor-quality food and harsh discipline which may have led to a spate of runaways — were reinterpreted by the Oblates and, above all, by the government. Explanations of the runaway problem and the deaths were shifted away from food and discipline and refocused on Native people, who were no longer seen as the victims but as the causes of these problems. Native methods of

resistance (e.g., running away) were reinterpreted by school and government officials as the inability of Native people to recognize their own best interests; food shortages were seen as children's lack of common sense simply to ask for more. Thus, through a manipulation of the meanings and circumstances of the boys' deaths, the Oblates and the government legitimized their continued interference in Native lives. Furniss considers such interference, in the name of benevolent paternalism, as fundamental to contemporary Native-government relations.

Reading these two books together, I am struck by their contradictory yet complementary analyses. While Furniss offers a sensitive, if brief, ethnography of the Shuswap, she largely ignores the Oblates; Choquette does a fine job of pointing out some of the theological differences between Protestants and Catholics and of locating the Oblates in nineteenth-century Catholicism, but he largely ignores the Native presence. With these points in mind, I would like to suggest some of the difficulties these books present.

Choquette paints a rosy picture of the Oblate "conquest" of Canada's Northwest, both in terms of its local success and general outcome. This partly reflects the primary focus of his research, which is to illuminate the relations between Roman Catholic and Protestant missionaries in the nineteenth century. But it also reflects his tendency to gloss over many details of the Oblate project (e.g., Oblate attitudes towards marriage) and his suspicion of Anglo-Protestantism in general.

While Choquette does explain different Protestant doctrines, he sees all Protestants as "culturally arrogant" (p. 232), "bigoted and intolerant" (p. 216), and the clergy, in particular, as having a poor and "warped" education (p. 171). This attitude towards Anglo-Protestants explains his inclusion of a chapter devoted to the Manitoba and Northwest Territories school questions, a chapter which sheds no light on the Oblate "assault" and a great deal on Choquette's religious and political inclinations. It is not an attitude that bodes well for a balanced assessment of Catholic and Protestant missionary activity.

In the final chapter, Choquette proclaims the Oblate triumph over their Protestant foes in the Canadian Northwest. He then goes on to posit a special "affinity" between Native peoples and the Oblate priests based, according to Choquette, on the similar positions vis-à-vis Anglo-Protestantism. "French and Canadian Catholics were used to being in a minority position linguistically, culturally, and religiously . . . Their best hope was to survive with as few losses as possible. In

this fundamental respect, they were very close to the Indian people" (p. 232). I find this argument about the affinity between Native people and the Oblates astonishing. To compare the ethnocultural survival of French and Canadian Catholics to that of Native peoples in the nineteenth century is to telescope the politics of the present into accounts of the past. The disruptive forces at work on Native cultures — disease, loss of game, the reserve system, and the activities of both Protestant and Roman Catholic missionaries — were so acute that many White observers predicted the extinction not only of Native cultures but of Native peoples themselves. To posit a relationship, unconscious or otherwise, between Natives and Catholics of any nationality, based on the mutually experienced threat of Anglo-Protestant domination, is to conflate colonial subjugation and cultural prejudice.

Furniss, on the other hand, runs into problems because she has not considered the specific circumstances and religious character of the Oblates. The Oblates were overwhelmingly French: they spoke and wrote in French, and many did not acquire English until years after their arrival in BC. As Roman Catholics, they were targets of a great deal of anti-Papal sentiment in a country that was governed, by and large, by Anglo-Protestants. In this light, I have a great deal of difficulty accepting Furniss's argument concerning the collusion of Oblates and the government. While extremely active in petitioning the government to lay out and enlarge Native reserves, the Oblates had no preferential access to goverment or law. Nor did they participate in government administration, being themselves governed by the Roman Catholic hierarchy. Indeed, Oblates, unlike Protestant missionaries (e.g., William Duncan), were not seen as appropriate government officials: they were neither Indian agents nor justices of the peace as was, for example, William Duncan.

Catholic education has been an Oblate objective in British Columbia since the time of their arrival. The Oblates opened their first school on the BC mainland in 1863 at St Mary's mission — without government support. I suspect that much of the Oblate rhetoric Furniss cites had less to do with collaboration than with the need to keep Catholic schools from being overwhelmed by a secular or Protestant school system. The Oblates were driven by goals and motivations that often bore little resemblance to those of the government; perhaps it is appropriate to say that the Oblates were less interested in "civilizing" Natives than they were in "Catholicizing" them. And schools were seen as the means par excellence of achieving such an end.

But I agree with Furniss that, in some cases, Oblate rhetoric and government rhetoric, although differently motivated, did overlap and reinforce each other. To deny that Christianity, particularly in combination with the residential school environment, has had a profound impact on Native peoples is unthinkable, and the 1991 Oblate Apology to Native Peoples is a testament that some Oblates have come to recognize that the effects of their missions on Native peoples and cultures were not always positive.

I think it is important to point out the ways in which government rhetoric can be reinforced by other forms of rhetoric, for we need to be able to pick our way through these coalitions — whether intentional or not — to get at their (often) racist and (always) self-serving cores and to understand the impact that these rhetorics continue to have on Native people today. While I don't agree with many of the details of Furniss's argument, I do applaud how she shows us the connections between twentieth-century problems and nineteenth-century "solutions."

*University of British Columbia* LYNN A. STEWART

***Hail, Columbia: Robert Gray, John Kendrick, and the Pacific Fur Trade***, by John Scofield. Portland: Oregon Historical Society Press, 1993. xx, 378 pp. Maps, illus. US$19.95.

Following the Oregon Historical Society's edition of Frederic Howay's *Voyages of the Columbia to the Northwest Coast, 1787-1790 & 1790-1793* (1990), John Scofield's study of the enigmatic leaders of America's first Pacific fur-trading expeditions is a welcome addition. Howay left many unanswered questions about the activities and motivations of the two commanders, John Kendrick and Robert Gray. If Scofield offers readers a little too much in the way of "rattling anchor chains," "greasy swells," and speculative recreations, he also presents new views explaining the idiosyncrasies exhibited by the major figures. When Captain Kendrick took command of *Columbia Redivivia*, owned by Joseph Barrell and partners, he had a distinguished war record (against the British during the American Revolution) and long experience at sea. Less is known about Captain Gray, who commanded the small consort, *Lady Washington.*

From the beginning, Kendrick appeared to lack the Yankee efficiency that drove New England traders to compete for markets

around the world. Rather than quickly making for the Northwest Coast to harvest sea-otter furs for the Canton market, Kendrick leisurely cruised the Atlantic Ocean, considered wintering in the Falkland Islands, and, later, procrastinated at Nootka Sound, where he met the Spaniards who had come to occupy the port. In the only surviving written journal, nineteen-year-old Robert Haswell angrily criticized Kendrick. Although Scofield makes every effort to explain Kendrick's bizarre behaviour — such as his decision to swap ships with Gray — there is insufficient evidence to permit definitive conclusions. Scofield does fill some lacunae left by Howay — particularly regarding the American visits to Canton, where crew members of *Columbia* (perhaps even Captain Gray) smuggled sea-otter pelts that were not included in the ship's inventory. *Columbia* returned to Boston having undergone a financial loss, freighted with low-grade teas and cargo consigned to it by Barrell's competitors. Kendrick followed Gray to Asia with *Lady Washington*, commencing yet another apparently aimless period during which he squandered all possibilities of earning profits.

Despite Barrell's legitimate concerns about honesty and efficiency, in 1790 Gray received command of a second expedition, which was dispatched quickly in order to take full advantage of knowledge gained on the Northwest Coast. This time, Barrell assigned John Hoskins as supercargo to watch the books and to protect the owners against smuggling. Scofield located new documentation on the Boston partners who assembled a cargo of trade goods, including copper sheets, cloth, iron chisels, and 125 old government muskets. John Boit, John Hoskins, and Robert Haswell kept journals of the expedition, which reached the Northwest Coast in early June 1791, reducing Kendrick's sailing time from Boston by four months.

After Kendrick's stay in China, during which he sold his furs and contracted loans without making any payment to his owners, he hatched some quite grandiose projects. In 1791, Kendrick attempted unsuccessfully to open trade with Japan, crossed to the Hawaiian Islands, and returned to the Queen Charlotte Islands, where he almost lost *Lady Washington* to Haida attackers. At Nootka Sound, where the Spaniards had constructed a post and fort, Kendrick quietly purchased several parcels of land from Native chiefs. Continuing south to Clayoquot Sound, he met Gray, and they wintered over, constructing a coastal trading vessel brought in frame aboard *Columbia*, and experienced poor relations with the Clayoquot. Scofield estimates that the Clayoquot chiefs now possessed over 200 muskets

and plentiful ammunition. Although the original journals sometimes glossed over the use of force, the Americans provoked incidents by confiscating furs, lumber, and other possessions. When Gray departed Clayoquot Sound, he punished the Clayoquot by ordering the destruction of the village of Opitsat.

Even with the addition of some creative imagination, Scofield suffered the same frustrations as did Howay and other historians who have studied these expeditions. Gray's officers criticized him severely for carelessly jeopardizing *Columbia* in treacherous waters — an incident that almost led to shipwreck. Gray was a ruthless commander who pushed his men hard and mistreated Native peoples, and yet he achieved less success as a trader than did many of his contemporaries. Scofield estimates that Gray's officers and crew kept about half of the sea-otter skins aboard *Columbia* off the official inventories. Gray discovered the Columbia River without understanding its significance. Kendrick was a dreamer as well as a rogue. Though he failed to generate any return for his owners, he purchased empty land to fulfil his dream of establishing American sovereignty and settlements on the Northwest Coast, recognized the potential of shipping Hawaiian sandalwood to China, and even speculated about digging a canal across the Isthmus of Panama. While Captain George Vancouver criticized Kendrick for selling muskets, gunpowder, and even heavy guns to the Hawaiians, he was popular with the Natives of both Hawaii and the Northwest Coast. Until his accidental death in Hawaii in 1794, Kendrick, like any good gambler, anticipated a windfall bonanza that would restore his good name and fortune.

Although it would take the discovery of unknown journals to cast additional light upon Captains Kendrick and Gray, Scofield has clarified many points and made good use of careful speculation based upon solid research. Knowledgeable readers might quibble about some observations — such as the description of Spain's Esteban Jos Martnez as "courtly" — but these matters will not detract from the overall contribution of the book to the historiography of eighteenth-century Northwest Coast exploration.

*University of Calgary* CHRISTON I. ARCHER

*Vancouver Voters, 1886: A Biographical Dictionary*, edited and compiled by Peter S. N. Claydon, Valerie A. Melanson, and members of the British Columbia Genealogical Society. Richmond: British Columbia Genealogical Society, 1994. xviii, 903 pp. Photos, map. $75.00 paper.

Scholarship comes in many forms. We usually move from conceptualization to primary research to reconceptualization into publishable form. The end product is some distance from the primary research underlying it, just as the research process has likely moved the project away from its initial conceptualization. With *Vancouver Voters*, the authors have stopped somewhere between the second and the third stages of scholarship. The end result is still quite close to the primary research stage, meaning that we can each integrate relevant information into our own projects. We are not dependent on the authors for reconceptualization and interpretation.

*Vancouver Voters, 1886*, compiled under the auspices of the British Columbia Genealogical Society (BCGS), contains biographical vignettes and genealogies for about 415 of the 528 persons on the first Vancouver voters list, which was compiled in October 1886. For the remainder, all that was located was property owned or some other such basis of voter qualification. The typical largish entry also includes a biographical sketch, along with birth, marriage, and death dates for the voter and his family and descendants so far as possible up to the present day.

The voters' list was, of course, a skewed document that in no way equated to the Vancouver population of the day. The young city, which was spun into existence by the completion of the transcontinental Canadian Pacific Railway (CPR), only extended from the waterfront south to 16th Avenue, west to Trafalgar, and east to Heatley. Its thousand or so residents did not equate either to the 499 who voted in the first civic election in May or to the 528 making it onto the first voters' list, which was compiled after the fact. According to the Vancouver charter of incorporation, "male or fem sole of the full age of 21 years being a freeholder, householder for at least six months pervious to such election, or preemptor or leaseholder for a term of not less than six months resident within the said city shall be entitled to vote, but no fem sole shall be qualified to sit or vote as mayor or alderman." In other words, residence was not a requirement if one were a property owner, and many on the list were absentee landlords and/or speculators. Just five women were on the voters' list.

It is the biases in the voters' list that makes the volume fascinating reading, rather like constructing a jigsaw puzzle on the exercise of power. What did it mean that CPR promoters Donald Smith and Richard Angus, and such household names in British Columbia history as John Robson, Robert Dunsmuir, and the Oppenheimer brothers, voted alongside long-time Burrard Inlet residents Ben Springer and Joseph Mannion and likely newcomer "Mrs. M. A. Coffer," a woman whom even the BCGS could not track down?

The research that went into *Vancouver Voters, 1886* is overwhelming. Footnotes confirm the authenticity of each piece of information, thus maximizing its utility. The research model used to link past and present is exemplary in terms of the now-familiar dialectic between freedom of information and right to privacy. In the first stage of research, BCGS members scoured the public record, including the City of Vancouver Archives, newspapers, and cemetery lists. In the second, descendants who could be located were invited to fill out, in as much detail as possible, a questionnaire on their family. Another round of research confirmed the accuracy of responses to the questionnaire and followed up new leads. Descendants were then asked to check the resulting family history for accuracy, confidentiality, and omissions. In practice, only a small minority of descendants could be tracked down.

As a work of genealogy, *Vancouver Voters, 1886* is a tour de force. Its date of publication was originally scheduled to coincide with the 1986 Vancouver centennial, but it did not appear until nine years later. There was always one more branch of a family to locate, one more birth or death date to verify. The BCGS's decision to bring families up to the present day also extended the task, perhaps a bit more than was necessary to reveal the significance of the 1886 voters' list. Nonetheless, we are all in the BCGS's debt.

*University of British Columbia* JEAN BARMAN

***On the Highest Hill***, by Roderick Haig-Brown. Introduction by Laurie Ricou. Corvalis: Oregon State University Press, 1994. Photos. xxvii, 319 pp. $27.95 cloth; $15.95 paper.

Best known for his naturalist writing and juvenile fiction, genres which have not received much serious consideration in the Canadian literary canon, Roderick Haig-Brown also wrote two adult novels:

*Timber: A Novel of Pacific Coast Loggers* (1942), previously issued in the Northwest Reprint Series emanating from the University of Oregon Press, and *On the Highest Hill*, first published in 1949 and now reprinted in the same series, with an introduction by Laurie Ricou. Dismissed as "regional idylls" by Desmond Pacey in 1961, these two books have received scant attention. The 1940s are rather a lost decade in Canadian literary studies; lacking the singular urgency of the Depression thirties and the cohesive buoyancy of the postwar fifties, the period was dominated by two canonical novels published in 1945, Hugh MacLennan's *Two Solitudes* and Gabrielle Roy's *The Tin Flute.* These icons of national literary identity, along with Gwethalyn Graham's best-selling *Earth and High Heaven* (1944) and the poetry of A. M. Klein, posit a Canada whose mythic centre is Montreal. Few works arose at this time from Atlantic Canada to disrupt this Laurentian centrism; and, while a number of writers, such as Earle Birney, Emily Carr, W. O. Mitchell, and Ethel Wilson, initiated a challenge from the West, their work did little to dislodge mid-century Central Canadian notions of literary significance. Hence the virtual vacuum surrounding the fiction of Roderick Haig-Brown, whose novels, while not quite reclaimable as lost masterpieces, equal in technical accomplishment the work of many of his better-known eastern Canadian peers. However, British Columbia would not figure noticeably on the Canadian canonical bookcase (as selected by the Ontario university classroom) until several decades later, beginning with Sheila Watson's avant-garde *The Double Hook* (1959), becoming more fully visible with the work of Jack Hodgins and George Bowering in the 1970s, and achieving a shelf of its own in the mid-1980s.

The importance of audience to the creation of literary value is signalled in Laurie Ricou's Introduction, which participates in the move currently popular among many critics to dismantle the nationalist frameworks that, for more than a century, justified the academic study of literature. While I am situating Haig-Brown in a general Canadian context, Ricou pitches his comments to the largely American readership of the particular series in which this book now appears. A traditional Canadianist would affiliate Haig-Brown's "mountain man," Colin Ensley, with Howard O'Hagan's Tay John (*Tay John* 1939) in his mythical identification with the wilderness, and with Ernest Buckler's David Canaan (*The Mountain and the Valley* 1952) in his social alienation. Ricou, in contrast, blurs the forty-ninth parallel and discusses Haig-Brown in relation to a body of writers associated with a region that Americans refer to as the Pacific Northwest, thus

privileging continental geography over political history. How does this reorientation serve the text? At a time when many novelists who sought economic success in the United States refrained from specifying their settings as Canadian (e.g., no geographical identifications appear in Sinclair Ross's *As For Me and My House* [1941] and very few appear in the urban stories of Morley Callaghan), Haig-Brown wrote passionately specific fiction about Vancouver Island, which he overtly names, just as he does Vancouver, the Prairie provinces, and Nijmegen as Colin passes through these places during the Depression and the Second World War. Haig-Brown's use of "mythical map names" (p. xix) applies only to Vancouver Island sites, in part to deter local readers from treating fiction as history or autobiography.

As an "accumulation of unfinished narratives" (p. xiv), to use Ricou's apt phrase, *On the Highest Hill* shares the ethos of many Canadian novels of its era, including most of those mentioned in this review. Like these books, Haig-Brown's is of interest today as much for its efforts as for its accomplishments. Its hero symbolizes the individual's alienation from the increasing complexity of the modern age. Caught in the transition from handlogging to industrial processing (and its accompanying union politics), in the upheavals of the Depression, and in his own social and sexual uncertainty, Colin retreats far into his beloved mountains, his superb wilderness skills ironically contributing to his eventual self-destruction. The book's "first-stage regionalism" (p. xxiv) mediates between the semi-fiction of Grainger's *Woodsmen of the West* (1908) and the complex layering of Daphne Marlatt's *Ana Historic* (1988). The next time I have an opportunity to teach a course on BC literature, this is where I would like to place this book, grateful to Laurie Ricou and the Oregon State University Press for making it available in a handsome, affordable edition.

*Simon Fraser University* CAROLE GERSON

*A Dedicated Team: Klohn Leonoff Consulting Engineers, 1951-1991*, by Cyril E. Leonoff. Richmond: Bi-Tech Publishers, 1994. viii, 252 pp. Photos. $49.95 cloth.

Of all the materials used by the civil engineer, the most common is earth. Dams and highways are built of it, industrial plants and tall buildings are founded on it, and, occasionally, structures are destroyed

by it when it subsides or slides downhill. It is also the most variable and complex of engineering materials. In spite of this, its properties were not analyzed and tested scientifically until the 1920s, so recently that the principals in the Klohn Leonoff firm — and, incidentally, also this reviewer — personally knew Karl Terzaghi, who named and founded the science of soil mechanics when his *Erdbaumechanik* was published in 1925. The founder of the Klohn Leonoff firm, Charles Ripley, did postgraduate work with Terzaghi at Harvard.

The science of soil mechanics is so recent that Leonoff is able to give a history of its inception and development and of its main protagonists in Europe, the United States, and Canada. Leonoff does this through personal knowledge, without resorting to technicalities. In Canada, the science of soil mechanics got its start on the Prairies, in whose universities Ripley, his associates Earle Klohn and Cyril Leonoff, and many of the early employees of the firm were educated. The reader can rely on the accuracy of the historical material in this book, and, indeed, nothing in the description of events or people in *A Dedicated Team* is inconsistent with this reviewer's recollection.

After the Second World War, British Columbia entered an era of rapid economic expansion, with new industries, hydro-electric plants, and highway construction all requiring the services of engineers. It was that boom which brought Charlie Ripley from Saskatchewan to Vancouver in 1951 to establish the first consulting firm in Canada to specialize in soils. The book traces the history of the firm, and the professional and geographical expansion of the field of soil mechanics, to 1991. It does not omit the false starts and the unsuccessful ventures that were experienced, and it tells us more than we need to know about a property dispute between Ripley and his brother, and about the circumstances that later led to the former's departure (along with his name) from the firm. The separation was amicable, and the author has dedicated his book to Ripley's wife.

In describing the many and varied projects of the firm, Leonoff has made extensive use of interviews with, and memoirs written by, the people who were directly involved. This gives an immediacy to the text but leads to some personal reminiscences that have little to do with the subject of the book. There are also numerous family histories. We are told that the family of one employee settled in New Brunswick in the mid-nineteenth century and that his grandmother rode to school on a horse. For the reader outside the corporate family, the book includes too many family histories, some of which go back even farther than the mid-nineteenth century.

The author was faced with the problem of narrating highly technical matters without losing the reader along the way. He took editing advice with regard to "lucidity" and has included a glossary of those technical terms that cannot be avoided. Still, some of the definitions will probably be of little help to the layperson. To do better is probably not possible, but readers without some knowledge of engineering or geoscience will have to be patient and to be willing to look up various references.

As a corporate history, *A Dedicated Team* differs from most such works. It was written by a principal of the firm, a man who has other published books to his credit. He has been as objective as possible, but he has included too many of the minutiae of the business and professional practices of Klohn Leonoff for an audience other than employees, clients, and geoscientists.

*Vancouver* JOHN KENDRICK

***Pilgrims in Lotus Land: Conservative Protestantism in British Columbia, 1917-1981***, by Robert K. Burkinshaw. Montreal & Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1995. 353 pp. $44.95 cloth.

Beyond the encounter between First Nations peoples and Christian missionaries in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, the impact of religion on the social and political life of British Columbia has largely been ignored by the province's historians. In *Pilgrims in Lotus Land*, Robert Burkinshaw begins to fill a large void in the historiography by examining the place of religion in an increasingly urban, multicultural, and secular society. Beginning with the evangelistic campaigns of French E. Oliver in 1917, Burkinshaw analyzes the growth of conservative Protestantism from a small group of evangelicals disillusioned with the increasing liberalism of the established mainline denominations to its current position as the religion of the "worshipping majority" among British Columbia's Protestants.

Burkinshaw's offers a multi-causal explanation of the success of conservative Protestantism in British Columbia that is sensitive to the socio-economic forces that have shaped the province. He argues that an active commitment to church planting and a lack of institutional restraints allowed conservative denominations to respond to the demographic changes that accompanied development and immigra-

tion much more readily than could the mainline churches. At the same time, an unwavering fidelity to a core set of traditional evangelical beliefs provided conservative Protestants with a clear sense of purpose and direction that contrasts sharply to the individualism and relativism that Burkinshaw believes afflicted liberal churches. According to Burkinshaw, the clarity of the conservatives' message and their dedication to traditional values proved increasingly popular as an antidote to the anxiety and ennui that accompanied urbanization, industrialization, and immigration. This conservatism was accompanied, however, by a willingness to embrace new technologies and to adopt new styles of worship, music, and evangelism. These innovations enabled conservative denominations both to attract new followers and to retain the younger generation to a much greater degree than the mainline churches. Challenging the frequent assertion that the endemic fragmentation associated with conservative Protestantism was a source of weakness, Burkinshaw contends that diversity was a strength, for it provided a wide range of choice for the religious consumer and thus permitted churches to attract a broader membership. He rejects the suggestion that conservative Protestantism in British Columbia was simply an extension of the fundamentalist movement in the United States, and he insists that the province's conservative churches were equally influenced by developments in Britain and elsewhere in Canada. Finally, Burkinshaw explores the important role conservative Protestants played in the election of the Social Credit party in 1952 and in its subsequent success.

Burkinshaw offers a compelling explanation of the complex forces that shaped the growth of conservative Protestantism in British Columbia. His interpretation suffers, however, from a triumphalist tone — a tendency to exaggerate gains and accomplishments — which is reminiscent of an earlier generation of church history. Although the groups he examines doubled in size during the period under study, they still constitute no more than 8 per cent of the total population. What Burkinshaw sees as a quite phenomenal success could equally be interpreted as a stunning failure, given conservative Protestantism's preoccupation with evangelism. While one in eight British Columbian's identified themselves with a conservative church in the 1981 census, more than twice that number claimed no religious affiliation whatsoever. The data presented in several of Burkinshaw's tables about church membership, attendance, and Sunday-School enrolment are also potentially suspect. Several tables are based, in part, upon such unsatisfactory sources as interviews with "church officials." And

he does not sufficiently address the high turnover in membership identified both by Reginald Bibby and by recent American studies of similar churches. At times, Burkinshaw's terminology is problematic. "Conservative Protestant" is used interchangeably with "evangelical" and "fundamentalist," and he tends to downplay the real theological divisions within the groups he examines. Burkinshaw's portrait of the so-called mainline or liberal churches, moreover, verges on caricature and fails to respect the diversity and complexities within these denominations. Although he cites Martin Marty's characterization of conservative Protestantism as an "anti-modern religion," Burkinshaw does not seriously explore the psychology of evangelicalism or fundamentalism. As a result, we gain little insight into the personality and piety of the people crowding into the churches described in his study.

Despite these shortcomings, *Pilgrims in Lotus Land* is an important book. Not only does it provide a wealth of information about the myriad of Protestant groups in the province, it also points to the important connections that exist between religion and social and political change. Burkinshaw's work calls out for comparable studies of modernism, secularization, and alternative spirituality in British Columbia.

*University of Calgary* NORMAN KNOWLES

*Sointula: Island Utopia*, by Pamela Wild. Madeira Park: Harbour Publishing, 1995. 223 pp. $28.95 cloth.

Over the years, British Columbia has been blessed by a goodly number of well-written local histories — and some not so good. *Sointula: Island Utopia* is a typical example of the former.

Pamela Wild, a former resident of Sointula, became fascinated with the obvious parallels between the turn-of-the-century utopian socialist settlement led by the Finnish editor, playwright, and politician Matti Kurikka (1863-1915) and the American "hippies" of the late 1960s who congregated on Malcolm Island in their flight from the Vietnam War, "civilization," and American persecution. Roughly two-thirds of the book concerns the utopian settlement which existed from 1901 until its acrimonious collapse in 1905 precipitated by economic difficulties and ideological differences. The rest of the book documents how the island recovered from the breakup of this com-

munity and its continuing socialist legacy reflected in the islanders' creation of Canada's first consumer co-op in 1909, their adherence to the Socialist Party and Social Democratic Party of Canada and, later, the Communist Party, and their active involvement in logging and fishing unions.

Wild is adept in her description of Malcolm Island's social life in the 1930s and 1940s. As one resident reported, "There was no church, no policeman, no beer parlours, and no trouble in those days" (p. 159). But this ideal situation was not to last. In 1951, electricity and, five years later, telephone service, helped change the island. Organized religion in the form of coastal missionaries arrived in 1948 (the original Finnish inhabitants had been rabidly anti-clerical). The first church, which was interdenominational, opened in 1961, and the RCMP arrived in 1965. Television became common, as did booze at Saturday-night dances. Each day high-school students took the ferry to school in Port McNeill. Even so, until the arrival of the American "hippies," "everybody knew everybody." "When you saw a man coming down the street," one informant reported, "you knew where he was coming from, you knew where he was going, and you knew what he was thinking about" (p. 175). The newcomers changed all that; but, over the years, tensions between the "old" and the "new" residents have eased. Today, about 750 people make their home on Malcolm island.

*Sointula: Island Utopia* is a popular rather than an academic account. Although the text is marred by a number of historical mistakes and spelling errors in the Finnish names, it is both interesting and readable, with the post-1905 period being particularly illuminating. The photographs, both historical and present-day, are excellent, giving the reader a real sense of the island and its fascinating history.

*University of British Columbia* J. DONALD WILSON

*Making Law, Order, and Authority in British Columbia, 1821-1871*, by Tina Loo. Toronto, Buffalo, London: University of Toronto Press, 1994. xii, 240 pp. Illus. $18.95 paper.

This book analyses the deployment of British law and the fashioning of social identities in nineteenth-century British Columbia. Working with court records and ideas from social theory and legal history, Tina

Loo argues that colonial British Columbia was shaped by "a discourse of classical or laissez-faire liberalism" (3). She claims that non-native British Columbians were concerned foremost with their economic fortunes, that they and the colonial government sought a social order based on liberal principles of free trade and individual rights, and that the institution of law was central to such aims. She compiles her case from seven legal vignettes, starting with the Hudson's Bay Company's system of paternalism and 'club law' in the Cordillera and ending with a stimulating sketch of how liberal discourse mediated colonial identity and Native-white relations. But the bulk of the book is about the gold rushes of the late 1850s and 1860s, and Loo develops a bold argument about law and individualism.

When the Hudson's Bay Company became the colonial proprietors of Vancouver Island in 1849, she argues, it abided by its monopolistic fur trade practices, filling state offices from its own ranks, selling land and provisions at a prohibitively high price, and taking the best land itself, thereby inciting protest. She views colonists's petitions to the British government as yearnings for an unfettered socio-economic order and argues that this liberal sentiment matured during the gold rushes, when both miners and the colonial government identified the need for law and order, especially standardized rules of exchange and the protection of individual rights. Loo accepts the popular image of the gold fields as harsh, isolated places, where a pidgin of competition and calamity was spoken, rather than a language of community and tradition, but she challenges the impression which usually accompanies this image, that rampant individualism spilled over into lawlessness. Her data suggest that miners used the courts rather than guns to settle their differences; judges tried far more cases of breach of contract than charges of theft or bodily harm.

Loo probes this desire for the rule of law with some fascinating legal case material. She argues that law was more than a government tool for regulating British Columbia's extemporaneous, geographically fractured market economy. Miners and settlers "took an active and ever-watchful interest" (89) in the administration of law and debated its meaning with judges, arguing over the importance of different kinds of evidence and pitting the validity of improvised gold rush ways against textbook rules. Law was a powerful medium of social identification and the courts became primary symbols of a capitalist-liberal order modeled on the aspirations of the individual. The "colony's great distances and the localism it spawned were overcome by investing in courts," Loo explains; yet judges "could not be deaf to local voices"

and miners viewed law "as an outgrowth of human nature — the natural outcome of the pursuit of self-interest" (57, 130, 75).

This book is a sweeping, tantalizing, conceptually sophisticated reinterpretation of the colonial period and should create great debate within British Columbia. Liberalism was a basic feature of Victorian imperialism, yet Loo is virtually the first historian to discuss its purchase in colonial British Columbia in any depth. She is interested in questions of hegemony (the term under which ideological frameworks of collective action and belief are fashioned) and challenges the assumption, implicit in much writing on British Columbia, that law and state formation are simply about domination. If she is right, economy, society, law and the colonial state were entangled in a productive four-way relationship. Aspects of British law were recast in British Columbian mould and law "created meaning by shaping the way people saw the world and acted in it" (124). The moral of her story is that while many injustices have been perpetrated under the banner of law, "the reproduction of relations of domination is not straightforward because the power of the law is not totalizing" (162). For Loo (and for me), power is relational, not a unitary force that is simply possessed by some people and imposed on others through law or by other means.

Loo writes seductively about law and liberalism, and makes ingenious use of a hitherto neglected archival source. But is she right about British Columbia? I have two main reservations about her thesis.

First, I am not convinced that she has sufficient evidence to ground her claim that miners and settlers strove to turn themselves into a society of rational, liberal-minded individualists. There are some marvellous images in this book — of Judge Begbie transporting the hefty trappings of the colonial state (legal tomes and court robes) over the Cascade mountains, and of miners packing frontier courtrooms, adding theatre to due process. Yet this book leaves me a little cold, with an analytical grasp of colonial litigation, but without much sense of a social life in the gold fields or of the dramas and emotions that people took to court. Loo works through lawyers's, judges's and newspaper editors's accounts, but we hear relatively little from miners and settlers themselves. She quotes from only a small selection of their journals, reminiscences and correspondence. Other scholars, who have worked assiduously with such sources, have depicted a more violent, ethnically divided, definitively masculine and expedient world than Loo sees.

Loo acknowledges that mining camps were often composed of people from the same country or county, but she insists that social

relationships were fleeting and underpinned by economic self-interest. This argument is surely too simple. The gold fields did not encourage the recomposition of kin and community, but ethnicity remained an important medium of identity and estrangement. I doubt that American, British , Canadian, Chinese and European immigrants all understood British law in the same way, or that economic self-interest governed social life entirely. Loo rarely takes us out of the courtroom and I am apprehensive about the way she imputes a collective liberal psychology from her legal data. Court ledgers obviously convey images of anonymity and individualism because they recount names, not faces and accents. And court proceedings were rationalizations of social experience. How were civil suites hatched, and court debates retold, around camp fires or in saloons? Law probably did play a more central place in the making of British Columbia than we have realized, but law is not a transparent window onto social identities. Loo does not say whether her legal data can be broken down along ethnic lines, but an analysis of the ethnic dynamics of the gold fields, and of how many miners settled in British Columbia, would be revealing. I am thus uneasy about Loo's thesis because it is not elaborated from enough vantage points.

And second, there are some remarkable silences in this book. Principally, Loo only barely acknowledges the overlaps between liberalism, racism, and colonialism. The position of Native people in the liberal equation is not addressed until the last chapter, where she suggests that adherence to liberal principles destabilized the racist distinction between a civilized, colonial self and a savage, Indian other. The rule of law was a mark of British civility and superiority over the Indian, but it also required British Columbians to treat everyone as equal before the law, thus threatening the standards of difference on which colonial identity was built. The western liberal tradition still struggles with this tension between the recognition and disavowal of difference — between localism and universalism — and Loo concludes by noting that Native groups now engaged in land claim trials and negotiations are appealing to the egalitarian promise of liberalism, arguing over the universality of rights and shunning claims to special status.

This leap into the present is emblematic of the one-sidedness of her account of liberalism. Why have Native peoples been in the courts? Because there never has been equality before the law in British Columbia. British law has been instrumental in the dispossession and subjugation of Native people, and the pursuit of self-interest was far

more brutal than Loo lets on. Miners dislodged Native groups and the colonial government protected settlers's claims to Native land. If a liberal-legal culture emerged in British Columbia, we must acknowledge that it denied Native people any proprietary interest in land and produced a reserve system. Loo says hardly anything about land policy, Indian policy, or the Native-white contact process. She is interested in capital and labour, competition and the market, not in property relations, which is surprising, since the right to private property is a basic tenet of liberal philosophy.

But it is not just these silences, or Loo's handling of the court record, that makes this book so tantalizing. Underlying her interest in British Columbia is a reasoned belief in the power and legitimacy of the liberal tradition. There is an idealistic, almost ghostly, ring to her thesis. She draws us into the utilitarian world of the individual and the market — a world that British Columbians are still trying to further and protect. I look at the British Columbian past and present and see social spaces washed with relations of domination — spaces girded by a legal-colonial calculus of power.

Loo has prepare some of the basic conceptual groundwork for a much-needed analysis of the articulation of liberalism and colonialism in British Columbia. Debate about this book should cut an important trail in that direction.

*University of St. Andrews, Scotland* DANIEL CLAYTON

*The Klondike Stampede*, by Tappan Adney, with a new introduction by Ken Coates. Vancouver: UBC Press, 1994. xxii, 470 pp. Illus. $19.95 paper.

In July, 1897, a young journalist named Tappan Adney was commissioned by *Harper's Weekly* "to proceed to Dawson to furnish news and pictures of the new (Klondike) gold-fields" (p.9). The first Alaska steamships bringing reports of sensational gold strikes had docked in Seattle and San Francisco a month earlier and, with the help of major newspaper chains, the news spread like wildfire throughout depression-torn North America and Europe. Armed with two cameras, many roles of film in sealed tins, and a keen reporter's eye, Adney caught a northerly bound steamer from San Francisco on August 9th. During the next ninety-two days, he interviewed the men he met and

observed their behaviour as participants in a massive human movement over appallingly difficult terrain and down the Yukon River corridor to Dawson City.

Merely reaching Dawson City ahead of freeze-up was an achievement taking ninety-two days. In the absence of any reliable information, travellers based their decisions on rumour — of impossibly high prices, dangerous rapids, encroaching ice, devastating famine: "No two stories agreed save that all told of trouble and hardship past comprehension," he wrote as he tried to sort fiction from fact.

Adney had his own problems. His photographic chemicals were crushed in storage during the boat passage; his journal and camera caught fire in a freak accident in Skagway; his film was destroyed when it was submerged by an unusually high tide at Skagway — all before he even reached the Yukon. He reports these disasters and his own solutions with relentless enthusiasm.

His account of the trip over the White and Chilkoot Passes is chilling for those of us who climb its relatively groomed trail now as a weekend outing — the men who came were often unprepared and they and their horses suffered terribly. Adney's own skills are reported casually: the boat he built with companions was far superior to most of the others on the river and his trip to Dawson records the numbers of boats he overtook. Retrospectively, it is interesting to know that in later years he turned his attentions to a study of subarctic canoe types and became and authority on the subject.

He arrived in Dawson on October 2nd, and from then until he left the following year on September 16th he described the physical and social fabric of the town — governmental institutions, varieties of gold-mining, miner's disputes, winter construction projects, spring floods, midsummer nights, and the first influx of world news after a winter of isolation. His book is alive with people, and if his characterizations are sometimes stereotypic they are part of a genre familiar on the frontier. In a piece he published separately in 1901, his accounts of indigenous people are more flattering. After spending part of a winter with Han speaking people from around Dawson, he described how impressed he was with their technology and land use strategies.

Of hundreds of gold rush accounts, his stands out as one of the best and it remains engaging a century later. It was originally published in 1900 and reprinted in 1968, but it has never had the audience it deserves. Ken Coates and UBC Press are to be congratulated for making it available to us in this paperback version. It contains more than eighty photos and at least twenty drawings by the author,

supplemented with additional photos by other photographers. With the approach of the centenary of the Klondike gold rush, this book deserves to be widely read.

*University of British Columbia* JULIE CRUIKSHANK

*Roaring Days: Rossland's Mines and the History of British Columbia*, by Jeremy Mouat. Vancouver: UBC Press, 1995. xvii, 236 pp. Maps, photos. $39.95 cloth.

The title notwithstanding, there wasn't much roaring in Rossland even in its glory days at the turn of the century. Grumble rather than roar seems to be a more apt metaphor for what goes on between these covers. For the subject is constraint not disorder, the coming to terms with the rules, disappointments and muted pleasures of a conventional social order rather than any orgasmic casting off of its strictures. Indeed, there is something about both the analysis that makes Rossland seem surprisingly structured and disciplined, not just by those usual Canadian suspects — law and order — but also by inner self-imposed codes that effectively marked boundaries on mental maps and governed behaviour — notions of race, manliness and womanliness, and presumably childhood, concepts of property, the corporation, capitalism and the nation. The neat line of storefronts marching down the wide mainstreet; the rigidly posed photographs of workers or celebrants; in their own way these artifacts also show a town lined up, organized, settled. Rossland did not burst into life in some ludic canivalesque eruption of alternative communitarianism; rather it slipped quietly into the harness of toil, domesticity, ascribed places in a social and economic hierarchy and differentiated citizenship, and that is what this book is about.

The pleasure in reading *Roaring Days* comes not from its striking thesis, synthetic power or its intellectual architecture, but rather from its details. This is a book for the connoisseur of the footnote. The topical chapters are models of spare, stripped down monographic discipline. Exploration, transportation, company promotion, industrial relations, labour organization, social structure, corporate consolidation, and stagnation are briskly and succinctly addressed. The footnotes, by contrast, present a riot of information gathered up in Mouat's wide-ranging research expedition. In the fine print in the

back pages thoughts stray to and linger on such things as the sociology and technology of gold rushes, the symbolism of postage stamps, company promoters in fiction, the letters of labour spies, fist-fights at a businessmen's banquet, the early career of Mackenzie King and his rival Roger Clute, transvestite miners, the technology of concentrating refractory ores, "guinea pigs" (titled company directors), and the Diggin's Orgy.

However the front of the book is as orderly, well behaved, and right thinking as church — a topic not much discussed. Rossland seems not so much a place with people in it (such as Anthony Wallace's Rockdale) as it is a professional historian's switchboard where connections can be made. Mouat's eye falls upon a subject — gender roles or class formation, for example — and promptly lines are drawn out from Rossland to an international literature on the selected subject. In the end Rossland is not much more than a collection of such scholarly filaments. People pass through making observations — from labour mediators to chorus girls. The census and the newspapers are duly mined. And everything gets neatly piled and fenced in with footnote pickets. The the place itself and the people in it — with the possible exception of of the stage priest, Father Pat — remain elusive.

In fact the focus on Rossland becomes blurred in other ways. At times Rossland refers to a specific place; at other times to a phenomenon; Rossland becomes a metaphor for the pattern of economic and social development in the Kootenays. Time shifts as well; sometimes it stands still in 1897-1902; at other points time is free to drift forward and backward from the 1850's to the 1920's. Worker's organizations and the sometimes baroque political and ideological disputes that convulsed them snap sharply into focus; the work, homelife and social intercourse of miners and other citizens of Rossland are shadows in the background. Precision and impressionism cohabit without being fully reconciled.

With a few minor adjustments on the margins Rossland could be anywhere in non-metropolitan British Columbia — that seems to be Mouat's point. Rossland's relationship to British Columbia history is that of a miniature replica to the whole. And the footnotes seem to be saying that it was much like other places. Western exceptionalism takes another hit. After a pleasant summer's read of Mouat's book one wonders whether Rossland roared more loudly then under the rule of respectable working class and bourgeois propriety or now under the tourist's giddy gaze?

*York University* H. V. NELLES

*A Heart at Leisure from Itself: Caroline Macdonald of Japan*, by Margaret Prang. Vancouver: UBC Press, 1995. xv, 346 pp. $39.95 cloth.

Caroline Macdonald was a Canadian missionary in Japan from 1904 till 1931, bringing the Presbyterian Word to a Buddhist, Shintoist country where missionaries were discovering with dismay that a sense of sin was singularly lacking and the idea of redemption held little appeal. Yet they also knew that the Christianizing of Asia would best make progress from a strong base in Japan. As one American strategist put it, "the key to China is in Tokyo." Caroline Macdonald was part of this crusade, working through the YWCA to create a Christian milieu through which the individual could be brought to Christ. "It means," she said, "the gradual substitution of a new background, a new outlook, a deeper conception of . . . reality." She was a warm and friendly person; her heart went out to people and they responded.

Brought up in southern Ontario in the social gospel tradition, she herself soon acquired a deeper conception of social and economic realities. The Kingdom of God, she came to believe, could not be achieved in Japan or anywhere else unless society in general were transformed to deal with underlying social problems. She became a much-loved prison visitor and was influential in the reform of Japanese prisons. She supported the new labour movement, set up labour schools for women factory workers, made union organizing a plank in her Christian platform. After the great earthquake of 1924, she helped restore and rebuild. She identified with the Japanese people, learned their language, made their problems her own, and gave bold and imaginative leadership. The Japanese government in 1924 recognized her contribution in educational and social work when the emperor bestowed on her the Sixth Order of Merit of the Order of the Sacred Treasure. Caroline Macdonald was no ordinary missionary.

And no ordinary woman. She was "ambiguous," as Margaret Prang explains in her preface to this richly-textured biography. The reference is to a line of thought opened up by linguistic theorist Deborah Cameron and pursued by Carolyn Heilbrun in *Writing a Woman's Life*. The "unambiguous woman" complies with the social norm, making partnership with a man the preeminent goal, deferring to male authority and adopting the kinds of behaviour that authority prescribes: modesty, reticence, submissiveness — seemly decorums that Mary Wollstonecraft was rebelling against two centuries ago.

"Occasionally," writes Carolyn Heilbrun, "women have put God or Christ in the place of a man; the results are the same: one's own

desires and quests are always secondary." This was not true of Caroline Macdonald, even though for her God was the very source of being and His will the ultimate authority and guide. For from a secular point of view, she was simply an unusually confident and assertive woman, favoured by family and education to make her voice heard. To have that capacity, as Heilbrun explains, to be able to declare oneself and become one of the actors in the world of human endeavour is to have power, and Caroline Macdonald exercised power easily, something the "unambiguous woman," deferential and obedient, dares not aspire to.

When her settlement house in Tokyo was under police surveillance because it was a meeting place for striking brewery workers, she laid down the rules for the strikers and also reached an agreement with the police to avoid trouble. The strike lasted for fifty-three days, but she reported that she was confident there would be no violence, for she could "manage them" [the strikers]. She had them "in the hollow of [her] hand from the beginning" and, moreover, had given the detectives "instructive discourses." After the strike, she had tea with the police and chatted with them, surprised but gratified that they credited her with its peaceful outcome. Of her involvement with the labour movement she concluded that " . . . up to date I have all the lines in my hand. I labor under no delusions as to the seriousness of the tasks we are tackling, but I seem to have the confidence of people who might not themselves be willing to tackle the same things." She could tackle things because of her strong Christian faith which made no separation between religion and social duty. God was therefore no hindrance to an ambiguous woman with the zest and talent for a free and independent life. Although Caroline Macdonald was never a radical feminist, she educated Japanese women to reject their traditional role as obedient, passive servants to men and to become individuals in their own right.

Margaret Prang does not intercede between the reader and her subject: she presents as valid Caroline Macdonald's strongly held religious convictions. In these more secular times of heightened awareness about cultural imperialism, readers may be unwilling to credit the ardour of a faith that moved its adherents to embark on the grandiose task of Christianizing the whole world. In her preface Margaret Prang prepares the reader against this response, and by her respect for her subject and impressive scholarship soon engages our sympathy. Caroline Macdonald emerges not as a biographical curiosity but as an admirable and likeable person whose life deserves to be known and remembered.

At the end of her career, Caroline Macdonald acknowledged in all humility that missionaries had no "special responsibility" in a foreign land and that indeed their well-meant endeavour could be perceived as "a most preposterous act." But when is proselytizing of any kind not preposterous? Is it any more acceptable for one people to urge on another a "new outlook" on human rights, for example? This biography stirs such uneasy reflections, making the life of Caroline Macdonald of Japan extraordinarily relevant for a Canada increasingly preoccupied with questions of belief and moral imperatives.

*Vancouver* IRENE HOWARD