

Book Reviews

Wisdom of the Elders: Native Traditions of the Northwest Coast, by Ruth Kirk. Vancouver and Toronto: Douglas & McIntyre, 1986.

My comments on *Wisdom of the Elders* are based on my experiences among our people, the Kwakwaka'wakw, over a number of years. Since 1979, as curator of the U'mista Cultural Centre, I have been actively involved in cultural programmes, including language and oral history, primarily with our old people. I know much less about the Nuuchahnulth and Nuxalk and would be very interested in hearing the response of members of these groups to Ruth Kirk's work.

I object strongly to the use of the term "Southern Kwakiutl" in describing the people in our cultural area. It is not a modern term for us, as Kirk claims; rather it is very much a part of the series, *Our Native Peoples*, which Yorke Edwards, in his foreword, states had become dated by the 1970s. The U'mista Cultural Society does not "propose" the name Kwakwaka'wakw, as Kirk suggests — we use the name, as part of our efforts to educate the world that Kwagu'ł refers only to the people who live at Fort Rupert. Bill Holm, author of *Smoky Top: The Art and Times of Willie Seaweed*, is among the recognized Northwest Coast experts who use our term for ourselves. If Kirk readily accepts Nuuchahnulth and Nuxalk as our neighbours' terms for themselves, why persist in using an anthropological term for us, who are the Kwakwaka'wakw?

Both Yorke Edwards and Ruth Kirk explain that the reason for focusing on three particular groups is based on their similarities. As the same similarities are shared by all the other Northwest Coast peoples, this does not seem adequate justification for the selection made.

I have a little trouble with the title of Kirk's book. In our language, the word for "old people" is a perfectly respectable one, and we use it to refer to those on whom we depend to teach and support us in our various activities. There is no comparable word in Kwakwala for the English "elders," yet the latter term seems to be part of the modern usage which

also inaccurately describes our traditional big houses as “long houses.” In her preface, Kirk acknowledges the help of a number of “Southern Kwakiutl” people who, given the title of her book, might be assumed to be “elders.” Of the ten named, only four qualify as old people, according to age; the rest are younger than I am.

While it may not be necessary to consult any person who is quoted from taped interviews held by the Provincial Archives of British Columbia, one would expect that common courtesy would prevail. An example is a quotation from an interview with Agnes Cranmer, who was not consulted by Kirk.

There are a number of generalizations in *Wisdom of the Elders* which are unacceptable. Mortuary poles were not known among our people and, as far as I know, were used only among northern tribes such as the Haida. Kirk gives the impression that this burial practice was common on the Northwest Coast. She refers to the origin myth of my father’s people, the ʼNamgis, as if others shared this beginning. The fact is that all of our separate groups have their own myths to explain who they are. Nor is it correct to imply that all coastal people believe that Raven released the Sun, as Kirk states. Again, this legend belongs to some, but not all.

In using the Nuu-chah-nulth term for white people, Kirk gives the impression that all coastal groups shared this term. Our word, mamaʼa, comes from the Nuu-chah-nulth name, muh-muʼ-ni. However, people north and south of us have different terms, such as the Hiłdzakw word, kumsiwa, which has been anglicized in the name Cumshewa Inlet.

There are basic errors, such as the name of the man whose photograph appears on page 101. It is Coon, not Koon. Incidentally, herring roe is gathered either on kelp or hemlock boughs, not on seaweed, as stated in the caption and again on page 119. Mungo Martin died in 1962, not in 1965, as Kirk has it on page 29. In describing a potlatch in Alert Bay, Kirk says, “Inside, bleachers or folding chairs accommodate a few hundred people, or a thousand or more, depending on the occasion and location.” In fact, the maximum seating capacity of our big house is about 650, although we have enlarged the building since its original construction in 1963. Among the many questions that I was left with after reading *Wisdom of the Elders* was: Did Ruth Kirk ever attend a potlatch in Alert Bay’s big house?

A couple of Kirk’s own statements about her book sum up my reaction to it. She says, “. . . there is enormous audacity in an outsider attempting to summarize anyone’s cultural history” and “Culture comes from human

convictions and experience; it fits only partially onto paper." Perhaps if Kirk's audacity had not been so enormous, the result might not have fit so partially onto paper.

U'mista Cultural Centre

GLORIA CRANMER WEBSTER

Robes of Power: Totem Poles on Cloth, by Doreen Jensen and Polly Sargent. Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press, in association with the UBC Museum of Anthropology. Museum Note no. 17. 86 pp., 49 figs., 25 colour pls. 1986.

Robes of Power is the first book about the button blanket. In fact, it is probably the first publication devoted exclusively to this distinctive form of native art. For too long the white world has expressed an archaic bias in its passion for Northwest Coast Indian art. Because they are constructed of trade materials — flannel and buttons — these ceremonial robes have gone largely undocumented and uncollected. But unlike Haida argillite, another of the region's "arts of acculturation," they are created for native use. Though their precise history is still poorly understood, button blankets were a creative and imaginative adaptation of exotic materials to traditional ceremonial practices, supplementing and eventually supplanting earlier robe forms of bark, fur, hide, and twined fibres. *Robes of Power* is thus of interest for its attention to history and change, a new focus in the scholarship of Northwest Coast native art, and it goes far in its revision of persisting scholarly biases. Moreover, it is powerful and exciting testimony to the lively union of tradition and innovation among contemporary Northwest Coast peoples.

Essentially an exhibition catalogue, *Robes of Power* was produced in association with a display which originally opened in Australia and was later (March 1986) installed at the University of British Columbia's Museum of Anthropology. Both authors are associated with the 'Ksan cultural centre at Hazelton, B.C. Doreen Jensen, the Gitksan artist, appears to have been the senior author, assisted by Polly Sargent, listed as a "senior researcher for the Book Builders of 'Ksan," and one of the centre's founders. The volume is divided into three main sections (which the authors liken to the structure of a potlatch): "Requests," laying out the defining terms of the project; "Responses," comprising commentary from the blanket makers and historical statements from tribal elders; and "Results," a final summary review. Also included are seven brief essays

exploring selected aspects of the art-form. The volume is rounded out by a foreword from Michael Ames, director of the UBC Museum, a preface by George MacDonald, director of the Canadian Museum of Civilization, and a bibliography. The small book is an addition to the Museum's recently revitalized and expanded series of Museum Notes, and, like others in the series, is beautifully designed and produced.

This is a thoroughly native product — from the original creation of the blankets to the research to the writing. Native meanings and viewpoints are embodied directly in the oral history of the blanket makers and tribal elders. Such presentations of native culture by natives to whites are one of the most important trends of the recent scholarship (and Indian-white relations, more generally), on the Northwest Coast as well as the rest of the continent. This polyphonic or multi-vocal text happens to be a perfect embodiment of a new kind of ethnographic writing. Relatively absent is a single authoritative voice; instead each native expert offers his or her own viewpoint. While their statements often clash (noted in the final section of "Results"), these are less contradictions than alternate statements reflecting differing places, languages, customs, and histories.

Following a sentiment expressed by several natives, the authors avoid the term "button blanket," which they feel connotes domestic use or the plain material, in favour of "robe," stressing the object's ceremonial functions. *Robes of Power* vividly demonstrates the Northwest Coast cultural concept of crests — the association of the name, an ancestral story, and a material manifestation in a range of objects (house fronts, rattles, blankets), which is illustrated especially effectively by the Tsimshian example used for the cover, endpaper, and preface. The book also reveals differing relations to crest display. Some feel that these robes should be only exhibited at ceremonial occasions, while others allow them to be seen at educational displays and entertainments for white audiences.

The twenty blankets illustrated and discussed here were not collected from natives, but were commissioned especially for the exhibition, and nearly all were created in 1985. The designers represent a wide range of tribes: two Tahltan/Tlingit, five Tsimshian (one Nishga, three Gitksan, one Tsimshian), five Haida, one Heiltsuk (Bella Bella), five Kwagiutl, and two Westcoast (Nootka). Unlike the Chilkat blanket and more like the cedar bark blanket, the button blanket was not restricted to any one part of the Coast (though it is still an open historical question whether the form was independently invented or spread from one particular time and place). However, because of the authors' personal involvement there does seem to be a slight Gitksan bias in the discursive essays.

By custom, button blankets are the product of joint male and female work. As with the earlier Chilkat blanket form, traditionally the men created the design, which the women then reproduced in cloth. Both designers and fabricators offer their statements, emphasizing the collaborative nature of this form of art. As this book shows, there has been a recent blurring of these lines as some women have taken to designing their own blankets. The book also gives evidence of a mixture of races and cultures, including several blankets sewn by white women in partnership with native male artists.

The only criticism which can be levelled against the volume is relatively minor. Despite the fact that the authors refer to extensive research with scholars and museum collections, little of this has made its way into the final product. There is still a need for a thorough report on this kind of documentary and historical research. Ron Hamilton's essay, though brief, offers a persuasive model for future work. "Button Blankets on the West Coast?" is one of the best contributions, combining oral history, archaeology, photography, texts, and museum collections.

Robes of Power is an especially important book. It is the first word on the subject, not the last. Aware of this, the authors ask one final question: "who will take over where *Robes of Power* leaves off?"

Brooklyn Museum, Brooklyn, N.Y.

IRA JACKNIS

West of the Great Divide: An Illustrated History of the Canadian Pacific Railway in British Columbia 1880-1986, by Robert D. Turner. Victoria: Sono Nis Press, 1987. Pp. xii, 336. \$34.95.

At first glance this handsome volume appears to be of interest mainly to railway buffs. With the aid of more than 400 illustrations, maps, timetables, and reproductions, it provides a vivid account of the history of CPR rail operations in British Columbia from 1880 to the present. However, the general reader will find the text of this book well worth reading since it provides much valuable information on the railway which had such a profound impact on the history of British Columbia.

The author devotes his attention to the CPR's rail operations in B.C., for he has previously published illustrated histories of the company's maritime operations in the province.

Chapter 1 deals with the construction of the main line and the improvements and extensions to it in the 1890s. Turner emphasizes the importance

of the construction of the line from Port Moody to Vancouver by describing the 1887 arrival ceremony for the first train in Vancouver in which the city's mayor lauded the CPR and predicted a bright future for his city, while the CPR general superintendent responded that the company and the city would prosper together. The CPR did indeed play *the* major role in establishing the city and fostering its growth into the province's metropolis by 1901, as Robert McDonald and Norbert MacDonald have demonstrated. Contemporary photographs furnish a graphic picture of the difficulties of keeping the main line open in the winter because of heavy snowfalls in the Selkirks. The building of snowsheds to counter these problems is well known, but the development of rotary snow ploughs by the Leslie brothers in Ontario is not often mentioned. First introduced in the winter of 1888-89, they were so successful in clearing the line that they were used extensively thereafter, thus making "a significant contribution to keeping the CPR open on a reliable all year basis." (p. 39)

Chapter 2 deals with a number of developments in the 1900 to 1914 period. In this period, the CPR acquired the Esquimalt and Nanaimo Railway and extended it north along the east coast of Vancouver Island. It also greatly improved operating efficiency on the main line by reducing the steep grades at Field Hill, through construction of the Spiral Tunnels, and at Rogers Pass, by building the five-mile-long Connaught Tunnel. Facilities in Vancouver were much improved by the building of a new CPR station and new major freight yards (located just east of the city at Coquitlam).

Chapter 3 has a good account of the bitter rivalry between the CPR and J. J. Hill's Great Northern for control of the traffic of southern B.C. in the period 1898 to 1916. Photographs and several fine maps augment an excellent discussion of the building of the Kettle Valley Railway from Midway to Hope. Turner's conclusion that by 1916 "the CPR had won *de facto* control of the Coast to Kootenay rail traffic" (p. 147) is open to debate. Sanford's study of the Kettle Valley Railway shows that from 1915 on the Great Northern still competed with the CPR for this traffic.

Chapter 4 provides a thorough discussion of the modern steam era from 1920 to 1950. In 1931 the Crowsnest line was finally completed with the construction of trackage over the thirty-four mile section from Kootenay Landing to Procter, a segment which the CPR had judged too expensive to build in 1898. In the late 1940s the Esquimalt and Nanaimo was the first division of the CPR to be dieselized; it served as a testing area for the new generation of diesel locomotives.

The last chapter deals with the dieselization of the CPR, which trans-

formed the B.C. section into one of "the most modern railroad systems in North America." (p. 252) For example, the introduction of the more powerful diesel locomotives on the Calgary to Revelstoke section of the main line enabled the CPR to eliminate the frequent and expensive helper operations.

History deals with the ideas and actions of people. For a historian it is disconcerting to read an "illustrated history" which has few pictures of the people who built and ran the CPR in B.C. There is a photograph of Andrew Onderdonk, but why are there no pictures of equally important figures such as Henry Abbott and Andrew McCulloch?

One hopes that Turner will produce another volume on the history of Canadian National Railways, the British Columbia Railway and their predecessors in the province.

University of Alberta

JOHN A. EAGLE

The Asian Dream: The Pacific Rim and Canada's National Railway, by Donald MacKay. Vancouver: Douglas & McIntyre, 1986. Pp. 223; illus.

On first glance this volume seems to have been designed to serve as a gift for Canadian National Railway agents to present to prospective customers in order to demonstrate the company's long-standing interest in Asian trade. It has generous margins, a handsome assortment of photographs, illustrations, and useful maps, and even a separate ISBN for a presentation edition. Yet the book is much more than a coffee table adornment. The footnotes indicate that Donald MacKay, who is best known to British Columbia readers as the author of *Empire of Wood*, the Macmillan Bloedel story, has done considerable research in contemporary newspapers and books, in prime ministerial and departmental records in the Public Archives of Canada and, especially, in the Canadian National Railways Archives themselves. His select bibliography indicates he has perused most of the obvious secondary sources.

In a broad chronological framework MacKay tells "the story of Canadian National Railways, heir to two pioneer railways that pushed their way through northwestern Canada to the Pacific . . . [and] of the people whose vision enabled the lines to span the continent and of those who later extended the resulting commerce to the Asian Pacific." (p. 7) Despite flashbacks to the travels of Marco Polo and the voyages of Jacques Cartier and James Cook, MacKay really starts his tale with the completion of

Canada's first railway, the Champlain and Saint Lawrence in 1836, and then presents a very traditional account of the problems of the Grand Trunk Railway of Canada, the success of the Canadian Pacific Railway in completing the first transcontinental line and developing trans-Pacific shipping services, and the decision of the Laurier government to assist the Grand Trunk in building Canada's second transcontinental railway.

MacKay is ostensibly writing about both major predecessors of the Canadian National Railways, but he gives short shrift to Mackenzie and Mann and their Canadian Northern enterprises. Although the Canadian Northern's great strength was, as MacKay properly notes, its prairie branch lines, Mackenzie and Mann wanted to have their own ships on the Pacific. MacKay, however, focuses on the construction of the Grand Trunk Pacific line to Prince Rupert. His account is somewhat wanting. He fails to appreciate fully the irony of British Columbians' desire for Asian trade and their antipathy to Asian immigrants, and he ignores the Grand Trunk Pacific's employment practices which made it difficult to secure or retain white labour. He does mention the grandiose plans Francis Rattenbury prepared for a terminal and hotel complex in Prince Rupert but curiously does not provide an illustration of this most vivid example of the Grand Trunk's dreams of a prosperous Asian trade.

While the first half of the book merely reworks well-known material, the third quarter draws heavily on the archives of the Canadian National Railways and the recollections of its employees to document more obscure subjects such as the rise and demise of the Canadian Merchant Marine, the opening of Canadian National offices in Shanghai, Singapore and Yokohama in the 1920s, Canadian National's efforts to compete in the silk trade, the wartime experiences of its agents in Asia, and the difficulties of re-establishing Asian trade in the immediate postwar years. The last quarter deals with the expansion of trans-Pacific trade since the 1960s which, in a sense, has seen the fulfilment of the Grand Trunk Pacific's dreams of trans-Pacific trade and the development of the port of Prince Rupert. Nevertheless, MacKay realistically concludes that "the dream of Far East trade has waxed and waned like Prince Rupert's rainbows." (p. 197) In sum, this book offers a refreshing approach by stressing that Vancouver is not the only provincial port and undoubtedly pleased the Canadian National Railways, which commissioned the work, by demonstrating that, contrary to conventional wisdom, the Canadian Pacific Railway never had a monopoly on Canadian interest in Asian trade.

Emily Carr, by Ruth Gowers. Leamington Spa: Berg Publishers Limited, 1987. Pp. 129; illus.

Free-lance Oxford writer Ruth Gowers has written *Emily Carr* to introduce British Columbia's most celebrated artist to the British public. It begins with a quotation from *Manchester Guardian* art critic Eric Newton, who called Carr a genius some fifty years ago, then continues introducing the uninitiated reader to the west coast of British Columbia somewhat in the manner of a travel writer: "A visitor to Victoria today would find . . ." Given the recent scholarship on Emily Carr, Gowers has been able to tell the story of her subject's life with few errors. But in so doing she gives us nothing more than a factual account which follows Carr to native Indian villages along the west coast, to schools in San Francisco, London, and Paris, and from Victoria to Vancouver — where she had a studio and taught art from 1906 to 1910 — and back again. There is in all of this no attempt to discuss Carr's paintings. For example, three pivotal works, *Grey, Tree*, and *The Little Pine* are lumped together in one sentence which tells us that they "all date from the early 1930s." There is more discussion devoted to Carr's writing, but it makes no attempt at literary analysis.

Given such limitations, one wonders what the average British reader will gain from such a book. Certainly the five poorly reproduced black and white illustrations of Carr's paintings will hardly induce the reader to look for more art work. Nor will the short synopses of her books, which are confined to content descriptions, prompt one to seek out her autobiographical writings. Indeed, reading *Emily Carr* was for this reviewer a bit like reading a first year university end-of-term paper in which major secondary works — for example Doris Shadbolt's superb *The Art of Emily Carr* (Vancouver 1979) — have not been consulted; in which photographs and paintings are illustrated with no indication as to their location; in which phrases, concepts, and quotations have been lifted from other secondary sources as well as from Carr's own writings without being properly annotated; and, finally, in which no attempt has been made to break the monotony of the chronological narrative by emphasizing or assessing events, or by analyzing the artistic and literary works at hand.

It is a pity that Emily Carr is being introduced to the British public in this unimaginative fashion. She certainly deserves better. So do the audience for whom this volume is intended.

Mayor Gerry: The Remarkable Gerald Grattan McGeer, by David Ricardo Williams. Vancouver: Douglas & McIntyre, 1986. Pp. 319; illus.

A major history of Vancouver noted that “except for a few contemporary magazine and newspaper articles there are, for example, no biographical studies of such colourful mayors as L. D. Taylor or G. G. McGeer. . . .”¹ In a similar vein, a recent review of Canadian urban studies noted that in terms of urban politics and governance, the task of specifying what is unique and what is commonplace about Canadian politics at the municipal level has just begun.² For these reasons — and because of McGeer’s national and international prominence — this biography is a welcome addition to Canadiana. Unfortunately, this volume has many flaws; while it is a “good read,” it does not advance our conceptual knowledge of Canadian public affairs — and especially urban politics — to the extent that might have been reasonably expected.

There is no doubt that “The Remarkable Gerald Grattan McGeer” was an important Canadian public figure. Born in Winnipeg in 1888, McGeer’s family moved to British Columbia in 1890 and “Gerry” was to spend the rest of his life on the west coast. Called to the bar in 1915, McGeer served two terms in the B.C. Legislature (1916-1920, 1933-1934), ten years as a Member of Parliament (1935-1945), and two years as a Senator (1945-1947). The flamboyant politician was best known, however, for his two terms as mayor of Vancouver, serving in 1935-1936, and elected again in 1947, only to die in office. In between — and often during — his service as a politician, McGeer practised as a lawyer and, among other achievements, triumphed as B.C. government counsel during the historic freight rate cases of the 1920s. And, interestingly, he corresponded regularly with Mackenzie King. In short, his was a “remarkable” career.

Williams’ *Mayor Gerry* provides a full and fascinating account of the life of this erratic and paradoxical figure. In the process, the author has uncovered a good deal of new material culled from a variety of primary sources — personal papers, diaries, correspondence, and documents. Students of Vancouver, British Columbia, and Canada itself will find something of use in this well-written volume.

¹ Patricia E. Roy, *Vancouver: An Illustrated History*, The History of Canadian Cities Series (Toronto: James Lorimer and National Museum of Man, 1980), 184.

² Alan F. J. Artibise and Paul-André Linteau, *The Evolution of Urban Canada: An Analysis of Approaches and Interpretations* (Winnipeg: Institute of Urban Studies, 1984), 28.

For all its strengths, however, this biography fails to advance our interpretative knowledge of Canadian public life beyond the personality stage; an aspect of this study that is especially frustrating in terms of Vancouver municipal politics. To be sure, we learn much about McGeer and his day-to-day activities as mayor during a critical period in Vancouver's history. But Williams rarely goes beyond the "life" of McGeer to recount and analyze the "times" in which "Mayor Gerry" lived. Thus, for example, we learn virtually nothing about such critical issues as the decline of municipal autonomy in the 1920s and 1930s, a theme that deserves substantial attention in the career of a politician that served at all three levels of government. It is notable that this theme has been addressed at the national level by John Taylor and others;³ what would have been most welcome here was a "fleshing out" of this national theme at the level of a particular — and particularly important — city. Williams, in short, has missed an opportunity to test several hypotheses regarding patterns of municipal politics and the federal-provincial-municipal relationship. Similarly, Williams virtually ignores the rich and rapidly growing secondary literature on Vancouver itself, content to allow the McGeer personality full sway in determining themes, issues, and questions. This approach to biography has, perhaps, its place. But readers who wish to utilize this study as a means of understanding broader issues will be disappointed, at least in the case of urban studies. In terms of other themes — and there are many — the same, I suspect, is true.

In general, then, *Mayor Gerry* is both a success and a failure, much like McGeer himself. Williams has prepared an interesting biography of a generous, visionary, colourful, bigoted, and impulsive individual; a Vancouverite who gave the city and the province a prominence it had never before enjoyed. The biographer has not, however, sustained the portrait of the man in the context in which McGeer lived and worked. In this respect, the volume is shallow and parochial; it fails to utilize and/or appreciate the widely available secondary material that exists on the inter-war years and, in so doing, falls far short of the potential that is promised by a combination of in-depth primary and secondary research. The result is a biography that is at once both entertaining and sciolistic.

University of British Columbia

ALAN F. J. ARTIBISE

³ *Ibid.*, 26-28.

Restraining the Economy: Social Credit Economic Policies for B.C. in the Eighties, by Robert C. Allen and Gideon Rosenbluth. Vancouver: New Star Books, 1986. Pp. 320.

If I had the power to make orders to politicians (a recurring academic fantasy), I should want to insist that all the members of the present Social Credit cabinet, and in particular the current Premier, read this book. As a form of penance I should extend my injunction to Bill Bennett and all his palace guard who have not found places in the new order. At the same time it would be useful to ensure that Michael Harcourt and other leading New Democrats be denied copies in order to avoid a premature leap to conclusions.

In the real world of B.C. politics an opposite course will likely prevail; no copy of the book will be so rudely placed as to disturb Mr. Vander Zalm's sight, but Mr. Harcourt will find at least one copy tucked under his pillow by eager NDP caucus researchers. This is too bad, because as an analysis of the shortcomings of government economic policy *Restraining the Economy* is excellent; as a guide for future policy it has weaknesses.

There are fifteen chapters, authored and co-authored by fifteen economists, all but four of them members of the UBC Department of Economics. All are associated with the B.C. Economic Policy Institute established in the wake of the controversial 1983 provincial budget, a budget which provoked mass demonstrations in the province as well as the Solidarity Coalition's threat of a general strike. It also spawned several like-minded research groups, highly critical of government policy and anxious to demonstrate its underlying unsoundness. The volume itself provides a small scholarly mystery by listing Professors Allen and Rosenbluth as the editors, although the preface and the conclusion are written by Professors Donaldson and Rosenbluth.

The conclusion provides an excellent summary of the different chapters which, I rejoice to say, have more in common than one generally finds in such anthologies. The authors set out to show that the various aspects of the Bennett government's restraint package were based on faulty economic premises and that the package prolonged the agony of the 1980s recession. They conclude that cuts in government spending and public employment have directly increased unemployment by causing business bankruptcies; that cuts in education spending will deprive the province of properly trained workers which in turn will adversely affect future productivity; that, for no good purpose, cuts in various social programmes increased human misery and injustice; and that in many cases immediate savings

from cuts in services will be far outweighed by the greater long-term costs that will result from the misery, injustice, and social dislocation caused by the restraint package. Moreover, they argue that profligate expenditures on various megaprojects, particularly those such as Northeast Coal which have turned out to be bad investments threatening the province's credit rating, show that the government was not committed to public expenditure restraint but instead was perversely determined to cut expenditures in areas which would be economically beneficial and spend in areas which had a dubious long-term value.

Sensibly, the book also focuses on the federal government's role in sustaining the recession. Professor Gideon Rosenbluth, an ancient and venerable figure in this set of radical young economists, argues that fiscal policies pursued by the federal government and the Bank of Canada which continue effective interest rates at a record high level are primarily responsible for difficulties experienced by Canadian business in the last several years. He believes that prosperity will follow a reduction of the effective rates by two or three percent and that the argument of the central bankers, faithfully adhered to by successive federal regimes, of keeping rates higher than those in the United States so that capital will not flee south, is specious. Instead, Rosenbluth is among those who argue that a tax on interest income earned by Canadian residents from foreign sources, combined with exchange controls "confined to the movement of large sums by large corporations," will be sufficient to halt any capital flight induced by lower effective interest rates. He does not deal with the possibility — some would say likelihood — of American retaliation following such controls which, in certain forms, would cause greater problems for the economy than high interest rates.

The main intellectual thrust of the volume is set out in the first chapter by Professor Robert Allen, grandly titled "The B.C. Economy: Past, Present, Future." Allen advances an intriguing analysis of B.C.'s economic situation. Central to his analysis is a distinction between extensive and intensive growth. According to Allen "*(e)xtensive growth* occurs when the total production of goods and services in the province increases, and the population grows in the same proportion. *I ntensive growth* occurs when the output *per person* increases." He shows that the conventional strategy of encouraging the export of natural resource products has led to extensive growth in B.C. but argues that it has not led to intensive growth. The reason is the existence of a national labour market in Canada which permits migrants to the province to appropriate any surplus from extensive growth as they obtain jobs and wages for themselves. In turn this keeps

real wages level for those already in the province. He points out that this is not the case for some sectors of the economy, notably construction, and when extensive growth is so rapid as to cause a significant labour shortage. Such a boom has not occurred in B.C. since World War I and, he argues, is not at all likely to occur in the future now that the allowable annual cut of timber cannot be increased further without destroying the resource. This latter fact, combined with a foreseeable shortage of world markets for minerals, in particular for copper and coal, spell the end of resource-led extensive growth.

Further, according to Allen, there is little reason to believe that the classic model of development from a resource-based economy to one more reliant on the export of secondary manufactures (say furniture) is possible for B.C. as it was for Canada as a whole. Despite efforts to add value to basic resource exports, the secondary manufacturing sector has shown little real growth in the province because, as in the Atlantic provinces, the domestic provincial market is too small and the larger markets of central Canada are too far away. Thus attempts to lure secondary manufacturing to the province by various forms of public subsidy (tax breaks, duty free and union free enterprise zones, and so on) will only serve to lower the welfare of most B.C. residents by raising taxes, or starving social services to provide the subsidy. At best the subsidy will simply engender additional jobs to be filled by more new migrants to the province.

From all this Allen concludes that the restraint programme, mega-projects as catalysts for sustained economic growth, and government subsidization of economic diversification are all doomed to failure. The whole approach identified with Social Credit, and applauded by some private sector unions and some sections of the NDP, needs to be abandoned. Instead, since the "B.C. real wage is determined in the national labour market" the fate of the provincial economy is in national hands and the fate of provincial workers is determined by national policies on employment levels, productivity, and income distribution. Provincial governments, it would seem, are reduced to the tasks of encouraging national initiatives and, I presume, helping, in certain cases, to administer them.

There are two major problems with this centralizing remedy. First, it runs counter to the last thirty years of our constitutional history and experience. The provinces have come to exercise more authority over the economy rather than less. Not even Pierre Trudeau could prevent the growth of the provincial state and the shifting balance of revenues and powers from the federal to provincial jurisdictions. This country cannot be governed as though it were a unitary state, and any attempt to do so

will provoke the same reaction in western Canada as was experienced in Quebec during and after the Quiet Revolution. Provincial governments associated with whatever ideological and political stance will necessarily see themselves, and be seen, as responsible for the economic well-being of the province. If the best economic advice were to leave Ottawa with the problems, that advice will be ignored, and rightly so, because it fails to adequately deal with the regional nature of both the economy and the polity. Inevitably provincial governments, including the British Columbia government, will pursue economic strategies which seek to strengthen regional economies at the expense of a national economy and, let it be said, in opposition to the strategies pursued by the other provinces — in particular the two central provinces. Any B.C. government that was seen to be neglecting the narrower interests of the province would not last very long — and a good thing, too, since an economic strategy controlled entirely by an Ottawa government invariably dominated by interests in Ontario and Quebec would not, in a democratic milieu, provide procurement policy, or transportation policy, or energy policy, or even fisheries policy, that would bring to B.C. residents advantages equivalent to those provided by an economic strategy which need not heed all the dictates of the federal authorities. A free market might, but there is no free market in Canada; rather there is a set of markets regulated in one form or another by provincial and federal authorities. In that circumstance it is not likely to be in the interests of those who live in western Canada to have all those regulations (or lack thereof) promulgated in Ottawa.

Second, without chasing the will 'o the wisp of secondary manufacturing, it still remains necessary for British Columbians to find external markets for B.C. products. Those products will certainly include resource products, particularly wood products, they may include manufactured goods and they ought to include the services that can be provided by a well-educated, highly skilled population. But whatever we produce we will need export markets. The fundamental reality is that every economy needs to produce goods and services necessary to meet the needs hierarchy of the individuals within it, and in a contemporary democratic society that needs hierarchy cannot be limited to food, clothing, and shelter. It must necessarily include transportation of various modes and entertainment of the widest variety including VCRs, cameras, stereo equipment, wilderness parks, magazines (the list is endless), along with access to scientific discovery and what are sometimes termed cultural experiences, which themselves range from religious freedom to live symphonies in small towns. Those goods and services which people value and which cannot be pro-

duced domestically must be imported, and those imports must be paid for by wealth generated from exports. The alternative of an autarkic economy founded in local self-sufficiencies is romantically attractive but requires a living standards self-sacrifice on the part of most individuals that is not politically feasible.

Moreover, there are real possibilities. California, the world's seventh largest economy, is not far away. It needs many of our products, from bottled water to hydro-electric power. This state of more than twenty-five million people, expected to grow dramatically over the next twenty years, abounds with opportunities for those who would feed its appetites. It is true that B.C. has not always pursued such markets with wisdom — certainly in terms of hydro-electric power there have been mistakes — yet even the chapter in this volume which is so scornful of energy policy in the province acknowledges the potential, if properly managed, for sales and profits in the California market.

This is a well-crafted book, worth the modest price, but it provides an incomplete analysis. The slightly self-serving remedy of an education policy designed to produce more productive workers who will, in turn, promote the sought-after intensive growth is not a sufficient remedy. Other factors of production need to be encouraged lest all the most productive of these new workers are lured to more lucrative pastures elsewhere. It is no doubt true that periods of extensive and intensive growth are not coterminous, but that does not prove that a link between these two concepts does not exist. It is that link that needs further analysis.

University of Victoria

TERRY MORLEY